The effect of inhomogeneous plastic deformation on the ductility and fracture behavior of age hardenable aluminum alloys

Aladar A. Csontos a,*, Edgar A. Starke b

a US Nuclear Regulatory Commission, Office of Nuclear Material Safety and Safeguards, Two White Flint North M/S T7F3, 11545 Rockville Pike, Rockville, MD 20852-2738, USA
b Department of Materials Science and Engineering, University of Virginia, 116 Engineer’s Way, P.O. Box 400745, Charlottesville, VA 22904–4745, USA

Received in final revised form 10 March 2004
Available online 5 January 2005

Abstract

The role of alloy composition, grain structure, precipitate microstructure, and precipitate dislocation interactions on the plastic deformation characteristics and the resulting fracture behavior of two isotropic Al–Li–Cu–X alloys designated AF/C-458 (1.8 w/o Li) and AF/C-489 (2.1 w/o Li) was examined. Inhomogeneous deformation due to strain localization from the shearing of the $\delta'$ (Al$_3$Li), $\theta'$ (Al$_2$Cu), and T$_1$ (Al$_2$CuLi) precipitates lead to fine and coarse planar slip for the AF/C-458 and AF/C-489 alloys, respectively. The intensity of this planar slip was predicted through slip intensity calculations using precipitate density measurements, dislocation particle interactions, and grain boundary misorientation-slip continuity statistics. The slip intensity predictions were corroborated through atomic force microscopy (AFM) measured slip height offsets on the polished surface of single aged and 2% plastically strained tensile samples. Our results suggest that the low ductility of AF/C-489 in comparison to AF/C-458 is primarily due to the much larger slip lengths, i.e. grain size, which increased the strain localization and stress concentrations on grain boundaries, thus promoting low-energy intergranular fracture.

© 2004 Published by Elsevier Ltd.

* Corresponding author.
The effect of inhomogeneous plastic deformation on the ductility and fracture behavior of age hardenable aluminum alloys

The original document contains color images.
1. Introduction

The aerospace industry is continuously driven to minimize the operational costs of air vehicles especially in these challenging economic times. One of the most effective methods to reduce costs is through weight reduction of the aerospace vehicles and in particular, the aircraft structural materials. For this reason, lightweight age-hardenable Al alloys are still the primary material of choice for aerospace applications. The development of commercial Al–Li–X alloys has been pursued over the last half century to further reduce the density of Al alloys with the added benefit of increasing the alloy’s modulus. In fact, the addition of 2 w/o Li reduces the density of Al by 6% and increases the modulus by 12%. Unfortunately, insufficient ductility and toughness, arising from the propensity for planar slip coupled with severe anisotropy, have hindered the widespread implementation of Al–Li–X alloys.

As a result, the US Air Force initiated a program in 1992 to develop an Al–Li alloy containing greater 2 w/o Li that possessed significantly reduced anisotropic properties compared to those currently available. Starke suggested that an intermediate recrystallization anneal be introduced between the rolling stages in order to reduce the sharp textures caused by rolling and thereby decrease the alloy’s anisotropy (Hopkins et al., 1996). This process successfully reduced anisotropy from the 20–25% normally observed in commercial Al–Li–Cu–X alloys to less than 10%. The alloy developed on this Air Force program was designated AF/C-489 with a nominal composition of Al–2.7Cu–2.1Li–0.6 Zn–0.3Mn–0.3Mg–0.05Zr (w/o) (Jata et al., 1996). Unfortunately, the elongation at peak strength was lower than the acceptable level of 5% for aerospace applications. As a result of this research, the Air Force and Alcoa developed a derivative of AF/C-489 designated AF/C-458 with the nominal composition of Al–2.7Cu–1.8Li–0.6Zn–0.3Mn–0.3Mg–0.09Zr (w/o). This AF/C-458 variant possessed much higher elongations, more than double the acceptable limit, while also maintaining similar isotropic mechanical properties. The main goal of the investigation described in this paper was to identify the mechanisms associated with the large difference in ductility. The conventional thought at the time was that the higher Li content in the AF/C-489 alloy increased the volume fraction of the shearable $\delta'$ (Al$_3$Li) precipitates which resulted in the lower ductility of AF/C-489 as compared to the AF/C-458 alloy.

2. Background

The overall slip and fracture behavior of age-hardenable Al alloys depend greatly on the microstructure and in particular the deformation characteristics of the
strengthening precipitates in the alloy (Martin, 1979). Gliding dislocations can either shear or bypass (loop) the strengthening precipitates during plastic deformation, which leads to inhomogeneous planar slip or homogeneous wavy glide, respectively. Shearable, coherent, and ordered precipitates promote planar slip whereas non-shearable, incoherent, and bypassed precipitates encourage wavy glide (Hornbogen, 1975). Planar slip is considered inhomogeneous plastic deformation that is concentrated on few slip systems as a result of the local work softening on the operative slip plane. This work softening is due to the reduced cross-section of the sheared precipitates, which decreases the strengthening effectiveness on that specific slip plane. Planar slip continues until an obstacle such as a high-angle grain boundary inhibits further dislocation movement and activates adjacent slip systems to accommodate the applied stress. This localized strain can have a deleterious affect on the ductility and fracture behavior of an alloy by promoting premature intergranular failure (Lutjering and Weissmann, 1970; Gregson and Flower, 1985). Wavy glide is considered homogeneous deformation that operates on many slip systems simultaneously and is typically associated with high stacking-fault energy metals and alloys such as pure Al and solid-solution strengthened Al alloys. Even though precipitation hardened Al alloys have relatively high stacking-fault energies, the overall slip and fracture behavior depends more on the precipitate microstructure and grain structure of the alloy.

The precipitate microstructure of age-hardenable Al–Li–Cu–X alloys may contain $\delta'$, $\theta''/\theta'$ (Al$_2$Cu), and T$_1$ (Al$_2$CuLi) particles depending on composition, pre-age thermomechanical processes, and subsequent heat treatment practices. The $\delta'$ precipitates maintain a cube–cube crystallographic relationship with the $\alpha$-Al matrix while the $\theta''/\theta'$ and T$_1$ particles precipitate on matrix {0 0 1} and {1 1 1} habit planes, respectively. The Li contents for both AF/C-458 and AF/C-489 alloys are sufficient to precipitate out the spherical, shearable, and coherent $\delta'$ particles (Sanders and Starke, 1982). Gable et al. (2001) showed that plastic deformation prior to artificial aging enhanced the competitive precipitation kinetics of the T$_1$ precipitate, the more potent strengthener, at the expense of weaker $\theta''/\theta'$ for AF/C-458. Understanding this precipitation behavior is important because previous investigations (Blankenship and Starke, 1992, 1993; Nie et al., 1996; Huang and Ardell, 1988) treated T$_1$ as hard non-shearable particles as compared to the weaker shearable $\theta''/\theta'$ particles. However, coarse planar slip has long been associated with these Al–Li–Cu–X alloys that contain both the shearable $\delta'$ and the previously assumed unshearable T$_1$ particles. Howe et al. (1988) and Csontos and Starke (2000), using high-resolution TEM, showed that T$_1$ could be sheared during deformation when present in Al–Li–Cu–X alloys.

Low ductility resulting from low energy intergranular fracture in high-purity Al–Li alloys has been previously associated with strain localization in the matrix (Sanders and Starke, 1982; Furukawa et al., 1985; Cassada et al., 1986). The strain localization was attributed to the shearing of $\delta'$ particles resulting in coarse planar slip and the formation of intense shear bands. These intense shear bands impinged on grain boundaries and caused premature intergranular fracture and low ductility. Therefore, minimizing strain localization during deformation is critical to increasing
the ductility and improving the fracture behavior of Al–Li–Cu–X alloys. The most effective method of reducing strain localization is to minimize the slip length or the distance between concurrent non-sheared events on the active slip plane. The slip length is a key microstructural parameter used in many fracture models to quantify the degree of strain localization (Duva et al., 1988; Blankenship et al., 1993; Sugamata et al., 1993; Jata and Starke, 1986; Roven, 1992; Hornbogen, 1975). For microstructures containing both shearable and non-shearable precipitates, the slip length can be considered the interparticle spacings between the non-shearable precipitates. The role played by non-shearable particles in homogenizing deformation has been established. Previous work on age-hardenable Al alloys (Walsh et al., 1989; Jata and Vasudevan, 1998; Cassada et al., 1986; Blankenship and Starke, 1993) proved that the development of a matrix microstructure containing non-shearable features could improve the ductility of age hardenable Al alloys. For microstructures containing only shearable precipitates, the slip length can be considered the grain size as sub-grain boundaries have been found to be weak obstacles to dislocation motion (Gregson and Flower, 1985; Kuo and Starke, 1985; Miura and Saeki, 1977, 1978, 1980). Investigations by Terlinde and Luetjering (1982), Gysler et al. (1976) and Mendiratta et al. (1976) have shown that grain size varies inversely to the true fracture strain \( L^{-1} \sim \epsilon_f \) for alloys with coherent, ordered, and shearable particles similar to \( \delta' \) in Al–Li–X alloys.

3. Experimental procedures

The Air Force Research Laboratory and Alcoa furnished both the 1.27 cm thick AF/C-489 and the 1.9 cm thick AF/C-458 alloys that were used for these investigations. Both alloy ingots were direct chill cast, stress relieved, homogenized, hot rolled, annealed at 540 °C for 4 h, and then slow cooled before being hot rolled again. This was followed by a solution anneal at 540 °C for 1 h and an immediate water quench followed by a 6% pre-age stretch to promote the T1 precipitation and naturally aged at room temperature. This T36 temper serves as the “as-received” material from which all aging studies were carried out. For this paper, only data for the longitudinal direction of the alloys is being reported. All aging studies were conducted in forced air furnaces with temperature fluctuations less than ±2 °C followed by immediate water quenching. Tensile samples were machined into dog-bone tensile bars conforming to ASTM E8-93 substandard size regulations and tested utilizing the screw driven Sintech 10/GL MTS system with a crosshead velocity of 3 mm per minute according to ASTM E8 standards. The real-time elongation of each specimen was observed through a digital display via a computer interface with a MTS extensometer across an initial gauge of 25.0 mm.

The grain structure and microstructural aspects were characterized via optical metallography, scanning electron microscopy (SEM), transmission electron microscopy (TEM), differential scanning calorimetry (DSC), orientation imaging microscopy (OIM), and atomic force microscopy (AFM). Optical microscopy samples were mounted in Buehler’s Conductomet, metallographically ground and polished.
using 0.05 µm colloidal silica, and finally etched with Keller’s agent. TEM samples were cut either from the grip section on additional similarly aged material for micro-structural analysis while samples cut from the gauge section were utilized for slip behavior examinations. The cut wafers were mechanically thinned to ~150 µm thick, punched into 3 mm disks, and electropolished in a Tenupol twinjet electro polisher at 11 V for the AF/C-458 alloy and 8 V for the AF/C-489 alloy at a flow rate of 3 and photosensitivity of 9. A 7:2 methanol: nitric acid solution chilled to −25 °C was used as the electrolyte.

Digital SEM fractographs were acquired through the use of a DSM982 Gemini field emission SEM operating at 10 kV equipped with dual secondary backscatter electron detectors. OIM data acquisition was performed on a Leo 1550 SEM equipped with a Schottky field-emission gun operating at 20 kV and collected using the OIM DC software package provided by TSL, Inc. To obtain the OIM data, the specimens were tilted 70° toward the camera used to acquire the electron backscatter diffraction patterns (EBSD). Conventional TEM was accomplished using a JEOL 2000FX TEM at 200 kV while high resolution TEM was completed with the JEOL 4000 HREM operating at 400 kV. Weak-beam dark-field (WBDF), centered dark-field (CDF), and bright-field (BF) TEM techniques were used to identify the various precipitate types, dimensions, and distribution. Stereological quantification of the spherical δ′, T1 plates, and δ′/θ′ plate shaped precipitates in thin TEM foils was completed using a statistical analysis to overcome thin foil effects which underestimates the diameters and volume fractions of the particles from two-dimensional TEM micrographs. Foil thickness was determined by the convergent-beam method and the dislocation particle interactions were observed using the WBDF technique. AFM samples were polished to 0.05 µm using colloidal silica and then plastically strained to 2% at a strain rate of 1 mm per minute. These polished and strained tensile bars were then examined utilizing a Digital Instruments Dimension 3100 Nanoscope III AFM with 10 nm resolution carbon nanotube tips in the intermittent contact mode.

4. Results and discussion

4.1. As-received T36 grain and sub-grain structure

The grain and sub-grain structures of both as-received T36 unrecrystallized AF/C-458 and AF/C-489 plates have been detailed elsewhere (Csontos and Starke, 2000, in press). Table 1 summarizes these results for both as-received unrecrystallized T36 plates and indicates that both have similar sub-grain structures with very different grain structures. The number of grains counted in an optical micrograph over a 500 mm circumference was up to 3 times greater in AF/C-458 than AF/C-489. This indicates that the AF/C-489 plate contained a much larger average grain size in all three planes, i.e. rolling (LT), longitudinal (LS), and short transverse (ST), as compared to AF/C-458. AF/C-458 grains also possessed an aspect ratio roughly twice that of AF/C-489, which indicates a more pancaked grain structure for AF/C-458.
Conversely, the substructure of both alloys was relatively similar with sub-grain sizes on the order of 5–10 μm in diameter.

4.2. Microstructure, precipitation response, and mechanical properties

The precipitation response for both alloys was determined through DSC and TEM studies from the T36 as-received temper. We found that the $\theta'$ and $T_1$ precipitation onset temperatures were between 90–95 and 120–125 °C, respectively, for both alloys. We were then able to determine the effect of $T_1$ aging kinetics on the strength of various single aged routes above 120 °C through Rockwell hardness measurements. These results indicate that the 150 °C single age practice provides a good combination of both high matrix $T_1$ nucleation and growth rates, i.e. near the nose of the time–temperature-transformation curve. Next, we obtained the baseline 150 °C tensile data as a function of aging time for the AF/C-458 longitudinal direction as seen in Fig. 1. Note that the best combination of strength to ductility was in the slightly underaged condition at 150 °C for 24 h and that the data did not change much between 24 h and 2 weeks showing that significant overaging did not occur for up to 2 weeks at 150 °C. This single age 150 °C for 24 h was used for our baseline mechanical properties for both alloys because temperatures greater than 150 °C have been shown to precipitate the deleterious $T_2$ (Al$_6$Cu(LiMg)$_3$) embrittling phase (Lewis et al., 1987) and coarse grain boundary $T_1$ with corresponding precipitate free zones (Roven, 1992) in age-hardenable Al–Li–Cu–X alloys.

The precipitate microstructure of the baseline 150 °C 24 h single age for alloys AF/C-458 and AF/C-489 are shown in Figs. 2 and 3, respectively. The BF and CDF TEM micrographs clearly show $T_1$ and $\delta'$ as the major strengthening precipitates in both alloys with some $\theta'$ engloved with $\delta'$ for this 150 °C 24 h single age condition. Matrix $T_1$ precipitation is high due to the introduction of matrix dislocations arising from the 6% pre-age stretch in both alloys with some fine grain boundary $T_1$ particles. Although these fine grain boundary $T_1$ variants were found in both alloys, deleterious coarse grain boundary $\delta$ (AlLi), $\theta$ (Al$_2$Cu), $T_2$, $T_B$ (Al$_7$Cu$_4$Li), R (Al$_6$CuLi$_3$), and I (Al$_6$CuLi$_3$) (Hardy and Silcock, 1959) with their associated precipitate free zones were not found in either alloy for this 150 °C 24 h age. Nevertheless, minimizing the observed grain boundary $T_1$ precipitation is important in order to determine whether the grain boundary $T_1$ contributed to the low ductility in the AF/C-489 alloy. Since grain and sub-grain boundary $T_1$ were observed in both 150 °C 24 h aged
Fig. 1. Longitudinal tensile properties as a function of aging at 150 °C.

Fig. 2. AF/C-458 150 °C 24 h micrographs (a) CDF image showing \( \delta' \) and \( \theta'/\theta'' \) engulfed with \( \delta' \), \( b = [0 1 1]_g \), \( g = (1 0 0)_x \). (b) BF indicating \( \theta'/\theta'' \) and matrix and grain boundary puckering \( T_1 \), \( b = [1 1 0]_x \), \( g = 1/2(1 1 1)_z \).

(c) CDF micrograph showing matrix and grain boundary puckering \( T_1 \), \( b = [1 1 0]_g \), \( g = 1/2(1 1 1)_z \).

Fig. 3. AF/C-489 150 °C 24 h micrographs (a) CDF image showing \( \delta' \) and \( \theta'/\theta'' \) engulfed with \( \delta' \), \( b = [0 1 1]_g \), \( g = (1 0 0)_x \). (b) BF indicating \( \theta'/\theta'' \) and matrix and grain boundary puckering \( T_1 \), \( b = [1 1 0]_x \), \( g = 1/2(1 1 1)_z \).

(c) CDF micrograph showing matrix and grain boundary puckering \( T_1 \), \( b = [1 1 0]_g \), \( g = 1/2(1 1 1)_z \).
alloys, duplex aging studies were conducted in an effort to minimize grain and sub-grain boundary $T_1$ and maximize matrix $T_1$ precipitation.

A pre-age stretch coupled with a low/high temperature duplex aging schedule has been shown to substantially increase the ductility and fracture toughness of various Al–Li alloys (Ashton et al., 1986; Ahrens and Starke, 1989; Blankenship and Starke, 1992, 1994). The experimentally determined $T_1$ solvus boundary was measured to be between 120 and 125 °C for both alloys. The low temperature age above 120 °C was designed to maximize the driving force for matrix $T_1$ nucleation followed by a higher temperature age to promote subsequent matrix $T_1$ growth. Other duplex aging studies with low temperature agings between 100 and 120 °C were designed to precipitate a very fine dispersion of $\theta'$ to either tie up the Cu solute in the matrix or provide possible nucleation sites for matrix $T_1$ precipitation on the $\theta'$ particles (Noble and Thompson, 1972) during subsequent higher temperature aging. By either method, the design of these aging routes was to increase the matrix $T_1$ precipitation kinetics, thus, minimizing the availability of solute to form the grain boundary precipitates. Furthermore, these low/high aging studies were also designed to increase the matrix $T_1$ number density, thereby, reducing the $T_1$ interparticle spacing, which would act to decrease the effective slip length, if $T_1$ is unshearable, and hopefully promote greater ductility.

The overall results of the duplex aging practices in comparison to the 150 °C 24 h age for both AF/C-458 and AF/C-489 alloys are shown in Tables 2 and 3 for the longitudinal and long transverse directions, respectively. These results indicate that no significant changes occurred to the tensile properties of duplex aged AF/C-458, suggesting a large processing window. Significant improvements were made though by employing the duplex aging schedules for AF/C-489 as the ductility increased by as much as 65% with a decrease of only 4% and 2% for the longitudinal yield and

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aging standard</th>
<th>YS (MPa)</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>UTS (MPa)</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>Elongation (%)</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>150 °C 24 h</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-458</td>
<td>504.3</td>
<td>13.6</td>
<td>537.0</td>
<td>13.6</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-489</td>
<td>512.9</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>554.8</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100 °C 24 h and 150 °C 24 h</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-458</td>
<td>500.8</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>541.4</td>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-489</td>
<td>474.4</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>533.1</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>120 °C 18 h and 150 °C 24 h</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-458</td>
<td>500.4</td>
<td>13.7</td>
<td>543.4</td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-489</td>
<td>491.7</td>
<td>17.9</td>
<td>544.8</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>130 °C 24 h and 150 °C 23 h</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-458</td>
<td>495.3</td>
<td>9.8</td>
<td>539.0</td>
<td>17.3</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-489</td>
<td>495.7</td>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>548.7</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ultimate tensile strengths, respectively. This result was also observed for the long transverse direction with a 72% increase in ductility with a decrease of only 8% and 1% for the yield and ultimate tensile strengths, respectively. Nevertheless, we found that all of our investigated single and double aged samples contained fine grain boundary T₁ with no coarse grain boundary T₁, T₂, or precipitate free zones. Hence, we determined that the fine grain boundary T₁ was not the primary cause for the low ductility of AF/C-489.

Table 3
Long transverse tensile mechanical properties of T86 single and double aged AF/C-458 and AF/C-489

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aging standard</th>
<th>YS (MPa)</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>UTS (MPa)</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>Elongation (%)</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>150 °C 24 h</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-458</td>
<td>510.5</td>
<td>19.6</td>
<td>538.2</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>10.4</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-489</td>
<td>468.7</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>529.9</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100 °C 24 h and 150 °C 24 h</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-458</td>
<td>501.1</td>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>539.5</td>
<td>14.8</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-489</td>
<td>414.8</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>508.1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>120 °C 18 h and 150 °C 24 h</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-458</td>
<td>502.2</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>551.5</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-489</td>
<td>430.0</td>
<td>13.8</td>
<td>524.0</td>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>130 °C 24 h and 150 °C 23 h</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-458</td>
<td>515.4</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>551.5</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>10.7</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-489</td>
<td>435.4</td>
<td>20.8</td>
<td>526.7</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4
Quantitative T₁ precipitate measurements and standard deviations for single and duplex aged AF/C-458 and AF/C-489 alloys corresponding to the mechanical properties in Tables 2 and 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alloy/aging practice</th>
<th>T₁ vol%</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>T₁ # density #/(µm⁻³)</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>T₁ mean diameter (nm)</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>AF/C-458</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150 °C 24 h</td>
<td>3.0%</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>7650</td>
<td>696.5</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100 °C 24 h</td>
<td>3.0%</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>9380</td>
<td>739.8</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150 °C 24 h</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>10,970</td>
<td>703.0</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>120 °C 18 h</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
<td>0.07</td>
<td>11,870</td>
<td>298.4</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>AF/C-489</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150 °C 24 h</td>
<td>3.0%</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>7620</td>
<td>890.9</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100 °C 24 h</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>5550</td>
<td>363.9</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150 °C 24 h</td>
<td>1.8%</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>7710</td>
<td>146.1</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>120 °C 48 h</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150 °C 22 h</td>
<td>1.8%</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>7660</td>
<td>825.6</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The mechanical response of both alloys to the duplex aging treatments can be related to their corresponding precipitate microstructure. Quantitative TEM results in Tables 4–6 demonstrate that no significant changes in $\theta'$, $T_1$, or $\delta'$ volume fractions were found for the single and duplex aged AF/C-458 alloy although the number density increased and precipitate diameters decreased with the double age. The

Table 5
Quantitative $\theta'$ precipitate measurements and standard deviations for single and duplex aged AF/C-458 and AF/C-489 alloys corresponding to the mechanical properties in Tables 2 and 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alloy/aging practice</th>
<th>$\theta'$ vol%</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>$\theta'$ # density #/((\mu m^{-3}))</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>$\theta'$ mean diameter (nm)</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-458</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150 °C 24 h</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>1440</td>
<td>237.5</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100 °C 24 h</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>10,330</td>
<td>24.5</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>120 °C 18 h</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>11,220</td>
<td>631.3</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>130 °C 24 h</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>10,180</td>
<td>495.4</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-489</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150 °C 24 h</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>4610</td>
<td>453.6</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100 °C 24 h</td>
<td>1.7%</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>75,860</td>
<td>3616.9</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>120 °C 48 h</td>
<td>1.1%</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>28,640</td>
<td>3215.6</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>130 °C 24 h</td>
<td>1.1%</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>29,500</td>
<td>2544.3</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6
Quantitative $\delta'$ precipitate measurements and standard deviations for single and duplex aged AF/C-458 and AF/C-489 alloys corresponding to the mechanical properties in Tables 2 and 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alloy/aging practice</th>
<th>$\delta'$ vol%</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>$\delta'$ mean diameter (nm)</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-458</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150 °C 24 h</td>
<td>12.6%</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>0.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100 °C 24 h</td>
<td>12.6%</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>0.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150 °C 24 h</td>
<td>12.5%</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>15.6</td>
<td>0.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>130 °C 24 h</td>
<td>12.7%</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-489</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150 °C 24 h</td>
<td>17.3%</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>0.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100 °C 24 h</td>
<td>19.2%</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>15.1</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>150 °C 24 h</td>
<td>18.5%</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>15.7</td>
<td>0.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>130 °C 24 h</td>
<td>18.3%</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>0.13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
precipitation response between single and duplex aged AF/C-489, on the other hand, was significantly different. The duplex age competitively precipitated much more \( \theta' \) at the expense of \( T_1 \) with relatively similar \( \delta' \) volume fractions. The shearable \( \delta' \) volume fraction was found to be on average \( \sim 5-6.5\% \) greater in the T86 aged AF/C-489 alloy as compared to similarly aged AF/C-458 alloys. From this data, the increased ductility and slightly lower yield strengths of the duplex aged AF/C-489 alloy is attributed to the extensive precipitate microstructure refinement, i.e. reduced interparticle spacings and the competitive precipitation of a much greater number density of the weaker \( \theta' \) plates at the expense of stronger \( T_1 \) particles with relatively similar \( \delta' \) volume fractions.

4.3. Slip and fracture behavior analysis

Matrix \( T_1 \) precipitates were previously treated as unshearable particles that strengthen via the Orowan bypassing mechanism. However, our TEM and HREM micrographs in Figs. 4 and 5 conclusively show that \( T_1 \) shears in both T86 alloys aged at 150 \( ^\circ \)C 24 h resulting in shear band formation. TEM investigations for all aging practices showed the formation of these intense shear bands indicating that matrix \( T_1 \) sheared in all of the duplex aged conditions as well. TEM and OIM data showed that the resultant intense shear bands in all aged alloys easily traversed low-angle sub-grain boundaries while high-angle grain boundaries with greater than 11\( ^\circ \) misorientation for T86 AF/C-458 and 11–18\( ^\circ \) misorientation for T86 AF/C-489 arrested slip. The optical microscopy images in Figs. 6 and 7 reveal the macroscopic nature of planar slip resulting from the shearing of \( \delta' \), \( \theta' \), and \( T_1 \) precipitates in both 2\% plastically strained 150 \( ^\circ \)C 24 h aged alloys. The first set of micrographs in Fig. 6 was acquired from aged and 2\% plastically strained tensile bars that were then polished and etched with Keller’s agent to bring out the slip character. To discount the preferential effects of etching that could skew the results, the optical samples in Fig. 7 were first aged then polished down with colloidal silica with no etching and finally stretched to 2\% plastic strain. From these micrographs, we can clearly see a qualitative difference in the planar slip intensities between the alloys. The AF/C-489 micrographs clearly show a much greater amount of planar slip as compared to the AF/C-458 alloy, which could partially explain the lower ductility of AF/C-489.

The fracture behavior of the single and duplex aged alloys is shown in the SEM fractographs in Fig. 8. The fractographs show the differences in fracture behavior between the AF/C-458 and AF/C-489 alloys. The fracture behavior for all single and duplex aged AF/C-458 longitudinal tensile samples remained fairly consistent with the aforementioned mechanical and precipitation behavior. Transgranular, slanted 45\( ^\circ \) fracture paths were typical for AF/C-458 and the fracture surfaces indicate a large amount of high-energy transgranular shearing, grain boundary sliding, dimpled rupture, and microvoid coalescence (MVC) with a minimum of intergranular fracture. In contrast to AF/C-458, the AF/C-489 single aged 150 \( ^\circ \)C 24 h fracture paths were predominately flat with large areas of coarse intergranular fracture sites evident. These intergranular fracture sites also suggested that coarse planar slip promoted the low-energy intergranular fracture because slip offsets ~200 nm in height.
Fig. 4. AF/C-458 150 °C 24 h 2% plastic strained micrographs (a) CDF image showing sheared δ’ (arrows), \( b = [1 1 0] \), \( g = (1 0 0) \), (b) CDF indicating sheared \( T_1 \), \( b = [1 1 0] \), \( g = \frac{1}{2} (1 1 1) \), (c) HREM micrograph showing sheared \( T_1 \), \( b = [1 1 0] \), (d) BF image showing shear bands along \( (1 1 1) \) trace, \( b = [1 1 0] \).

Fig. 5. AF/C-489 150 °C 24 h 2% plastic strained micrographs (a) CDF image showing sheared δ’ (arrows), \( b = [1 1 0] \), \( g = (1 0 0) \), (b) WBDF indicating sheared and bowed \( T_1 \), \( b = [1 1 0] \), \( g = \frac{1}{2} (1 1 1) \), (c) HREM micrograph showing sheared \( T_1 \), \( b = [1 1 0] \), (d) BF image showing shear bands along \( (1 1 1) \) trace, \( b = [1 1 0] \).
were evident on the fracture surface. This fracture behavior is not found in any of the duplex aged tensile samples which fractured close to 45° indicating more high energy transgranular shearing, which is favorable for high ductility. However, some regions of low-energy intergranular fractured grains were still evident along with smaller areas of transgranular shearing and MVC.

To further clarify the effect of planar slip on fracture behavior, the quantitative planar slip intensities were measured for both alloys in the single aged 150 °C 24 h condition and compared to the previous qualitative optical microscopy results. An AFM with a 10 nm vertical resolution was employed to accurately measure the planar slip offsets observed on the surface of aged, polished, and 2% plastically strained AF/C-458 and AF/C-489 samples with no etch. The results of this investigation are shown in Figs. 9 and 10. Fig. 9 demonstrates the method used to measure the slip offsets as statistically represented in Fig. 10 as well as the three-dimensional representation of the slip offsets for both T86 alloys. This technique measures the
intensity of the planar slip as the height of the slip offset associated with dislocations that have egressed to the surface of the polished flat sample during the 2% plastic strain. These three-dimensional AFM images coupled with the measured slip offset statistical data in Fig. 10 clearly demonstrate the strong planar slip characteristics and much larger slip offsets in AF/C-489 versus AF/C-458. These measurements corroborate the previous observations made in Figs. 6 and 7, which illustrate the much higher planar slip intensities for AF/C-489 as compared to AF/C-458.

4.4. Strain localization quantification

To quantify the amount of strain localization in both alloys and relate it to their differences in ductility, a methodology was developed to calculate the amount of planar slip impinging at high-angle grain boundaries. These strain localization results were then correlated to our previous AFM microscopy experiment to corroborate the calculations. From this data, we were able to quantitatively describe this stress concentration at the tip of a dislocation pile-up impinging upon a deformation barrier as the shear stress concentration, \( \tau_c \), which is \( N \) (number of dislocations) times the resolved shear stress, \( \tau_{rss} \):

\[
\tau_c = N \tau_{rss}. \tag{1}
\]

Shearing of a strong precipitate like T1 or nucleating a crack at a grain boundary can then proceed when the localized shear stress intensities exceed a critical shear stress, \( \tau^* \). The slip intensity could then be quantified as the number of dislocations expected in a pileup at a high-angle grain boundary, which is related to the order hardening and shearing characteristics of the \( \delta' \) precipitates and the slip length of the alloy through the relationship (Duva et al., 1988):
where \( N \) is the number of dislocations in a pileup, \( f_v = \delta' \) volume fraction, \( r_p = \delta' \) radius, \( L \), the slip length, \( C_p = (\gamma^{3/2}/2b)(3/\pi Gb^2)^{1/2} \) where \( \gamma \) is the antiphase domain boundary energy of \( \delta' \), \( b \) the Burgers vector and \( G \) the shear modulus of the matrix, and \( C_B = G/(\pi(1 - \nu)) \) where \( \nu \) is Poisson’s ratio.

In an effort to calculate the amount of strain localization impinging on a typical grain boundary, only the average slip length for both alloys was needed. Previous TEM micrographs showed that \( T_1 \) sheared and sub-grain boundaries did not arrest slip, which suggests that the average \( T_1 \) interparticle spacing or sub-grain size could not be considered the slip length for these alloys. We also showed that grain boundaries with misorientation angles equal to or greater than 11\(^\circ\) and 11–18\(^\circ\) for AF/C-458 and AF/C-489, respectively, arrested slip. Consequently, OIM investigations from the LS and ST planes were conducted to measure the slip length, i.e. the average distance between concurrent grain boundaries with 11\(^\circ\) and 11–18\(^\circ\) misorientations. This procedure is schematically shown in Figs. 10–12 where the distance was
measured at a 45° angle, i.e. corner to corner, so as to discount for any skewing of the data due to the elongated grain structure. The OIM simulated micrographs qualitatively demonstrate the large slip length differences between the AF/C-458 and AF/C-489 alloys by denoting the 11° and 18° misoriented grain boundaries in yellow and black, respectively. The misorientation profiles and inverse pole figure maps clearly show the much larger slip lengths measured for the AF/C-489 alloy as compared to the finer grained AF/C-458 alloy. In fact, the measured slip lengths for the AF/C-489 alloy were on average ~3 times greater than similarly examined planes and misorientations of the AF/C-458 alloy (see Fig. 12).

Table 7 shows the results of these planar slip intensity calculations with the OIM measured slip lengths. The calculations conclusively show that planar slip intensities are on average 3–3.5 times greater in the AF/C-489 alloy when compared to the AF/C-458 alloy for all measured slip lengths with misorientations greater than 5°, 11°, and 18° except for the sub-grains. The calculations for the sub-grains in both alloys were conducted so as to exclusively distinguish the role that $\delta'$ plays in strain localization and ductility, i.e. keeping the slip length constant at 5 μm which is approximately the average sub-grain size for both unrecrystallized alloys. These calculations indicate that the increased $\delta'$ volume fraction in the AF/C-489 alloy only contributed approximately 4 more dislocations to the pileup when compared to the AF/C-458 alloy. Hence, the Duva model shows that the number of dislocations in a pileup varies directly with slip length and to a lesser extent on the square root of $\delta'$ volume fraction for this alloy, i.e. the higher $\delta'$ volume fraction in the T86 AF/C-489 alloy.
Fig. 11. OIM determined grain boundary misorientation profiles of the LS plane from the as-received T36 AF/C-458 alloy.
Fig. 12. OIM determined grain boundary misorientation profiles of the LS plane from the as-received T36 AF/C-489 alloy.
increases the slip intensity by approximately 15% while the difference in slip length increases the intensity by as much as ~350%. This ~15% can also be negated by reducing the slip length of AF/C-489 through grain refinement even further than found in AF/C-458. Thus, the Duva model and AFM results suggests that the major cause for the greater planar slip intensities and lower ductility in AF/C-489 is due to the ~3 times greater average slip lengths as compared to the finer grained AF/C-458 alloy.

Nevertheless, the Duva model was unable to predict the increased ductility of the AF/C-489 alloy by duplex aging because it was unable to predict the effect that microstructural refinement and the variation in the competitive precipitation have on slip intensity when all of the precipitates shear during plastic deformation, i.e. when the slip length is greater than the average interparticle spacing of shearable precipitates. The development of a modified Duva equation that accounts for the microstructure when all of the precipitates shear (and for different types of precipitates) during plastic deformation is underway. We attribute the increased ductility and slightly lower yield strengths of the duplex aged AF/C-489 alloy to the substantial refinement in the precipitate microstructure (interparticle spacings) and the competitive precipitation of a high number density of the weaker \( \theta' \) plates at the expense of stronger \( \mathrm{T}_1 \) particles with relatively similar \( \delta' \) volume fractions.

By going through the calculations for both alloys, the Duva model predicts that AF/C-489 experienced between 2 and 4 times greater slip concentrations than

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subgrains</th>
<th>&gt;5° misorientation</th>
<th>&gt;11° misorientation</th>
<th>&gt;18° misorientation</th>
<th>AFM slip height (nm)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AF/C-458 alloy aged 150 °C 24 h</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>delta' average radius (nm)</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>7.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( \delta' ) volume fraction</td>
<td>0.126</td>
<td>0.126</td>
<td>0.126</td>
<td>0.126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( C_p/C_B ) (m(^{-1.5}))</td>
<td>3.35E+11</td>
<td>3.35E+11</td>
<td>3.35E+11</td>
<td>3.35E+11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SL plane</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slip length (( \mu m ))</td>
<td>~5.0</td>
<td>13.26</td>
<td>21.03</td>
<td>25.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard deviation</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td>2.66</td>
<td>3.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># of dislocations (N)</td>
<td>52.8</td>
<td>147.2</td>
<td>235.7</td>
<td>278.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slip height Nb (nm)</td>
<td>15.1</td>
<td>42.1</td>
<td>67.4</td>
<td>79.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| AF/C-489 alloy aged 150 °C 24 h | | | | |
| \( \delta' \) average radius (nm) | 8.0 | 8.0 | 8.0 | 8.0 | – |
| \( \delta' \) volume fraction | 0.173 | 0.173 | 0.173 | 0.173 | – |
| \( C_p/C_B \) (m\(^{-1.5}\)) | 3.35E+11 | 3.35E+11 | 3.35E+11 | 3.35E+11 | – |
| **SL plane** | | | | |
| Slip length (\( \mu m \)) | ~5.0 | 42.55 | 69.93 | 85.69 | – |
| Standard deviation | – | 11.26 | 18.23 | 8.35 | – |
| # of dislocations (N) | 62.0 | 527.4 | 866.7 | 1062.1 | – |
| Slip height Nb (nm) | 17.7 | 150.8 | 247.9 | 303.8 | <195.8 |
AF/C-458. The AFM technique confirmed these predictions by showing remarkably similar results and that the planar slip offsets on the surface of polished and stretched AF/C-489 samples were more than double that found for the AF/C-458 alloy. The much larger slip lengths for the AF/C-489 alloy greatly increased the intensity of planar slip impinging upon a grain boundary, thereby, promoting low-energy intergranular fracture and low ductility. Therefore, our results suggest the low ductility of the AF/C-489 alloy is not intrinsically related to the higher (2.05 wt%) Li content, but due primarily to the much larger slip lengths as represented by the ~3 times larger grain size as compared to the AF/C-458 alloy.

5. Conclusions

1. In summary, our results indicate that the low ductility of AF/C-489 in comparison to AF/C-458 is primarily due to the ~3 times greater slip length and to a much lesser extent on the increased volume fraction of shearable δ'. The much larger slip lengths greatly increased the intensity of planar slip impinging upon a grain boundary. Slip intensity modeling suggests AF/C-489 (ε_f = 4.9%) experiences ~2–4 times greater stress concentrations at the grain boundary as compared to AF/C-458 (ε_f = 10.3%). This results in earlier fracture and lower ductility for AF/C-489. Therefore, our results suggest the low ductility of AF/C-489 is not intrinsically related to the higher 0.3 w/o Li, but primarily due to the larger slip lengths associated with the larger grain size.

2. Duplex aging treatments for the AF/C-489 alloy resulted in significant increases in ductility by as much as 65% with only a small decrease of 4% and less than 2% for the yield and ultimate tensile strengths, respectively. The increased ductility and slightly lower yield strengths of the duplex aged AF/C-489 alloy is attributed to the large precipitate microstructure refinement, i.e. reduced interparticle spacings, and the competitive precipitation of a high number density of the weaker δ' plates at the expense of stronger T_1 particles with relatively similar δ' volume fractions.

3. In contrast, no significant strength and ductility improvements were found through duplex aging practices for the AF/C-458 alloy due to the similar precipitation behaviors for the single and duplex ages.

4. Both δ' and T_1 were found to shear which lead to the formation of intense shear bands indicating strain localization in all single and duplex aged samples.

5. Grain boundary T_1 was found in all aged conditions for this study, but was not considered to be the major cause for the lower ductility of AF/C-489.

6. Slip easily traversed low-angle sub-grain boundaries while slip was arrested by high-angle grain boundaries greater than or equal to 11° for AF/C-458 and between 11° and 18° for AF/C-489.

7. Fractography of the T86 AF/C-489 alloy indicated more classic low-energy intergranular fracture regions with ~200 nm slip offsets than the T86 AF/C-458 alloy which demonstrated ductile fracture via high energy transgranular shearing, grain boundary sliding, dimpled rupture, and MVC.
Acknowledgement

The authors would like to acknowledge helpful discussions with Dr. Kumar Jata during the course of this research. We also gratefully acknowledge the support of the Air Force Office of Scientific Research under Grant No. F49620-97-1-1034, Dr. Spenser Wu, Program Monitor.

References


