EXPANDING THE TALENT POOL IN THE AREA OF HOMELAND SECURITY

by

Lai Sun M. Yee

December 2005

Thesis Advisor: Chris Bellavita
Second Reader: Robert Simeral

Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited
The attack on the World Trade Center on September 11, 2001 spurred the growth of the field of homeland security in the United States. It would be beneficial to expand the talent and brain pool from which leaders can be drawn by increasing the number of women and minorities in the area of homeland security. This thesis will discuss the people who would seek careers in government; look at the experience of the military for increasing women officers; examine the mentoring programs in government and the private sector; and the importance of diversity in communicating to the public during an attack or an emergency.

The area of homeland security encompasses the fields of law enforcement, fire fighting, emergency medical services, and emergency management. In order to increase the diversity of these fields, it will be necessary to attract, identify, recruit, and mentor women and minorities. Studies and anecdotal information indicate that mentoring programs are beneficial to women and minorities, especially if one’s mentor is a senior official or executive in the organization. Such a mentoring relationship is usually fruitful in that the mentee may be exposed to higher level decision makers if selected for important projects and if one’s mentor can provide information about the unwritten rules of an organization. Mentoring programs alone will not increase diversity in the area of homeland security. Such change will need the support of senior leaders. It will be necessary to persuade senior leaders that it is to their advantage to have their organizations reflect the diversity of America. This thesis makes some recommendations as to how senior leaders in homeland security can work to increase diversity. Again, nothing can change without the support of senior leaders in actively opening doors and nurturing talented women and minorities.
EXPANDING THE TALENT POOL IN THE AREA OF HOMELAND SECURITY

Lai Sun M. Yee
General Counsel, New York State Emergency Management Office
B.A., Cornell University, 1984
J.D., Cornell Law School, 1989

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF ARTS IN SECURITY STUDIES
(HOMELAND SECURITY AND DEFENSE)

from the

NAVAL POSTGRADUATE SCHOOL
December 2005

Author: Lai Sun M. Yee

Approved by: Christopher Bellavita
Thesis Advisor

Robert Simeral
Second Reader

Douglas Porch
Chairman, Department of National Security Affairs
ABSTRACT

The attack on the World Trade Center on September 11, 2001 spurred the growth of the field of homeland security in the United States. It would be beneficial to expand the talent and brain pool from which leaders can be drawn by increasing the number of women and minorities in the area of homeland security. This thesis will discuss the people who would seek careers in government; look at the experience of the military for increasing women officers; examine the mentoring programs in government and the private sector; and the importance of diversity in communicating to the public during an attack or an emergency.

The area of homeland security encompasses the fields of law enforcement, fire fighting, emergency medical services, and emergency management. In order to increase the diversity of these fields, it will be necessary to attract, identify, recruit, and mentor women and minorities. Studies and anecdotal information indicate that mentoring programs are beneficial to women and minorities, especially if one’s mentor is a senior official or executive in the organization. Such a mentoring relationship is usually fruitful in that the mentee may be exposed to higher level decision makers if selected for important projects and if one’s mentor can provide information about the unwritten rules of an organization.

Mentoring programs alone will not increase diversity in the area of homeland security. Such change will need the support of senior leaders. It will be necessary to persuade senior leaders that it is to their advantage to have their organizations reflect the diversity of America. This thesis makes some recommendations as to how senior leaders in homeland security can work to increase diversity. Again, nothing can change without the support of senior leaders in actively opening doors and nurturing talented women and minorities.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## I. THE CALL FOR SERVICE IN THE PUBLIC SECTOR ............................................. 1  
   A. FINDING LEADERS IN HOMELAND SECURITY ........................................... 2  
   B. THE TRAITS OF A HOMELAND SECURITY LEADER ................................. 3  
   C. THE DEARTH OF NEW LEADERS AND NEW PARADIGMS TO TRAIN THEM ......................................................... 4  
   D. METHODOLOGY......................................................................................... 6  

## II. WOMEN IN THE MILITARY ........................................................................... 9  
   A. BACKGROUND OF WOMEN IN MILITARY.............................................. 11  
   B. LAWS AFFECTING WOMEN IN THE MILITARY.................................... 11  
   C. RISK RULE ........................................................................................ 13  
   D. REVIEW OF EACH SERVICES EFFORTS TO INCREASE THE NUMBER OF POSITIONS AVAILABLE TO WOMEN............... 14  
       1. Navy ........................................................................................ 14  
          a. Navy’s Program to Mentor Women............................................ 14  
       2. Marines ................................................................................... 14  
          a. Marine’s Program to Increase Women.............................. 15  
       3. Army ....................................................................................... 15  
       4. Air Force ................................................................................. 16  
          a. Air Force Programs to Increase the Number of Women............. 16  
   E. CRITIQUE OF THE MILITARY’S PROGRAMS TO INCREASE THE NUMBER OF WOMEN .............................................................. 18  
   F. CONCLUSION ..................................................................................... 19  

## III. THE IMPORTANCE OF MENTORING IN THE AREA OF HOMELAND SECURITY .................................................................................................... 21  
   A. THE NEED FOR DIVERSITY IN HOMELAND SECURITY ..................... 21  
   B. BACKGROUND OF MENTORING .......................................................... 23  
   C. MENTORING PROGRAMS IN THE MILITARY ...................................... 24  
   D. MENTORING PROGRAMS IN THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT ........... 26  
   E. IMPORTANCE OF MENTORS FOR WOMEN IN BUSINESS ............ 27  
   F. IMPORTANCE OF MENTORS FOR WOMEN IN THE MILITARY ....... 28  
   G. APPLICABILITY OF MILITARY MENTORING PROGRAMS TO HOMELAND SECURITY................................................................. 29  
   H. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTING A MENTORING PROGRAM IN HOMELAND SECURITY ................................................. 29  
   I. EVALUATION OF THE SUCCESS OF THE MENTORING PROGRAM ............................................................................. 31  

## IV. THE PSYCHOLOGY OF TERRORISM AND MINORITIES AND IMMIGRANTS ........................................................................................................ 33
A. MINORITY AND IMMIGRANT COMMUNITIES REACT DIFFERENTLY TO TERRORISM ...................................................... 33
B. LESSONS LEARNED FROM 9-11 .................................................... 35
C. CRISIS AND RISK COMMUNICATION PLANS .......................... 36

V. CASE STUDIES .................................................................................. 39
A. CASE STUDY NUMBER 1 ................................................................. 39
B. CASE STUDY NUMBER 2 ................................................................. 41
C. CASE STUDY NUMBER 3 ................................................................. 44
D. CASE STUDY NUMBER 4 ................................................................. 45
E. CASE STUDY NUMBER 5 ................................................................. 47

VI. CONCLUSION .................................................................................... 49

APPENDIX A. QUESTIONNAIRE .......................................................... 51

BIBLIOGRAPHY ...................................................................................... 53

INITIAL DISTRIBUTION LIST ............................................................... 55
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am grateful for the support of my mother, father and my brothers in my educational endeavors. In addition, I would like to acknowledge the support of Frank P. Cruthers, who exemplifies the best qualities of senior leaders in homeland security. He has encouraged me to pursue my interest in the area of homeland security, where I can make a positive contribution.
I. THE CALL FOR SERVICE IN THE PUBLIC SECTOR

The creation of the Department of Homeland Security (DHS) provides a new career path for those public service minded individuals who want to contribute to the protection and response of this country from terrorists and natural disasters. For the first time in many years in the government, a new federal agency was created from the amalgamation of many far-flung and diverse federal agencies with various cultures and values. The development of homeland security as a professional field will create a new need for homeland security leaders. Since terrorists are opportunists and are creative in adopting new strategies and utilizing resources to carry out their missions, it is important that new and fresh perspectives be brought to this field. This thesis will examine the need for increasing the talent pool of potential leaders in homeland security by increasing the number of women and minorities in this field.

Another factor that necessitates expanding the talent pool is that it is important that the people who work in the area of homeland security reflect the rich diversity of this country. In order to effectively strategize and plan for the nation’s response to terrorism, natural disasters and emergencies, it is also important to understand and communicate with the different ethnic communities that comprise this country. Thus, governmental agencies should write risk communication plans with this special audience in mind.

Studies have shown that ethnic groups may not necessarily comply with government guidelines for emergencies, but are more likely to comply with suggestions from individuals that they trust from their communities. For example, it will be important to present faces that a minority, ethnic or immigrant community will trust in order to deliver governmental instructions in the event of a biological, chemical or radiological event. There is a greater probability that minorities and immigrants will go to points of distribution in order to receive the mass prophylaxis required to minimize the effects of the attack, when it is communicated by someone with whom they trust and feel comfortable.
In the near future, the first of the baby boomer generation will begin to retire from the government and private workforce, thereby creating vacancies and an information and experiential gap. In order to fill these vacancies, it will be necessary to expand the talent pool by looking at women and minorities. For example, the United States military has already expanded its recruitment efforts to focus on women and minorities as the number of white male recruits has declined.

One method that may be utilized to expand the number of women and minorities in homeland security is through mentoring programs. Mentoring programs have been utilized in both the public and private sectors as one method of increasing diversity within an organization. This thesis will also look at some mentoring programs in the federal government, military and private companies. These mentoring programs may serve as templates for the area of homeland security.

A. FINDING LEADERS IN HOMELAND SECURITY

The search for the optimal leader in government cannot be separated from politics. It would be naïve to think that leaders would be divorced from politics. Partisan politics will not necessarily dictate the choice of a good, intelligent and motivational leader. Indeed, the selection of a leader to manage an agency or a bureaucracy will likely be based on the political ideology of the individual or the personal relationship of the individual to a decision-maker. The selection process for leaders of federal, state, and local agencies is subject to politics or the “who knows who” factor. Generally, when leadership positions become available or vacant, decision makers usually hire someone who shares their management style and has a similar background. This type of process closes the gate to those who may be very competent to serve in a leadership position, but are not chosen to do so because they are not part of an “old boy network”. Historically, those outside the traditional political process are women and minorities. It can be a daunting task for those outside traditional career networks to overcome the “old boy network” and access opportunities for leadership positions.
B. THE TRAITS OF A HOMELAND SECURITY LEADER

In the process of writing this thesis, some of the academic literature and scholarly research on the attributes and traits of an ideal leader have been reviewed. There have been some studies in identifying successful traits of a leader in the public sector.

In “The Public Administrator as Hero”, Bellavita studied public administrators to determine what elements contribute to successful and positive public sector experiences. He interviewed and questioned forty-five public administrators about their work experiences. The results of his research suggest that the person undertakes the hero’s journey out of a sense of duty, the opportunity to “test an idea or act on a belief” and “the drive to accomplish something.”1 The response to duty and taking advantage of opportunities also implies the presence of a drive to “achieve something tangible and meaningful.”2

According to Bellavita, in order to accomplish the public administrator’s work, he/she must have a “vision of what it is to be accomplished; planning; organizing, and implementing actions to achieve the vision and having the faith and courage that the adventure will succeed.”3 In order to implement the administrator’s idea or strategy, the administrator needs to possess negotiation skills, interpersonal skills and communication skills to articulate his/her vision at meetings; attending to details; patience and stamina.

The administrator must have morals and ethics. Bellavita writes that the “hero in public administration sacrifices part of self for an idea that is bigger than the self. The sacrifice may be time, friendships, reputation, family, career, or on rare occasions, life.”4 For a public administrator to stay the course and to remain in the public sector where promotions are few and far between, and salaries are considerably less than the private sector, there must be a vision of something

---

2 Ibid., 161.
3 Ibid., 167.
4 Ibid., 174.
greater than financial reward. It is altruism and a real belief that while working in the government, one may have the opportunity to create something better and something that may positively impact the public. It is the concept of working for the common good.

C. THE DEARTH OF NEW LEADERS AND NEW PARADIGMS TO TRAIN THEM

Since many senior leaders will retire from the government, there will be a need to identify potential senior leaders and groom them to take over in order to increase the pool of qualified candidates. One researcher, Margaret Wheatley, has studied the qualities of leaders and concluded that a dearth of new leaders exists and that there is a need for new paradigms to train them.

Margaret Wheatley asks in her article, “Supporting Pioneering Leaders as Communities of Practice”, “Where have all the leaders gone?” She posits that good leaders exist but that they have not been trained nor been given much support in order to advance as leaders. She believes that the “old leadership paradigm has failed us and that our current systems will continue to unravel.”

Wheatley writes that new leaders have abandoned traditional practices of hierarchy, power, and bureaucracy to become “social entrepreneurs”. These new leaders are employing more humanistic approaches to social problems by believing in people’s innate creativity and caring and that people can be called upon to become active in their communities. The new leaders innately recognize the interconnectedness of systems and realize the globalization of the world.

According to Wheatley, these pioneers must invent new paradigms to lead. The new leaders must invent the future while dealing with the past. The challenge for new leaders is to invent new ways of organizing and processes for implementing change, while at the same time resolving current problems. New leaders may have difficulty in creating new ways of resolving current problems, and may default to old practices, even if the old practices have not been effective.

---


6 Ibid.
in solving problems. The supporters of the new leaders want the leaders to use familiar and traditional leadership methods. This tends to reinforce the old practices that the new leaders want to revise and change. Wheatley concludes that “[o]ver time, they fail, not from lack of vision or willingness to experiment, but because they have been held back from those experiments.”

The interconnectedness of systems creates a need for new leaders who can build coalitions and alliances and understand how to harness the dynamics of networks. Those leaders in homeland security will need to possess a take-charge ability, the ability to make decisions and to accept accountability and to bring their ideas or plans into fruition. They will need strong management skills consisting of communication, the ability to motivate and work with others, and the ability to lead and empower teams to implement their ideas. Leaders will delegate the implementation of their ideas to administrators to organize and to operate. Leaders may hire or work with consultants to create or implement these ideas or to put together projects that further the mission of the agency. Administrators may utilize leadership skills such as communication, team building, organizing and planning in working with consultants to further an agency’s mission.

In order to develop future homeland security leaders, it is first necessary to identify and to mentor them. To identify them, it is important to determine whether he/she has a commitment or has demonstrated a commitment to public service. Will he or she persevere in an environment where there are limited resources and personnel; where obstacles or enemies may work to sabotage the project; or where there may be limited recognition or appreciation for one’s work. The identification of future homeland security leaders should not be limited to traditional perceptions and models for leaders. The universe of future leaders should be expanded to include groups that have not been historically represented in the first responder community, defense, military, and law enforcement agencies, such as minorities and women.

---

7 Wheatley, “Supporting Pioneering”.

It is also important to actively promote the concept of mentoring and to encourage senior executives to mentor future homeland security leaders. By exposing potential homeland security leaders to these executives, future leaders will have the wisdom of seasoned executives who can provide guidance and career opportunities.

Finally, it is particularly helpful to perceive of working for the government as a higher calling where one is motivated by a sense of public service. Leaders should have a sense of responsibility to work for the common good.

D. METHODOLOGY

The methodology that was utilized for this thesis is to research books and articles regarding studies of the effects of increasing diversity in leadership positions and of mentoring programs. In order to gather data on the experience of senior women leaders in the area of homeland security, a survey was developed and conducted by questioning five subjects. Data from the survey was then assessed to draw conclusions regarding the representation of women in the area of homeland security.

Female subjects representing the broad area of homeland security were selected. The women were senior leaders in the military, public health, law enforcement, fire department and a not-for-profit in the area of bioterrorism grant funding. In general, most of the women were trailblazers in their professional lives and were either the first women to obtain leadership positions in their field of expertise or were members of a small group of women senior leaders in their organizations. The women included: (1) a leader in local public health; (2) a female fire chief of department for a metropolitan area; (3) a female officer in Northern Command; (4) an African American chief in state government; and (5) a director in a not-for-profit working in the bioterrorism area.

In order to evaluate the women’s responses, a list of questions was developed and asked of each subject, a copy of which is attached hereto in Appendix A. The questions inquired into each woman’s career path, any obstacles that she may have encountered, successful career strategies and
whether she perceived a need to increase the diversity of women and minorities in homeland security. Each of the five subjects was asked the same ten questions in order to compare each woman's response.

White papers and theses on the issue of increasing women and minorities in leadership positions within the military were reviewed in order to determine whether it was possible to draw analogies between women in the military and women in homeland security. Some of the theses researched the effectiveness of mentoring programs to increase women and minorities in the military.
II. WOMEN IN THE MILITARY

Across the country, homeland security leaders have not availed themselves of a vast resource, women. The U.S. military faced an analogous situation, in that too few women held leadership positions. Due to changes in the law and to changes in the composition of the military, the military since the 1990’s has opened more positions to women. This chapter will examine lessons learned from this experience; critique military programs aimed at opening up leadership positions to women, and examine how those initiatives might be altered to meet the unique circumstances of homeland security. In particular, it is recommended that homeland security leaders begin to create and institutionalize mentoring programs to identify and to support the advancement of women leaders.

In order to address the results of terrorism against America in the future, it is important that the type and experiences of the homeland security leaders be diversified. It is a necessity to increase the number of women in the area of homeland security since it would be beneficial to increase the pool of talented people and to develop different perspectives and areas of expertise in addressing terrorism. Increasing the representation of women in the area of homeland security will also provide the foundation for identifying and mentoring future leaders from these groups. Furthermore, by increasing the number of women in homeland security, this area would reflect the diversity of America.

In New York City, the number of women and minorities who are in leadership positions in law enforcement, first responders, emergency medicine, and emergency management are small in numbers. Traditionally, police officers, soldiers, firefighters, and national security officers have been men and have been perceived as protectors. As a result of the attack on the World Trade Center, the definition and the traditional perception of a protector has broadened to include women. For example, Captain Kathy Mazza of the Port Authority Police and New York City police officer Moira Smith were killed at the Trade Center.
This chapter will examine the position of women in the military and women in leadership positions in the military. The number of women in the military increased due to the fact that there were less qualified men applying to the military, and changes in service directives, legislation, and court decisions. Approximately, there are 164,000 women in the military. Although the number of positions available to women has increased in the various branches of the services, direct combat is still closed to women. The inability of women to serve in combat positions limits their career advancement in the military. Therefore, without combat experience, it is more difficult for women to attain leadership positions within the military.

The military’s experience of increasing the number of women and women leaders varies from that of the non-military homeland security governmental agencies. In the military, there are internal rules and regulations promulgated to include women. In the homeland security governmental arena, women have come to the areas of law enforcement, firefighting and emergency management sometimes through the intervention of legal means such as court orders and non-legal means. The non-legal means in the governmental areas include strategies such as recruitment efforts, community outreach, cadet programs and informal mentoring relationships. Therefore, military programs may be more successful than the non-military governmental programs because there are specific rules and regulations requiring the inclusion and advancement of women.

In 1981, the Defense Officer Personnel Management Act (DOPMA) provided for an officer management system for all of the services. DOPMA has specific rules relating to the training, appointment, promotion, separation, and retirement of military officers. DOPMA sets standards for the Regular and Reserve commissions, officer tenure rights, and a system of promotion that will ensure a combat ready officer corps. The promotion system is one based on a policy of “up or out”.

The “up or out” principle is one in which officers move through the system in cohorts categorized by the year of commissioning and the officers in the same
cohorts at set years of service (YOS). The “out” part of the principle provides that officers twice passed over for promotion, after a certain number of years and depending upon their particular grade, are to be separated from the active service, and if eligible retired.8

A. BACKGROUND OF WOMEN IN MILITARY

Women have served in every major war until World War II in traditional roles such as nurses, office staff, and other administrative roles. The government in World War II created the Women's Army Corps (WAC), the Navy's Women Accepted for Voluntary Emergency Service (WAVES), and the Coast Guard's Semper Paratus: Always Prepared (SPARS) to fill military personnel shortages. Also, during World War II, the Marines and what was to become the Air Force also accepted women applicants.

After the end of the draft and the inception of the All-Volunteer Force in December 1972, the military made a concerted effort to recruit women. This was in response to the military's difficulty in recruiting and retaining enough qualified males. In 1972, the Reserve Officers' Training Corps (ROTC) was opened to women. In 1976, the United States Naval Academy, the United States Air Force Academy, and the United States Military Academy all accepted their first class of women. In 1978, Navy women were assigned to non-combatant ships and the military dissolved the Women's Army Corps. In 1989, two women led their units into combat in Panama. In 1990, the first female naval officer commanded a ship. During the Persian Gulf War in 1991, many women were deployed with their units into combat zones. Again, during the Iraq war in 2004, women were deployed with their units into combat zones.

B. LAWS AFFECTING WOMEN IN THE MILITARY

In 1948, Congress passed the Women's Armed Services Integration Act (Integration Act) (62 Stat. 356-75) which ensured women a permanent place in the military services by authorizing women in the regular Army, Navy, Air Force, and Marine Corps, but placed limits on the total number of women in the

---

military.9 Women could not make up more than two percent of the total enlisted ranks; the number of female officers (excluding nurses) was limited to ten percent of enlisted women. No woman could serve in a command position. The highest rank that a female officer could achieve was of Lieutenant Commander (or Commander in the Navy). The Integration Act prohibited women from being assigned to combat aircraft or vessels. Although the Integration Act did not apply directly to the Army, the Secretary of the Army adopted policies to exclude women from direct combat.10

Due to the civil rights movements of the 1960’s and 1970’s, changes were made to the role of women in the military by policy directives from the military, court decisions, and legislation. In 1967, P.L. 90-130 repealed the two percent cap on enlisted women and lifted some restrictions on female promotions.

In 1978, P.L. 95-485 modified Section 6015 of Title 10 of the U.S. Code which prohibited women from serving on Navy ships, by permitting women to be assigned to permanent duty on vessels not expected to be assigned to combat missions and up to six months of temporary duty on other Navy ships.

In 1991, the Defense Authorization Act for fiscal years 1992 and 1993 repealed the limitations on assigning women to combat aircraft in the Air Force and Navy. After congressional repeal, then-Secretary of Defense, Les Aspin, directed the services to open further occupational specialties and assignments to women. Secretary Aspin directed the Secretary of the Navy to open up more assignments for women on noncombatant vessels and to develop legislation to repeal the naval combatant exclusion law. However, Secretary Aspin also stated that women would not be assigned to units that engaged in direct combat on the ground.


C. RISK RULE

In 1988, the Department of Defense adopted a risk rule that excluded women from non-combat units or missions if the risks of exposure to direct combat, hostile fire, or capture was equal to or greater than the risk in the combat units they support. Women could be assigned to non-combat units or positions if the risk is less than comparable to the combat units with which they are associated. In 1994, then-Secretary Aspin rescinded the risk rule. The new rule stated that “Women may not serve in units that engage an enemy on the ground with weapons, are exposed to hostile fire, and have a high probability of direct physical contact with the personnel of a hostile force. Direct ground combat takes place well forward on the battlefield while locating and closing with the enemy to defeat them by fire, maneuver, or shock effect.” (House Report 103-200).

Currently, women are eligible for assignment for all positions to which they are qualified, but they are excluded from assignments to units below the brigade level whose primary mission is to engage in direct combat on the ground.

On July 29, 1994, Secretary of Defense William Perry announced that the military would open more than 80,000 additional positions for women. After October 1994, more than 92 percent of the career fields and 80 percent of the total jobs would be open to women.

From 1976 to 1995, the total representation of women in the military increased from 5.4 percent to 12.6 percent. The percentage of minority women rose from 21.1 percent to 40.8 percent.\textsuperscript{11}

Women tend to be concentrated in administration and supply areas, and are represented in tactical operations. Two thirds of general and flag officers of the services are promoted from tactical operations.\textsuperscript{12}


\textsuperscript{12} Gilroy et al., “Career Progression.”
D. REVIEW OF EACH SERVICES EFFORTS TO INCREASE THE NUMBER OF POSITIONS AVAILABLE TO WOMEN

1. Navy

Section 541 of the Defense Authorization Act for Fiscal Year 1994, P.L. 103-160 repealed 10 U.S.C. 6015 prohibiting women from serving on combat vessels. The Navy also opened up pilot training and assigned women to various ship types in the combat logistics force. The naval assignments that prohibit women from serving are connected to submarines, such as submarine sonar technician or gun or missile crew member. In October 1994, the Navy opened 94 percent of the jobs and 96 percent of the Navy career fields to women.

   a. Navy’s Program to Mentor Women

   Like the Marines and the Air Force, the Navy has also institutionalized a mentor program. It assigns experienced officers and enlisted personnel to mentor and develop young ensigns and naval personnel into leaders. The Navy initiated the program to address its concern that too many recruits did not understand the significance of their jobs early in and throughout their career. The recruits would be mentored in four stages of their military career as follows:

   1. The initial entry into the Navy;
   2. During their initial period in a new command;
   3. When the sailor or the officer earns warfare or watch station qualifications; and
   4. The rest of the person’s naval career.13

2. Marines

The Marine Corps has the smallest percentage of women since its primary mission is to engage in combat. In October 1994, 48,000 new positions were opened to women resulting in an increase of career positions for women from 33 percent to 93 percent. The new positions included assignments on combat vessels, Marine Corps Air/Ground Task Force (MAGTF) Headquarters and Air

---

13 Adams, “Mentoring Women,” 32.
Defense Artillery Battalion Headquarters. Women had already served as Marine Security Guards for U.S. Embassies overseas, and Hawk Missile technicians and operators. Women are prohibited from serving as combat engineers, infantry and tanks.

a. **Marine’s Program to Increase Women**

The Marine’s institutionalized mentoring in a cradle to grave concept. It created cultural diversity programs, reviewed, updated and revised affirmative action plans, and implemented the use of “total quality leadership” as a response to the issue of the promotion of women.

The Marine Corps Basic School (TBS) Policy Letter #11, “The Mentor Program,” and Officer Candidate School (OCS) Order 1530.3, Implementation of the Mentor Program, institutionalized a mentoring program for the Marines. The purpose of the Mentor Program is to reduce the attrition rate of minorities and women and to increase their representation in the officer ranks. The OCS provides candidates the opportunity to seek leadership guidance outside of the organization and promotes a supportive environment to facilitate the success of the candidates.¹⁴

3. **Army**

Effective October 1994, the Army increased the number of career fields from 61 percent to 91 percent, including assigning women to attack aviation units. However, the Army prohibited women from serving in Special Operations forces and aircraft and air cavalry units because these units are deployed with ground combat units.

The integration of women into the newly opened assignments is difficult because the ground combat exclusion policy keeps many units and organizational levels officially closed to women. As an example, women cannot serve in field artillery units below the brigade level. This is detrimental to a woman’s career advancement in that experience with the infantry and the armor unit is considered significant for career advancement. The field grade command

opportunities available to women in field artillery are limited to training units which are not considered good career stepping stones to other command opportunities.\textsuperscript{15}

As presented in a RAND study on the status of women in the military, participants reported that women’s integration into the Army had been restricted unofficially. Some local commanders will send extra women who should be in their units elsewhere. In other instances, commanders have made their own interpretations of the rules and concluded that assignments that are officially open to women should be closed.\textsuperscript{16}

4. Air Force

The Air Force had a head start on implementing programs to open up positions to women. Since the Air Force has a small percentage of personnel who engage in direct combat, it had a higher percentage of women than the other services. Prior to October 1994, the Air Force had already opened up 99 percent of Air Force positions to women. The Air Force also began fighter training for women.

a. Air Force Programs to Increase the Number of Women

According to Major Marie Y. Rigotti, women made up sixteen percent of the United States Air Force (USAF) in 1997.\textsuperscript{17} The increase in the percentage of women in the USAF can be attributed to its open personnel development climate. The open climate encourages women to receive guidance, training and mentoring in order to develop and excel in key leadership positions. From 1985 to 1995, the percentage of Majors increased 152 percent, the percentage of Lieutenant Colonels increased 227 percent, and the percentage of flag officers increased 271 percent during this period.\textsuperscript{18} The increase in the percentage of women in leadership positions can be attributed to the importance that the USAF places on mentoring. The former Commander of Air Education

\textsuperscript{15} Harrell and Miller, “New Opportunities,” 13.
\textsuperscript{16} Ibid., 13.
\textsuperscript{17} Marie Y. Rigotti, “Mentoring of Women in the United States Air Force” (research paper, Air Command and Staff College, 1997), 1.
\textsuperscript{18} Rigotti, “Mentoring of Women,” 4.
and Training Command stated that, “The development of our people is second in importance only to mission...a mentoring program can help us to achieve this goal.” In addition, General Fogleman, the former Air Force Chief of Staff, said:

we’re going to develop a comprehensive game plan to institutionalize mentoring across the USAF. With the help of all interested parties, we can capitalize on mentoring to help ensure that the AF remains a ready team.

ACSC/AWC developed a formal mentoring program. It is a one-to-one program that pairs ACSC students with one or two pre-selected AWC mentors. Senior officers from AWC speak to a gathering of ACSC students. Later, after the presentation, the speakers and students discuss the merits and applicability of the concepts that were presented.

Another formal mentoring program was created by Air Force Reserve’s (AFRES) Junior Officer Leadership Development Seminar (JOLDS). JOLDS’s purpose is to provide officers with the tools to foster and maintain positive mentoring relationships.

Individual commands have created their own programs. The Air Education and Training Command (AETC) has a supervisor based mentoring program. AETC’s officer program focuses on providing career long mentoring to officers and USAF cadets in the area of professional development, officership, leadership and personal development.

There are also informal mentoring programs in the Air Force, such as spontaneous one-on-one mentoring that occurs at all levels. The Air Force has a biannual local Company Grade Officers Association’s shadow program in which company grade officers (CGOs) shadow senior officers. This permits the CGOs the opportunity to observe the work of senior leaders and to obtain exposure to senior leaders of the Air Force.

It is not easy to measure the positive effects of mentoring on individuals and their organizations. It becomes difficult to evaluate the effects of

20 Ibid., 29.
mentoring as individuals move from position to position, mentor to mentor, and organization to organization. In an AWC survey, the participants indicated that positive mentoring relationships had a significant effect on the career development of USAF professionals.21

E. CRITIQUE OF THE MILITARY’S PROGRAMS TO INCREASE THE NUMBER OF WOMEN

Despite the military’s attempts to institutionalize programs to increase the number of women, women’s opportunities are still limited. Some entire units, occupations, and skills are closed to women because they are direct ground combat units or collocate with such units. In both the traditional and non-traditional positions that are open to women, women are assigned on a restricted basis. Some occupations are open, but women can only be assigned at certain organizational levels. For example, women in the Army cannot serve as a field artillery surveyor, combat engineer bridge crewmember, or combat engineer senior sergeant at the organizational levels closest to the front. Other positions are only partially opened to women because the positions are attached to units that engage in direct ground combat.22

Another factor that precludes women from certain positions is the practice of coding gender neutral positions, so that it excludes women. It would be possible for a unit to fill a drill sergeant position, a gender neutral position, with a person with an infantry skill coding. A person with an infantry skill coding would be male since the infantry is a unit closed to women.

Finally, the decisions of some commanders could informally limit the opportunities for women. A common scenario in which commanders could limit the opportunities for women is one in which a male commander refuses to select a female driver or aide because of fear of rumors or of potential sexual harassment charges.

F. CONCLUSION

The mentoring programs institutionalized by the services to increase the number of women officers serve as models for the area of homeland security. Like the services, the area of homeland security, which is comprised of firefighters, law enforcement officers, emergency management officials, health and medical officials, is predominantly a male oriented world. The area of homeland security would be greatly benefited by increasing the pool of qualified individuals by identifying and nurturing the advancement of women leaders.

It is possible to migrate the successful programs implemented by the services to increase the number of women military leaders into the local public safety agencies. By creating successful mentoring programs where senior managers assist their mentees in a one-to-one situation, homeland security agencies can help nurture and advance the careers of women leaders.
III. THE IMPORTANCE OF MENTORING IN THE AREA OF HOMELAND SECURITY

The area of homeland security should encourage and expand the number of women and minorities in leadership positions within its domain. This chapter will explore the mentoring programs employed by the federal government, military and businesses to encourage and to expand the number of women and minorities in leadership positions. The military created mentoring programs to address the need to identify and encourage the promotion of women and minorities into leadership positions. Businesses in the private sector developed mentoring programs to facilitate the advancement of women and minorities in the workplace. This chapter will also assess whether these mentoring programs may serve as models in the area of homeland security.

A. THE NEED FOR DIVERSITY IN HOMELAND SECURITY

There is a need to increase the talent pool from which homeland security leaders are recruited due to factors such as the retirement of many senior leaders in the near future. There is a trend that senior leaders in the government will be retiring in the coming years and that the number of 35 to 44 year olds who are in positions to move into senior level jobs declined by 15 percent between 2000 and 2001.23 The global environment is also creating a need for an increasingly sophisticated workforce in which all employers will compete for competent and qualified workers. The military will need leaders who can manage cross-cultural competencies, and have the ability to lead and to manage complex disaggregated organizations and who possess technological literacy. The area of homeland security will have the same needs.

In the global environment, smaller and medium sized companies will also vie with larger companies for the talent pool. Smaller companies can offer opportunities and the potential for a faster career track and may draw more qualified workers.

Finally, the increasing trend of job mobility of Americans will impact businesses competing for a smaller qualified talent pool. In the past, Americans would stay with their employers for most of their careers and would rarely change jobs. However, it is estimated that the average executive will work for five companies in the course of his/her career. Since employers will be forced to spend more effort and money on recruiting well qualified managers and leaders, it will be necessary for employers to expand their hiring efforts to include a more diverse recruiting pool. In the military, one source for under utilized talent is women.

According to population statistics and projections, 50 percent of the approximately 42 million people expected to enter the workforce between 1998 and 2008 will be women. If this trend continues to 2025, the American labor force will become more female (48 percent of the available talent will be female versus 46 percent in 1988).

The number of women earning college degrees will increase by 18 percent by the years 2009-10 to 776,000. On the other hand, the number of college degrees for men is only expected to increase 5 percent over the same time to 547,000.

DiSilverio contends that the Air Force will need to include women because it can no longer fill its billets without women. Women comprise 18 percent of the Air Force—17.3 percent of officers and 19.5 percent of the enlisted force. The Air Force concedes that it could not recruit sufficient numbers of qualified men to fill the billets women currently occupy.

---

25 Ibid., 4.
26 Ibid., 5.
Research has shown that diversity in the private sector aids in increased productivity, reduction in operating costs, improved quality of management, and increased gain and retention of market share. Diversity in the area of homeland security would also aid in increased productivity and retention of qualified women and minority leaders.

B. BACKGROUND OF MENTORING

The origin of the concept for mentoring is derived from the character Mentor in Homer’s *The Odyssey*. In *The Odyssey*, Odysseus asked Mentor to care for his son, Telemachus, while Odysseus went to war against Troy. Mentor raised and educated Telemachus during the ten years that Odysseus was away. Mentor’s name has come to define persons that provide guidance and support to others with less experience.27

Gordon Shea’s book, *Mentoring: Helping Employees Reach Their Full Potential*, defines mentoring as “A developmental, caring, sharing, and helping relationship where one person invests time, know-how, and effort in enhancing another person’s growth, knowledge, and skills, and responds to critical needs in the life of that person in ways that prepare the individual for greater productivity or achievement in the future.” Gordon describes a mentor as “…anyone who has a beneficial life-or-style-altering effect on another person, generally as a result of personal one-on-one contact; one who offers knowledge, insight, perspective, or wisdom that is helpful to another person in a relationship which goes beyond duty or obligation.”28

In the 1980’s, mentoring became a very popular human services tool. It was used primarily to develop executive level personnel and to assist in succession planning. This type of mentoring focused on career advancement. The mentor acted as an advocate and as a protector. The mentors would place their mentees into visible positions throughout the organization. The mentors and mentees held coaching sessions and periodic one-on-one guidance.

28 Ibid., 10.
The drawback of a mentoring relationship is that it produced a “cookie cutter” effect. The mentees emulated the behavior and characteristics of their mentors, thus producing “…cloned look-alike, think-alike and act-alike managers” who were ineffective in dealing with the changing 1990’s workplace.29 Another drawback is that this type of mentoring too quickly identifies managers, but it overlooks those managers who are talented but who lack mentors. Employers will lose talented and hardworking employees. Employees who are not identified as potential rising stars will leave to find greater opportunities with other corporations.

C. MENTORING PROGRAMS IN THE MILITARY

The military examined the efficacy of mentoring programs as a response to statistical evidence that there were too few women and minorities holding leadership positions. In order to increase the talent pool for future leaders, the military implemented formal mentoring programs for women and minorities. In general, the branches of the military have both informal and formal mentoring programs.

The formal mentoring programs consist of protocols and procedures set forth in formal manuals. In the Army, the Battle Command Training Program (BCTP) is a formal mentoring program in which corps and division commanders participate in the BCTP mentoring process under the guidance of a retired three or four star general officer. The general officer/mentor provides feedback to the commander throughout the planning and execution phases of the process. When the division’s BCTP rotation ends, the mentoring relationship generally ends.30


In the *Air Force Mentoring* manual, the Air Force assigns commanders responsibility for promoting and developing formal mentoring programs within their units and assigns immediate supervisors, or the rater in the evaluation chain the responsibility of being the primary mentor (coach, guide, role model, etc.). The mentor’s duties include discussing job performance, potential, and professional development with the mentee. In addition, references and programs, such as *Air Force Officer Professional Development Guide*, assignment policies, performance feedback, PME, academic education, recognition and self-development plans assist the mentor in defining the mentee’s near, mid and long term personal and professional goals.

Air Force Instruction manuals provide a list of resources for the mentors and mentees to develop effective mentoring relationships. The Air Force also provides information on the internet for mentoring relationships such as checklists and individual development plans.

In 1991, the Coast Guard initiated a mentoring program after a leadership study found a direct correlation between mentoring and personnel retention. The Coast Guard mentoring program requires mentors to attend a five-day training program that is offered six to eight times a year for approximately twenty students. The objectives of the mentoring course are to:

1. Develop a broader understanding of the mentoring process;
2. Understand the importance of mentoring in the Coast Guard culture;
3. Identify mentor and Coast Guard needs in relation to the mentoring program;
4. Understand the mechanics and dynamics of establishing and maintaining a mentoring relationship; and
5. Become a mentor.

---

31 Harney, Jr., "Development," 43.
32 Ibid., 43.
33 Ibid., 44.
The course also provides information on mentor/mentee relationships, cross-cultural mentoring, interpersonal communications and group dynamics.34

In December 1999, the Navy created the “Junior Officer Mentoring Guide” to provide senior Supply Corps officers with a “ready tool box to help discuss and appraise career options with their junior Supply Corps officers.”35 The Guide provides guidance to senior officers on methods to help mentees decide whether to remain in the military or to pursue civilian careers. The senior officers have access to information such as pay, advancement, personal and professional growth, insurance, medical, dental, and retirement benefits to provide guidance to their mentees.

D. MENTORING PROGRAMS IN THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT

The U.S. Office of Personnel Management (OPM) monitors the mentoring programs of federal government agencies. OPM divides mentoring programs into three categories: supervisory, informal, and structure-facilitated mentoring. Supervisory mentoring is the day-to-day coaching and guidance that an employee receives from his/her supervisor. Informal mentoring is an unofficial pairing of individuals who voluntarily enter into a mentoring relationship. Structure-facilitated mentoring is the most formal type. It adheres to an organizational structure and timeline.

Many of the federal mentoring programs focus on recruiting and retaining minorities and women in the federal government by providing for significant assignments, mentoring, formal career development programs and formal education.

Katherine Naff in To Look Like America, Dismantling Barriers for Women and Minorities in Government recommends that hiring officials in the government should “ensure that women and people of color have access to mentors and career-enhancing assignments, rather than leaving this up to chance.”36 Nath recognizes the importance of career-enhancing assignments for women and

34 Harney, Jr., “Development,” 45.
35 Ibid., 45.
36 Katherine Naff, To Look Like America (Boulder, Co.: Westview Press, 2001), 99.
minorities, so that they will have the opportunity to demonstrate their competence and skills. Although there are many researchers who advocate the use of mentoring programs to enhance career advancement for women and minorities, only about one-third of governmental agencies utilize formal and informal mentoring programs.37

E. IMPORTANCE OF MENTORS FOR WOMEN IN BUSINESS

According to Mary Mattis, mentoring programs are a significant factor in the advancement of female senior leaders and middle managers in business.38

Women of color indicate that the primary barriers to their advancement is the lack of an influential mentor or sponsor; lack of informal networking with influential colleagues; lack of company role models who are members of the same racial/ethnic group; and lack of high visibility assignments.39 Women of color were more likely than white women to cite the lack of a mentor/sponsor as a barrier to advancement.

In research by Catalyst in a large multinational organization, it was found that male managers provide feedback differently to women than to men.40 When male managers evaluate men, they tend to spend more time discussing career paths with male subordinates. In this situation, male managers tend to informally mentor male subordinates and encourage them to develop strategies to position themselves in the company. The Catalyst study found this type of interaction was nonexistent between male supervisors and female subordinates.41

A CEO described the situation in companies:

There are pipelines and there are pipelines. There are these well-worn paths in companies. Certain beginning functional positions

---

37 Naff, To Look Like, 207.


39 Ibid., 374.

40 Catalyst is an independent, not-for-profit research and advisory organization with a dual mission to enable women in business to achieve their maximum potential.

are the beginning of these paths. Men understand what the informal career paths are, women don’t.42

The Catalyst study emphasizes the need for mentoring programs, both formal and informal, in assisting to identify and to promote potential women leaders.

F. IMPORTANCE OF MENTORS FOR WOMEN IN THE MILITARY

Since there will be a scarcity of senior leaders in the future, it is important to identify and nurture future leaders by expanding the talent pool to include women. According to Myers, less than seven percent of women serving in the Army are promoted to the grade of Colonel, while twenty-five percent of men are promoted to Colonel.43 The Army identifies from its higher ranks those individuals who will become strategic leaders, mentors, and role models who will set future policies. Since there is a dearth of women in senior leadership positions, there are less role models and mentors to promote future women leaders. The number of women in the work force continues to grow and their educational level has surpassed the levels attained by men, but this is not reflected in the number of women in senior leadership roles.

Research by the United States Military Academy supports the position that mentoring has a positive effect on professional development. The success of senior leaders is tied to initiative and experience with mentors who promote them. Women in the military may not have as much access to mentors as men because many males do not have experience working with women, particularly those that come from combat units. In addition, some men may not feel comfortable mentoring a female. There are very few senior women officers to mentor junior women officers and to create policy supportive of women officers.44 Leaders who have mentors are better educated, advance more rapidly and are more likely to assume the mentor role for others.45

44 Ibid., 10.
45 Ibid., 11.
G. APPLICABILITY OF MILITARY MENTORING PROGRAMS TO HOMELAND SECURITY

The area of homeland security is no different from the military and American businesses in its need to employ the best and most talented people. The area of homeland security should have access to a diverse and talented labor pool. Much like businesses, the federal government should also have a workforce that reflects the American public. In general, military mentoring programs have practical applications for the area of homeland security to identify, nurture, and retain women and minorities in leadership positions. As the number of current senior leaders in both business and in the government retire in the coming years, the need to identify and recruit will become more critical; therefore, it will be important to expand the talent pool by including women and minorities.

H. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTING A MENTORING PROGRAM IN HOMELAND SECURITY

The challenges of establishing a mentoring program in homeland security will be to convince senior leaders and other decision makers that such a program is important and will be meaningful. Senior leaders will have to communicate to their subordinates that participation in the mentoring program is encouraged.

Senior leaders can support, create and implement formal and informal mentoring programs. The formal mentoring program should vet potential mentors and mentees by creating a questionnaire for each group to answer. Based upon the responses to the questionnaire, mentors and mentees with similar interests and career experiences should be paired up. Mentors should be trained and should meet with their mentees on a regular basis. Ideally, some of the meetings should be in person as well as via telephone or on-line.

An informal mentoring process can be established in which one manager is willing to share his/her expertise with an employee who is less senior. Senior leaders may impart advice to junior members on the informal and unwritten workings and network of the agency. An informal program may also provide brown bag lunches in which senior leaders speak about their career progression. The senior leaders can discuss what successful factors or tactics that they
utilized in their career progression. After the discussion, senior leaders may make themselves available for a follow-up one-on-one meeting.

Some of the strengths of a mentoring program would be to promote and support women and minority leaders in homeland security. It would help to identify talent that may have been overlooked. By implementing a mentoring program, senior leaders would demonstrate a commitment to expanding the talent pool and to actively seek and identify new talent. Senior leaders could share their experiences and knowledge with junior executives.

The weakness of a mentoring program would be that there may not be buy-in from senior management. Without buy-in from senior management, employees will have little confidence in the efficacy of the program and will not see any benefit in participating. Male executives may be cautious about participating for fear of vulnerability to sexual harassment charges by women. There may not be enough senior women and minority leaders to act as mentors. Indeed, some women and minority leaders may not support diversity and will not act as mentors to others.

The opportunities that homeland security could derive from this mentoring program are the ability to select and nurture future homeland security leaders to fill positions that will be vacated by the retirement of senior leaders. Homeland security will benefit from new ideas and contributions resulting from an expanded talent pool. The inclusion of groups that are not well represented will aid the area of homeland security in that different views will be represented and that the needs of minority communities will be taken into account.

The obstacles of the implementation of a mentoring program are that senior executives may not support it. Furthermore, junior leaders may not participate in the program. Some talented junior women and minority executives may be overlooked and not given choice assignments by senior managers. Such junior woman and minority executives may become frustrated and seek career
opportunities elsewhere. There is a real threat that good and competent junior executives in homeland security may leave public service to seek employment in more fruitful venues.

I. EVALUATION OF THE SUCCESS OF THE MENTORING PROGRAM

Upon the institution of a mentoring program, a methodology to evaluate the effectiveness of the program would be to track women and minority mentees as they move through their careers. The women and minority mentees who utilize mentors would be monitored through a set period of time. The people who participated in the program would be compared to a control group of women and minorities who were not mentored. This study could be done on a local and state level, as well as the federal level, to determine the success of a mentoring program.

A mentoring program in homeland security will not yield results for years. Therefore, it would take some time before a study could be done to determine the effectiveness of a mentoring program.
IV. THE PSYCHOLOGY OF TERRORISM AND MINORITIES AND IMMIGRANTS

Another reason that it is important to expand the talent pool in the area of homeland security is because it is beneficial to have diverse faces to communicate to minority and immigrant communities during a disaster, emergency or act of terrorism. Communities of color have special needs during an emergency, disaster and act of terrorism because of cultural differences and language barriers. It is essential to prepare the public before the occurrence of such events.

A. MINORITY AND IMMIGRANT COMMUNITIES REACT DIFFERENTLY TO TERRORISM

Studies have shown that terrorism affects minorities differently. Minority, refugee, and immigrant populations may require further resources to prepare adequately for a disaster. After September 11, research indicated that Hispanics reported more mental health symptoms than whites. During a time of terrorism, minorities are more vulnerable and subject to attack by the majority and their access to resources is dissimilarly distributed. Historically, in times of national insecurity, minorities have been targeted as the enemy. For example, Asian American Vietnam veterans experienced race-related stress and trauma because they resembled the Vietcong. Furthermore, there are anecdotal reports that Hispanics were targeted and attacked because they were mistaken for Arabs after September 11.

Minorities have special needs during an emergency or disaster due to different cultural behavior and language barriers. In addition, immigrants have an


48 Ibid., 2.

49 Ibid., 2.
additional layer of special needs. Immigrants face greater barriers because they are not proficient in English, and also because of their lower socioeconomic status in this country. Immigrants may be unfamiliar with or unaware of community resources, or may be fearful based on previous traumatic experience. After the September 11, 2001 attack, East African immigrants reported that fifty percent of respondents reported feeling less safe because of their ethnicity or religion, sixty-five percent had less faith in the government’s ability to protect them, and sixty-seven percent worried about their immigration status. These beliefs color the perception of minorities and immigrants towards the government.

In past disasters and emergencies, minority groups have not received as much attention in terms of outreach and delivery of care. Minority groups have been more vulnerable to disasters and emergencies such as health emergencies. Some minority groups may be subject to social stigmatization due to a health emergency. During the SARS epidemic, Asian populations in the west were stigmatized. During the anthrax crisis, many African-Americans were at a greater risk because they were employed in postal offices in the Capital District area. Native Americans were at a greater risk for infection and were stigmatized during the Hantavirus outbreak.

A recent study conducted by the New York Academy of Medicine’s Center for the Advancement of Collaborative Strategies in Health found that few people would follow governmental instructions for smallpox and dirty bomb situations. The study found that only two-fifths of the American people would go to a vaccination site in a smallpox outbreak and that only three-fifths of the American people would shelter in place for as long as instructed in a dirty bomb explosion. The study found that this lack of trust is greater in Hispanics, African-Americans

50 Butler, Panzer, and Goldfrank, Developing Strategies, 113.
and those who are foreign born. These small numbers are attributable to minorities’ and immigrants’ distrust of instructions by the government.

In a smallpox outbreak, half of the American people and two-thirds of African-Americans would be seriously worried if they were told that the smallpox vaccine would be investigational. If the vaccine were investigational, only one-third of the population would not get the vaccine even if they were at the vaccination site. African-Americans are suspicious of vaccines based on negative past experiences such as the Tuskegee syphilis study.

B. LESSONS LEARNED FROM 9-11

In order to build trust and confidence with the public, the government should actively involve the public and minority communities in the development and testing of investigational vaccines. The government should also involve minorities in the emergency planning process to assure that policies for dealing with emergency situations are not discriminatory.

By an overwhelming majority, the people surveyed in the New York Academy of Medicine study indicated that they would want someone whom they know well to be trained in advance to give other people information and advice in an emergency. This response was even more common among African-Americans. This demonstrates the level of distrust of the government by minorities and immigrants.

In “Lessons Learned from a Program to Sustain Health Coverage after September 11 in New York City’s Chinatown,” a study by the Asian American Federation of New York, researchers identified several key factors resulting in residents’ decisions to enroll in a temporary health care program for workers in Chinatown after the terrorist attack on the World Trade Center. A major factor was the source of the information pertaining to the temporary health program.
The study found that the workers mainly relied on trusted friends, family, or co-workers for information. The workers thought these sources were more reliable and were the only sources for information about the health program. The workers did not have access to information distributed by the media. One participant said, “I do not usually read the newspaper, watch television or listen to the radio. The most effective outreach method is through sharing experiences among friends.”

The study indicated that cultural factors and language affect health care behavior. In New York City’s Chinatown, some people did not use the health care options that were available because of language issues. One participant stated, “I was not satisfied and had not used the service at all because we were limited to using the clinic in Queens. It was too far away and I did not know how to take a bus to get there. The staff in the clinic spoke to English only. So I paid to see a private doctor out of my own pocket.”

The cultural norms of the Chinese population affected the approach to treatment. Many participants relied on traditional Chinese remedies and cultural norms regarding treatment. Many participants utilized traditional Chinese medicine before they went to western doctors.

During disasters and emergencies, it is vital to have a crisis and emergency risk communication plan to communicate information to minorities and immigrants in order to mitigate fear and panic. A crisis and emergency risk communication plan should include sections on communications to immigrants and minorities.

C. CRISIS AND RISK COMMUNICATION PLANS

Crisis and risk communications plans must identify target audiences to whom information shall be disseminated during emergencies, disasters and acts of terror. The needs of special populations such as minorities and immigrants

---


58 Ibid., 10.
differ from the mainstream and must be given special consideration. Different cultures may seek help differently; have different perceptions about risk and different health behaviors. Before information is disseminated, the translation of the message should be checked before it is sent, since a literal translation may not translate accurately in another language.

The need for minority leaders in homeland security is crucial so that the special needs of communities of color and immigrants are considered and addressed. The expansion of minorities in homeland security would facilitate in creating trust and confidence within communities of color and of immigrants. Studies indicate that minorities and immigrants do not trust information disseminated by the government and will act more favorably towards information disseminated by family, friends and co-workers. If the public face of homeland security reflects the diverse composition of America, then the government can build a foundation of confidence and trust among minorities.
V. CASE STUDIES

A study was conducted on the career paths and obstacles of women in the area of homeland security by interviewing five women who are senior leaders. Their responses to the questions were similar. The women spoke of working in areas that are dominated by white males and felt that there was gender bias towards women. Some of the women described feeling the sense that they had to work harder to prove themselves to men. All the women felt that there was a need for diversity in homeland security, so that different and new views would be utilized.

A. CASE STUDY NUMBER 1

The subject of this case study is a woman who is the bioterrorism coordinator for her county. Her career path is one based on an interest in the area of science. The career path of case study number 1 demonstrates an upward movement from a biologist, epidemiologist, environmental health specialist, and an infectious disease epidemiologist to the position of bioterrorism coordinator.

Case study number 1 attributes her success to her interest in science and an unending curiosity, her willingness to take career risks and to tackle new areas. She is currently working on statewide plans. She brings to the state a local perspective that is beneficial. She also attributes her success to learning from each of her different jobs. She developed new networks. She also attributes her success to not becoming too complacent.

As for the topic of women and minorities in homeland security, she observes that there are very few women and that it is an area dominated by white males. Women must take pains not to be viewed as “cute” and must work harder to be taken seriously. It is her observation that women face hard sailing to get to the top in significant numbers in male dominated areas. She also thinks
that this is also true of minorities because they work in white male dominated areas. She attributes this phenomenon to the fact that people tend to hire people that are like themselves.

She believes that diversity is important in the area of homeland security because she is concerned that one type of people with similar views makes decisions that affect a broader spectrum of society. She says, “Diversity is the mother of all good ideas. There can be too many of one kind of voices—it is not possible to get buy-in without the acknowledging the importance of other people and different communities.”

As to the importance of increasing the number of women and minorities in senior leadership positions, she believes that it is important to bring to the table the concerns of people from particular groups. It sets a good example for the public to see that diverse groups of people are involved in homeland security because it demonstrates that not only one viewpoint and group dominate the area. It is a positive thing for the country to see diversity in the area of homeland security. It ensures that diverse communities are not minimalized and marginalized.

Currently, women do not have the opportunity to be in areas that feed into homeland security. The number of women in the areas of law enforcement, firefighting and emergency management is small. Most women in these areas are usually in clerical, non-policy making positions.

Case study number 1 has not encountered too many obstacles so far in her career. However, she has heard from other women that they have been treated condescendingly as “little women” by men on a regular basis. She believes that, as a female, one has to prove to men that one is good enough to be taken seriously. Conversely, for men from a traditional background, there is an assumption that they are competent. In summary, she believes that women have to do better than men.

As for the attributes of a senior leader, case study number 1 thinks that one should:
1. Have the ability to weigh consequences of his/her actions;
2. Have the ability to take risks;
3. Be tough, smart;
4. Have the ability to communicate and to get along with a wide variety of people;
5. Have the ability to promote various ideas;
6. Have a sense of humor;
7. Possess good people skills;
8. Be a big picture thinker; and
9. Be respectful of other’s ideas.

Case study number 1 describes her own leadership style as one in which she leads by example. She would not ask a subordinate to do something that she would not do. She is ethical and trustworthy. She promotes, empowers and encourages the growth of her staff. In general, her staff is happy to work for her. She has a low turnover rate and has a very loyal staff.

Case study number 1 recommends that in order to improve diversity in homeland security it is necessary for direction/model to come from the federal government. If it is not implemented or modeled from the top to the lower levels, the lack of diversity in this area will go unchecked.

B. CASE STUDY NUMBER 2

Case Study number 2 is a senior officer in Northern Command/NORAD (Northcom). Her responsibilities are liaison to the Department of Justice, including the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI), covering the areas of law enforcement and intelligence; weapons of mass destruction, mass immigration, border transportation, Coast Guard and Secret Service.

She has a Master’s Degree in Operations Research from the Naval Postgraduate School, specialized in air defense control and came to Northcom as a generalist. For her military career, she joined the Marine Corps where
women only constitute three percent to five percent of the corps. It is her sense that there is not much support for women among the senior leadership of the Marine Corps.

One of the impediments to the advancement of women to senior leadership in the military is the prohibition of the role of women as combatants. Case study number 2 thinks that this rule is applied arbitrarily. For example, she applied for an assignment to Iraq and the commanding officer made all the billets combatant billets and, therefore, all women were disqualified from going to Iraq. These types of incidents create great disincentives for women to stay.

In the exit surveys of women who are leaving from the Marine Corps, women tend to state that they are leaving for family reasons and not because of the work environment. The Marines do not have a mentoring program for women and there are no women mentors. Marine women do not want to be like Navy or Army women. The Marine generals want to close programs that are open to women, such as the bulk refueler positions where women are sent to the front lines. There is a lot of negativity from male Marines towards women who are in the front lines.

This negativity towards women in the Marines results in fewer women Marines. Most Marines do not view women as warriors. Women are not made to feel as if they are part of the team. There is a view that the Pentagon is the old boy’s network. As a result of not feeling like they are part of the team, women Marines tend to retire after their twenty years because there is no incentive to stay.

Case study number 2 has looked beyond the negativity because she likes the military. She enjoys the military structure and the athletic aspects in that she does not mind sleeping outdoors on rocks and the physicality of the job.

In the military hierarchy, there are fewer women and minorities the higher up one goes. The reason that there are fewer women and minorities in senior positions is not because they lack competence, but because they do not feel
appreciated. Case study number 2 says men in the military relate to her as a mother, wife or daughter. Some senior leaders have told her that she was similar to their wives.

Case study number 2 absolutely believes that there is a need to build a network of women and minorities. There should be an open discussion among the men. According to case study number 2, we need more women and minorities in senior positions because we need more thinking outside the. If it is all white men, then the focus is narrowed. When the leadership is the same, then innovation is stymied and discouraged.

An obstacle to advancement is that not enough women are in the pool, since the area of homeland security is a non-traditional field for women. The area of homeland security is heavily geared towards military and law enforcement. Also, the diversity of an area is dependent on leaders selecting people who are different from themselves and placing them into supervisory positions.

Another obstacle that case study number 2 pointed out is other women. Some women have the “queen bee” syndrome and will not help to advance other women, and could be an obstacle for advancement of other women. She would not go to some of the senior women for assistance but would go to male superiors because she found that men tended to be more helpful.

Obstacles to advancement in the military consist of the prohibition of women from combat positions. Case study number 2 said that “it is a minefield to go through to find a good billet.” Some women become frustrated with the glass ceiling and the lack of advancement and tend to opt out and leave the military. To counteract this attrition, she feels that a mentoring program would be helpful, and that it is helpful to have more women connected to the network.

At this time, case study number 2 does not think that there is any effort to have a diverse team. If there were incentives and direction from leaders at the top, then it would happen. The system is operating on a default mechanism where it is easier to go with the "bubbas", the old boy’s network.
Case study number 2 describes herself as a visionary leader rather than a
day-to-day leader. She looks at the broader picture. She is more comfortable
with a hands-on approach rather than being an office person. She leads from the
front rather than from the back.

In terms of leadership at DHS, she describes a successful leader as one
who can synthesize multiple sources of information and then can put all the
pieces together. A successful leader must be a hard worker who can access
different sources for information.

C. CASE STUDY NUMBER 3

Cases study number 3 is a successful female fire chief who has advanced
to be chief of department for her area. She is one of a handful of female chiefs of
department in the country. She was appointed chief of department in 1997 and
oversees a department of 644 people. As chief of department, she promulgates
goals, creates a budget to attain the goals and has a ten year strategic plan. She
provides leadership to keep people on track.

As to her own success, she does not attribute it to a particular strategy.
She has a good ability to bring people together and she is well organized. She
thinks that her ability to listen well and the fact that she is respectful to people
has contributed to her career success. In short, she advises, “Do your damn
level best.”

In terms of diversity, case study number 3 sees more women in DHS than
minorities. Women make up approximately three percent of the fire service. She
thinks that diversity would add to the area of homeland security. By not
increasing diversity, she thinks that a significant number of the population is left
out. Diversity would add to greater insight to addressing homeland security
issues. It would help to gain the confidence and trust of the general population. It
needs to be a stated goal from the senior leaders in homeland security.

An obstacle for the advancement of women and minorities in homeland
security is systemic. There are not enough women and minorities in the system.
Case study number 3 finds that women in the area of homeland security are in a
fishbowl. If a woman does well, then it is glorious. But, if a woman does not perform well, then the failure is viewed in a greater light than if a man had not performed well. She also acknowledges the effect of the good old boy network. She senses resentment with some guys because of a gender bias against women.

She describes the successful attributes of a homeland security leader as organizational, interpersonal skills, appetite for this area, the ability to digest a lot of material, and an understanding of different disciplines. As for her own leadership style, she is direct, patient, a goal setter and one who gets involved. She stresses team building and getting troubles out in the open. She allows everyone to have input. She also tries to contribute as much as she can.

She recommends that senior leaders in homeland security seek out qualified individuals to work on various groups and committees. She suggests that senior leaders actively seek to add diversity to the DHS working committees.

**D. CASE STUDY NUMBER 4**

Case study number 4 is the program director at a not-for-profit that provides grants to organizations for proposals to reduce the threat of bioterrorism and for research and development. The not-for-profit has given away $60 million in grants. She studies the field, reviews bioterrorism proposals and provides funding for the proposals.

She did not plan to work in the bioterrorism arena early in her career. After obtaining a PhD in Chemistry at Yale University, she thought she would become a science professor. She gave a talk at the not-for-profit and the not-for-profit offered her a job. She attributes her success to getting into the field early before it was recognized outside of the military. Prior to the emergence of bioterrorism as a field, she had developed a good network in bioterrorism, a field which formerly had not been recognized as important. Bioterrorism was a relatively a small field.

As for her career success, she credits her ability to work with people from different fields and cultures. She can build strong collaborations based on her
good interpersonal skills. She finds that her rigorous academic training is helpful for her career success. Her boss has been a mentor who has supported her and provided great guidance.

She notes the dearth of women and minorities in the meetings that she attends. In some instances, she is the only woman in the meetings. Her not-for-profit provided funding for citizen preparedness and bioterrorism. For the citizen preparedness and READY.GOV campaign, she worked with many women at the Ad Council. In general, there are not many women and minorities who apply as grantees.

As for diversity in homeland security, she believes that it is not just important in the area of homeland security but in many fields. She thinks that it is better to have a workforce that reflects the population of the country. A fair representation of the diverse people of this country should have a place at the table. She opines that “it is important that our leadership mirror the population of citizens of this country. Unfortunately, we are not there yet.”

As to the issue of the obstacles to women and minorities for advancement, she cites her experience on executive search committees. She believes that women add to a richer conversation and provide a valuable perspective. In order for search committees to take women and minorities seriously, the committee has to see several women and minorities as candidates. While some people may have biases, she generally thinks that most people are well meaning. Another obstacle is the fact that the first responder community is comprised of men.

For her own career advancement, she acknowledges that there were plenty of obstacles. She acknowledges the moral and intellectual support of her husband as a key element of her success.

Her recommendations for increasing diversity in the area of homeland security are to make sure that enough candidates are interviewed by a search committee and that emphasis is placed on mentoring programs.
E. **CASE STUDY NUMBER 5**

Case study number 5 is an African-American deputy chief who supervises several thousand court officers. She rose through the ranks and was promoted after court administrators noted her abilities to handle high profile court cases. After the attack on the World Trade Center, she helped form the Department of Court security which focused on emergency preparedness programs for court officers and the communities where the state courthouses are located.

Case study number 5 attributes her success to her drive, hard work, and her interpersonal and team building skills. She recognizes that one’s team is instrumental in making the leader look good. Her strategies for success are to bounce ideas off superiors and others. Her commitment to a team concept is key to her success. She prides herself on being a team player and a team leader. Most importantly, she does not let defeat keep her down. She learns from her setbacks and works to improve herself for the next time.

With respect to opening the door for more women and minorities, case study number 5 thinks that the area of homeland security would have a fuller picture if more women are included. She thinks that there are very few women in this area because of the political and governmental structures where department heads are male. Women are relegated to secondary or supportive roles. It is her perception that women are on the outside trying to “claw their way in.” It is her view that if women were in key positions, they would be more effective in getting the job done.

According to case study number 5, since women and minorities make up a good percentage of the population of this country, it just makes sense to involve women and minorities in the defense of this country. For example, the city of Atlanta had a female police chief who reduced the crime rate in the city. She thinks that the placement of women in key positions will bring different perspectives to looking at the issues in homeland security.
Case study number 5 thinks that ignorance on the part of men creates obstacles to increasing the number of women in homeland security. She believes that men do not think women are as capable as men.

Case study number 5 has encountered obstacles in her career path. For instance, she has not been given consideration for interviews, while individuals with less experience than her have been give job offers. In certain situations, she has felt that she has had to prove herself over and over again. She has felt that the attitude of the men in the workplace has been one in which they say, “She’s a woman; let’s see what she can do.”

Case study number 5 describes the attributes of a successful homeland security leader as one who has a national security affairs background; practical field experience; the ability to network with other agencies and the military; and someone who can bring agencies together. She thinks that a leader should be able to coordinate agencies to prepare for a disaster or terrorist attack.

Case study number 5 describes her leadership style as one that is progressing and changing. She is open, alert and aware and can be decisive. She gives out compliments and praise to her subordinates when necessary. She emphasizes her philosophy of teamwork.

Case study number 5 recommends that the area of homeland security needs to have an open process because of the good old boy club. It should be a competitive process in which the most qualified person is selected. In certain circumstances, job openings are not widely advertised and a person who would have been interested in the position does not hear about it until it is already filled.
VI. CONCLUSION

As discussed in this thesis, there are many tangible reasons to increase diversity in the area of homeland security. It is important that the public perception of the area of homeland security should include women and minorities in order to increase the talent and brain pool for homeland security. Since homeland security is in its infancy in the United States, in order to create confidence in the Department of Homeland Security and for its mission and its strategies, it should present a picture that is consistent with the increasing diversity of the United States. This is of critical importance in the minority and immigrant communities in which some of the activities of law enforcement and legislature have caused distrust of the government. For instance, during a chemical, biological or radiological disaster, the government will set up points of distribution for the people living around the affected area. Minority and immigrants may not respond to governmental directives because the governmental spokesperson may not have credibility with the minority and immigrant community.

In order to create diversity within the area of homeland security, it is necessary for senior leaders to support and encourage the advancement of women and minorities. Not only is it necessary for male senior leaders to support this concept, it is also important that female senior leaders provide crucial support. While mentoring programs are a part of a strategy, a sea-change in the established mindset of the men currently in leadership positions will have to occur. Areas that have been traditionally dominated by men and that make up homeland security such as the military, law enforcement, first responders and emergency management will have to actively advance and nurture talented individuals that are different from the established norm.

Academic programs could encourage this cultural change by admitting more women and minorities into their homeland security programs. Also, such programs could cultivate career opportunities for its graduates by networking with
potential employees and set up networking functions. It is recommended that the Naval Postgraduate School (NPS) set up an advisory committee comprised of women alumni who could act as ambassadors and speak to potential students to encourage them to enroll. The advisory committee members could also mentor enrolled students on the thesis and academic process. Furthermore, NPS could draw upon the expertise of its alumni by inviting them to return as guest speakers, or as speakers in conferences or an annual conference of alumni, or encouraging alumni to publish in academic journals. This could bring attention to the competent and qualified women and minorities in the area of homeland security.

It is hoped that this change in mind-set will facilitate more thought and attention to this area, since it is beneficial to expand the talent pool and the brain power in homeland security by increasing the number of women and minorities. As the laws and governmental strategies change in preventing, deterring and responding to terrorists and natural threats, it is essential that all members of the American society are engaged and all represented.
APPENDIX A. QUESTIONNAIRE

1. What career path did you take to come to your current position?

2. How did you become a leader in your field?

3. What do you attribute to your success? What strategies were successful?

4. What is your impression of women and minorities in the area of homeland security?

5. Do you think it is an important topic? If yes, why? If not, why?

6. Do you think there is a need to see more women and minorities in senior positions in homeland security? If yes, why? If not, why?

7. What do you think are the obstacles to the advancement of women and minorities to senior positions in homeland security?

8. Did you encounter or have you encountered any obstacles in your advancement? If yes, how did you deal with the obstacles? If no, why do you think you did not?

9. What attributes do you think a senior leader in HS should possess in order to be successful?

10. How do you describe your leadership style?

11. What recommendations do you have for increasing diversity in the senior leadership of homeland security?


INITIAL DISTRIBUTION LIST

1. Defense Technical Information Center  
   Ft. Belvoir, Virginia

2. Dudley Knox Library  
   Naval Postgraduate School  
   Monterey, California

3. Christopher Bellavita  
   Naval Postgraduate School  
   Monterey, California

4. Robert Simeral  
   Second Reader  
   Naval Postgraduate School  
   Monterey, California

5. James W. Tuffey  
   New York State Emergency Management Office  
   Albany, New York