LITERATURE SURVEY OF INFORMATION STORAGE AND RETRIEVAL SYSTEMS
(MANUAL AND AUTOMATED)
FOR LAW LIBRARIES

by
G. R. EVANS

MAY 1968

DISTRIBUTION OF THIS DOCUMENT IS UNLIMITED

WORK CARRIED OUT AS PART OF THE LOCKHEED INDEPENDENT RESEARCH PROGRAM
ABSTRACT

A literature search was conducted on the subject of manual and automated storage and retrieval systems for law collections. The search results formed the basis of a survey to determine specifically the format and availability of law sources, thesauri, and retrieval systems. The author does not imply that the search and ensuing survey are comprehensive and exhaustive in scope. While the Stanford University Law Library is available through the consultative offices of the law librarian, generally speaking, only the resources and facilities of the Technical Information Center, Lockheed Missiles & Space Company were used in writing this survey; the exceptions are the two manually compiled subject authority lists, which were identified by a staff librarian, University of Santa Clara Law School.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract ................................... iii
Table of Contents .......................... v
Foreword ................................... vii
I. Task Statement ............................. 1
II. Facilities and Sources Available ......... 1

III. Findings .................................
    A. Sources of Law ......................... 3
    B. Thesauri, Subject Authority Lists, etc. ... 9
    C. Retrieval Systems for Law Collections ... 12

IV. A. Summary ............................... 14
     B. Recommendations ...................... 14

V. References ............................... 15

VI. Document Control Data - R&D ............ 17
FOREWORD

Irving Kayton, Associate Professor of Law at the George Washington University and a leading authority on the application of computers in law, recently made the following appraisal of the information retrieval problem in the legal profession:

"An information, or rather a printed matter, explosion is at hand, and the explosion is increasing in intensity exponentially, with little hope that a plateau will be reached. The world's libraries are increasing in volume at the rate of 35,000 words per second, or over one million volumes annually.

...We may rightly assume that the legal sector of the information explosion is continuing apace.

...Today there are over 2,300,000 reported cases, and the number of reported American decisions is estimated to be increasing at the rate of 22,000 per month."

It is clear that there is a great need at this time for automated information retrieval in the legal profession.

LMSC has, over the past three years, developed a state-of-the-art digital computer information retrieval system called DIALOG. DIALOG has for the past year supported an on-line video terminal at the NASA Library in Washington, D.C., where daily inquiries have been made against a file of 400,000 citations at the Lockheed Research Laboratory Computer Center in Palo Alto, California. The recent announcement by NASA that LMSC has been selected to develop and install a DIALOG-like nation-wide information retrieval system recognizes DIALOG as one of the most powerful information retrieval systems which is operational in the country today.

The attached literature search, in support of a DIALOG Legal Reference Retrieval System application, represents a current view of the state-of-the-art in legal reference retrieval, both manual and automated, and should therefore provide a useful bibliography for those interested in this field.
I TASK STATEMENT

A. Identify and locate sources; i.e., law reports, abstracts, citations, etc.; e.g., West Publishing Company's publications, Shephards Citations, etc.

1. Format: Are they manually compiled or are they computer produced and machine readable?

2. Availability: Whether copyrighted or done on government grant?

B. Identify and locate thesauri, terminology compilations, subject authority lists, etc.

1. Format: Are they manually compiled or are they computer produced and machine readable?

2. Availability: Whether copyrighted or done on government grant?

C. Identify and locate law retrieval systems

1. Format: Are they manual or automated systems?

2. Availability: Whether copyrighted or done on government grant?

II FACILITIES AND SOURCES AVAILABLE

A. Lockheed Missiles & Space Company, Technical Information Center

Abstracting Services:  Computer Abstracts
                      Computing Reviews
                      Data Processing Digest
                      Library Literature

Periodicals Collection

In the 1,000+ collection of periodicals and trade journals, none is devoted to the field of law; however, approximately 5-10 current trade journals are in the field of computer applications and from time-to-time run articles on the subject of automating law collections.

B. Stanford University Law School, Library

The complete facilities and sources of this collection are available specifically through the consultative services of Prof. J. Myron Jacobstein, Law Librarian.
C. University of Santa Clara, Law School Library

W. L. Morrison and I have communicated by telephone with Mrs. Phyllis Hasencamp, a staff librarian, University of Santa Clara, Law School Library. Mrs. Hasencamp was instrumental in identifying the two classification schemes in manual form.

D. Defense Documentation Center

A request has been sent to the Center for a machine search of its files on IS & RS for law collections. The results are pending.
III. FINDINGS

A. Sources of Law

(Time and money preclude the feasibility of a comprehensive listing of law sources; therefore, only those easily identified are included.)

The search did not uncover any evidence that there had been a significant undertaking to automate any one complete set of law sources. To date neither the West Company nor Shepard's have been particularly aggressive in attempts to mechanize their systems (1). Law Research Service, Inc., New York, N. Y. has offered legal citation service via Western Union’s nationwide computer system to 10 states and the District of Columbia (2). Law Research Service's sources were based on West Publishing Company's law services and current legal disputes among Law Research Services, Inc., its customers, Western Union and West Publishing Co., presumably have terminated this service.

U. S. Laws, Statutes, etc. Index to the federal statutes (1789-1873, 1874-1931) general and permanent law .... Wash., Govt. Prt. Off., 1912-13, 2 v.

The volume for 1869-1873 indexes v.1-17 of the Statutes at large; the volume for 1874-1931 indexes the Revised statutes of 1874 and the Statutes at large, v.18-46; this latter volume is a revision by W. H. McClenon and W. C. Gilbert of the Scott and Beaman Index analysis of the federal statutes 1874-1907.

These two volumes index all federal legislation of a public, general, and permanent nature through 1931.

Government Publication


In 1867 a commission was appointed to compile all the general and permanent laws by subject. The first revision, accepted and published as the Revised statutes of 1873, contained certain liberties in the texts taken by the revisers. The Revised statutes, 2d ed. 1876, restored the original text, and is the edition usually cited. Supplements were made and published in 1891 and 1901, but these are now largely superseded by the Code.

Government Publication

___United States statutes at large containing the laws and concurrent resolutions enacted .... and reorganization plans and proclamations, 1789-1873; 1873- .... Boston, Little, 1845-73; Wash., Govt. Prt. Off., 1875- ... v.1- ...

Title varies slightly.
The present series of Statutes at large starts with v. 16 (1873-75). It was preceded by the Law of the United States: Folwell edition, for the first 13 Congresses, 1789-1813; Bioren and Duane edition, for the first 28 Congresses, 1789-1845; Little, Brown edition, called Statutes at large, covering the first 42 Congresses, 1789-1873, and ending with v.17. This series was taken over by the federal government, v.18-.

Contents vary, but beginning with v.69, 1951, each volume contains public laws, reorganization plans, private laws, and concurrent resolutions and proclamations. Arrangement is chronological by date of passage of the act under the divisions: Public laws, Private laws, etc. A subject index and a personal-name index in each volume.

Slip laws are published separately, as soon as enacted, in two series: (1) Public Acts (cited as Public Law), and (2) Private Acts (cited as Private Law), and are superseded upon publication of the Statutes at large. Slip laws and resolutions are listed in the Monthly catalog under "Congress" and then by number.

Treaties to which the United States was a party (1776-1949) were published in the Statutes at large, 1948-1949. Since Jan. 1, 1950, they have been contained in United States treaties and other international agreements.

Government Publication


Published semimonthly during the session of Congress and monthly when Congress is not in session, with annual bound cumulations. Coverage varies somewhat; recent volumes include all public laws (full text), legislative history, executive orders, presidential proclamations, administrative regulations, messages of the president, popular names of laws, etc. Current issues contain index-digest of bills enacted.

Copyrighted.


Cited as U.S.C.

This code contains all general and permanent laws of the United States in force on Jan. 6, 1959, arranged under 50 titles, i.e., subjects with many subdivisions, called chapters.

Cumulative supplements issued annually.

Government Publication

Cited as U.S.C.A.

Comprises all laws of a general and permanent nature under the same arrangement as that of the Code. Annotations are from Federal and State court reports and opinions of the United States Attorney-General.

Kept up to date by cumulative, annual, pocket parts containing amendments and additions. Later replacement volumes are issued from time to time.

Copyrighted

Federal code annotated; all federal laws of a general and permanent nature ... fully annotated to the decisions of federal and state tribunals, together with annotations of uncodified laws and treaties, executive orders, proclamations, and law review articles. Indianapolis, Bobbs-Merrill, 1937- . v.1-

Cited as F.C.A.

Volumes replaced at intervals by perpetual revision plan. Groups related material into volumes, e.g., Federal taxation, Transportation and communication, Bankruptcy, etc.


Index, (1962). 2v.

Copyrighted


Tables, (1962).

Copyrighted


Normally published each session in 5 cumulative issues with biweekly supplements.

Provides "a brief synopsis, the essential features of public bills and resolutions and changes made therein during the legislative process."

Foreword.

Government Publication

"Indexes all congressional bills and resolutions of general interest and lists their current status. It is designed to lay open to the user a complete record of federal legislation and its progress from initial introduction to final disposition."

Now includes treaties.

Contains section on voting records in which all roll-call votes on the progress of legislation are reported weekly.

Copyrighted


1st ed. 1931. Frequently revised.

Subtitle: A compilation of popular names or short titles by which federal acts have been referred to or cited together with an identification of each act in terms of the United States code, or the United States statutes at large.

Table of federal and state cases by popular names. Colorado Springs, Shepard's Citations, 1957. 90p.

1st ed. 1934. Frequently revised.

Subtitle: A compilation of popular names by which federal and state cases have been referred to or cited, together with the volume and page references for such cases.


Copyrighted
Food Drug Law Service

Cuts across a particular subject field. It has an index with approximately 11,500 entries. (3)

Copyrighted

Prentice-Hall Federal Tax Service

Has 57,000 index entries in its publication (3)

Copyrighted

Labor Relations Reporter

The indexes in this set run to about 89,000 entries (3).

Copyrighted


Cited as C.F.R.

Kept up to date by pocket supplements, cumulating annually.

This is the second edition of the Code (1st ed. 1938), and contains a "codification of the Federal Administrative rules and regulations, general and permanent... duly promulgated on or before Dec. 31, 1946, and effective as to facts arising on and after Jan. 1, 1947."

The volumes form basic volumes for the type of material published currently in the Federal register

____ General index, (19...).


Government Publication


Contains all presidential proclamations and executive orders; rules and regulations of the various bureaus and departments of the government; and decisions of fact-finding bodies. Has monthly, quarterly, and annual indexes.

Government Publication
American Digest System

Includes 2,200,000 cases with descriptive word indexes of some 2,000,000 word-phrases. (3)

Copyrighted

American Law Reports

The 1st Series had a four volume index with over 1,000 pages in each of the volumes. The Annotated Reports have mechanical devices for up-dating the annotations. This competing search mechanism is complemented by its encyclopedia, which has a descriptive fact word index of over four volumes. (3)

Copyrighted

Corpus Juris and Corpus Juris secundum; a complete restatement of the entire American law as developed by all reported cases, by William Mack and Donald J. Kiser, assisted by the combined editorial staffs of the American Law Book Co. and the West Publishing Co. Brooklyn, N.Y., Amer. Law Book Co., (c1936-c1958). 101v.

Cited as C.J.S.

A new edition, superseding Corpus Juris (CJ). 1914-37. 72v. However, case citations refer to decisions handed down since the publication of C.J. For earlier authorities a specific reference to C.J. cites all cases back to 1006. This makes the original work still valuable.

Kept up to date by cumulative annual parts and recompiled volumes.

General index. 1959-60. 5v.

These are based on 400 topics and have respectively, some 300,000 word-phrase entries in Corpus Juris and some 450,000 word-phrase entries in Corpus Juris Secundum. (3)

Copyrighted


Kept up to date by annual, cumulative, pocket supplements.

Each volume has subject index.

Copyrighted

Title varies.

Loose-leaf abstracting service, consisting of monthly issues of digests of the leading articles appearing in United States, Canadian, Philippine, and Puerto Rican legal periodicals. Digests are on sheets for insertion in a loose-leaf binder according to subject.

The index section contains: (1) topical index; (2) author index; (3) table of articles, issued semiannually and annually, the annual index being cumulated for the year; (4) case comments by case names; (5) table of abbreviations; and (6) citation reference table.

Copyrighted


Ceased publication

Title varies


Government Publication.

B. Thesauri, subject authority lists, etc.

1. Thesauri

a. Manual: None identified by this search.
b. Computer-produced: American Bar Foundation using 3,000 decisions from the Northeastern Reporter has a thesaurus constructed in the computer. (4)
   Project Director, William B. Eldridge, A3F.
   Status: Under development
   Availability: Mr. Jacobstein has communicated with the A3F regarding availability. The answer is pending.

2. Subject Authority Lists (Classification schemes)

   Subject headings for the literature of law and international law.
   Copyrighted. A copy has been requested as a laboratory tool for 0/54-40.

   (U.S.) Library of Congress. Subject Cataloging Division.
   Classification, Class K: Law. 1967.
   Non copyrighted and available by purchase from the library. A copy has been requested as a laboratory tool for 0/56-40.
b. Machine: none identified by the literature search.

3. Indexes

a. Manual

NOTE: I have encountered semantical ambiguity in the use of the word "index". Shepard's Citation's (considered by the legal profession to be an index) is more encompassing than The Index to Legal Periodicals. In compiling this report, I have attempted to separate the two definitions, using the librarian's approach for the sake of clarity. As is noted in the references, the various citators and compilations of statutes contain comprehensive indexes, which have potential value for classification schemes.

Index to legal periodical literature. Boston, Boston Book Co., 1662-1919; Chipman, 1924; Indianapolis, Bobbs-Merrill, 1933; Los Angeles, Parker and Baird, 1933. v.1-6.

v.1, to 1662; v.2, 1663-90; v.3, 1690-1906; v.4, 1907-22; v.5, 1923-37.

Each volume consists of a main subject index, with brief author index to the subject part. Indexes periodical literature in the English language on technical and historical law subjects; legal biography; and a considerable number of articles on political, economic, and sociological subjects. v.1 indexes practically all articles in 137 legal periodicals (1373v.); all articles on law subjects in 113 general periodicals (including a few sets published in the 16th century); and the proceedings of various bar associations. v.4 indexes 51 periodicals and is practically a consolidation of v.1-14 of the annual Index to legal periodicals. Useful in the general library as well as in the law library.

Copyrighted

Index to foreign legal periodicals. London, pub. by the Inst. of Advanced Legal Studies, Univ. of London, in cooperation with the America Association of Law Libraries. 1960-. v.1-. Quarterly, cumulatively annually.

Indexes "the main legal periodicals dealing with international law (public and private), comparative law and the municipal law of all countries of the world other than the United States, the British Isles and countries of the British Commonwealth...." - Pref. Beginning with v.4 (1963), collections of legal essays such as Festschriften are also indexed.

Copyrighted
Index to legal periodicals, 1906- , pub. for the American Association of Law Libraries. N.Y., Wilson, 1909-.

Monthly indexes (frequency varies), with annual cumulations and, from 1926, 3-year cumulations which supersede the annual. The cumulated volumes consist of a subject and author index; a table of cases; and, since 1940, a book review index. Number of periodicals indexed varies from 39 in the 1906 annual to 290 in the 1961-64 cumulation. Earlier volumes indexed bar association and judicial council reports.

Copyrighted

George Washington University. Graduate School of Public Law. A retrieval system using descriptors, which are manually abstracted from the source material and the index is manually prepared. (5)

Availability: Unknown

California State Library. Law Library

Index to California Legal Periodicals and Documents. Sacramento. 1964- . (6)

Availability: Unknown

Massachusetts State Library, Boston.


Availability: Unknown

b. Automated

American Bar Foundation

Current index of newly enacted state legislation. This index is constructed by means of a computer from the titles of the laws themselves in the KWIC format. (7)

Availability: Mr. Jacobstein is investigating.

American Bar Foundation

The Index to Legal Theses and Research Projects. Now produced with the aid of a computer. (8) (9)

Availability: Mr. Jacobstein is investigating.
C. Retrieval Systems for Law Collections

a. Manual

Harvard University. Law School. Library
Catalog of International Law and Relations. Ed. by Margaret Moody. Cambridge, Mass., 1965. 21 vols. This is a photographic reproduction of the catalog, in classified arrangement, of the largest international law library in the world. (6)

Availability: Mr. Jacobstein is investigating.


Availability: Mr. Jacobstein is investigating.

New York University. Law Center.
Catalog of the Law Collection with Selected Annotations. Ed. by Julius J. Marke. NYU, Law Center, 1953. (6)

Availability: Mr. Jacobstein is investigating.

McGill University. Library.

Availability: Mr. Jacobstein is investigating.

Project Lawsearch. Uses manually selected peek-a-boo cards in the Termatex System of Jonkers Business Machines, Inc. (7) (10) (12)

Availability: Unknown.

b. Automated

The most up-to-date and comprehensive report of automated legal retrieval systems, which I have been able to identify, is the paper by Aviezri S. Fraenkel entitled "Legal Information." It is still unpublished; a review copy is in the possession of Byron Jacobstein. The work was performed in part under a grant from the U.S. government.

Probably the most ambitious undertaking thus far in legal retrieval systems is that of John F. Harty, the University of Pittsburgh, Health Law Center. The tape library includes the entire statutes of Pennsylvania, New York, and New Jersey, entire U.S. Code and the health laws of approximately 15 states. (1) (3) (4) (7) (10) (11) (12) (13) (14) (15) (16) (19) (20) (21)

Availability: Unknown.
Other attempts to design and develop legal retrieval systems include:

The University of Iowa (5)
Availability: Unknown.

George Washington University
This may be described as a combination manual/automated retrieval system, as the index part to the system has previously been listed under manual indexes or descriptor compilations. (5) (7) (14)
Availability: Unknown.

Oklahoma State University
This system has been referred to by its director, Robert T. Morgan, Assistant Professor of Business Law, as the "point-of-law" approach. Its purpose is to aid in determining relevancy to particular cases rather than merely serving as an information data base. (5) (7) (10) (12) (14) (15) (17) (18)
Availability: Unknown.

Southwestern Legal Foundation, Southern Methodist University. (7) (10) (12) (13) (14)
Availability: Unknown.

Western Reserve University. (7) (10) (15) (17)
Availability: Unknown.

IBM/H. P. Luhn (17)
Availability: Unknown.

American Bar Foundation (16)
Availability: Unknown.

U. S. Department of Justice (16)
Availability: Unknown.

U. S. Federal Aviation Administration (16)
Availability: Unknown.

Availability: Unknown.
IV. SUMMARY & RECOMMENDATIONS

A. Summary

The search did not uncover any evidence that there had been a significant undertaking to automate any one complete set of law sources. No manually compiled thesauri were identified by the search; however, the George Washington University IS&RS uses a manually compiled index or descriptor list (5). One computer-produced thesaurus was identified; at this writing it should be considered as being in the developmental rather than the operational stage (4). Two manually compiled subject authority lists (classification schemes), but no computer-produced subject authority lists were identified. At least thirteen of the law sources have general indexes; also, the literature search identified six publications, which would be considered by librarians to be indexes of law literature. The American Bar Foundation has developed two computer-produced indexes. Of the five manual retrieval systems listed in this survey, four are book catalogs of law collections (6). The remaining one, "Project Lawsearch", is based on the Termatrex system (7) (10) (15). Ten automated retrieval systems in various stages of development have been identified by the literature search.

B. Recommendations

Most of the references offered only sketchy descriptions of the ten retrieval systems; therefore, letters inquiring about the current status of the projects and about the availability of the computer programs and/or tapes should be sent to the universities and organizations under whose sponsorship the projects were initiated.
V. References

(1) Stromer, Peter R.
Jurimetrics: Computerized Legal Research.

(2) Law Research Service Goes on Western Union System
Business Automation News Report, July 11, 1966, p. 6

(3) Proceedings of the Special Committee on Electronic Data Retrieval,
August 6, 1960
M.U.L.L., December 1960, pages 158-188.

(4) Dennis, Salle F.
Status of American Bar Foundation Research on Automatic Indexing-
Searching Computer System.

(5) Jurimetrics: The Electronic Digital Computer and its Application in
Legal Research.

(6) Price, Miles O.
Anglo-American Law.

(7) Freed, Roy N.
Information Processing in the Legal Field.

(8) Harris, D. J. and Kent, A. K.
The Computer as an Aid to Lawyers.

(9) Kraft, Donald H.
A Comparison of Keyword-in-Context (KWIC) Indexing of Titles with a
Subject Heading Classification System.

(10) Covey, Joan M.
Information Retrieval in Law: Problems and Progress with Legal Computers

(11) Kehl, William B.
An Information Retrieval Language for Legal Studies.

(12) Schorr, Irwin
The Law and the Computer: A cautious Flirtation.

(13) Gibbs, Martha and Adams, Eldridge
(14) Lawlor, Reed C.
Computers and the Law.

(15) Freed, Roy N.
The Importance of a Systems Approach to Mechanized Legal Research
Data Processing Digest, August 1961, pages 5-6.

(16) Ball, Vaughn C.
The Impact of Data-Processing Technology on the Legal Profession.

(17) Allen, Layman E., Brooks, Robin B. S., and James, Patricia A.
Automatic Retrieval of Legal Literature: Why and How?
Walter E. Meyer Res. Inst. of Law, Inc., 127 Wall Street, New Haven, Conn.

(18) Proceedings of the Special Committee on Electronic Data Retrieval
August 8, 1961, St. Louis, Missouri.
The Point of Law Approach, Robert T. Morgan, Assistant Professor of Law, Oklahoma State University.

(19) Horty, J. F.
Electronic Data Retrieval in Legal Research (with discussion).

(20) Erikson, Ann M. and Johnson, David A.
Ohio's Computer Code Retrieval System
Public Automation, Output, October 1966

(21) Lawlor, Reed C.
Computers, Law and Society—Where do We Go from Here?

(22) LITE-Legal Information Thru Electronics
JAG Law Review, November-December 1966

Bibliography

Duggan, Michael, A.
Law, Logic and The Computer: Bibliography with Assorted Background Material

It is to be published monthly by the World Peace Through Law Center's Section on Law and Computer Technology. Each issue contains a section on current bibliographies. Subscription is $20 per year for non-members, available through the World Peace Through Law Center, 839 17th Street, NW, Washington, D. C. 20006.

16
A literature search was conducted on the subject of manual and automated storage and retrieval systems for law collections. The search results formed the basis of a survey to determine specifically the format and availability of law sources, thesauri, and retrieval systems. The author does not imply that the search and ensuing survey are comprehensive and exhaustive in scope. While the Stanford University Law Library is available through the consultative offices of the law librarian, essentially speaking, only the resources and facilities of the Technical Information Center, Lockheed Missiles & Space Company were used in writing this survey; the exceptions are the two manually compiled subject authority lists, which were identified by a staff librarian, University of Santa Clara Law School.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KEY WORDS</th>
<th>LINK A</th>
<th>LINK B</th>
<th>LINK C</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LAW COLLECTIONS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAW LIBRARIES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INFORMATION STORAGE AND</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RETRIEVAL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MANUAL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AUTOMATED</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STATUTES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMPUTERS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THESAURUS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDEXES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLASSIFICATION SCHEMES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>