Rainbow Smelt – Larval Lake Herring Interactions: Competitors or Casual Acquaintances?
Technical Report Series
National Biological Survey

The National Biological Survey publishes five technical report series. Manuscripts are accepted from Survey employees or contractors, students and faculty associated with cooperative fish and wildlife research units, and other persons whose work is sponsored by the Survey. Manuscripts are received with the understanding that they are unpublished. Manuscripts receive anonymous peer review. The final decision to publish lies with the editor.

Series Descriptions

Biological Report ISSN 0895-1926
Technical papers about applied research of limited scope. Subjects include new information arising from comprehensive studies, surveys and inventories, effects of land use on fish and wildlife, diseases of fish and wildlife, and developments in technology. Proceedings of technical conferences and symposia may be published in this series.

Fish and Wildlife Leaflet ISSN 0899-461X
Summaries of technical information for readers of non-technical or semitechnical material. Subjects include topics of current interest, results of inventories and surveys, management techniques, and descriptions of imported fish and wildlife and their diseases.

Fish and Wildlife Research ISSN 1040-2411
Papers on experimental research, theoretical presentations, and interpretive literature reviews.

North American Fauna ISSN 0078-1304
Monographs of long-term or basic research on faunal and floral life histories, distributions, population dynamics, and taxonomy and on community ecology.

Resource Publication ISSN 0163-4801
Semitrchnical and nonexperimental technical topics including surveys; data, status, and historical reports; handbooks; checklists; manuals; annotated bibliographies; and workshop papers.

Copies of this publication may be obtained from the Publications Unit, U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, 1849 C Street, N.W., Mail Stop 130, Webb Building, Washington, DC 20240 (call 703-358-1711), or may be purchased from the National Technical Information Service (NTIS), 5285 Port Royal Road, Springfield, Virginia 22161 (call toll free 1-800-553-6847).
Rainbow Smelt – Larval Lake Herring
Interactions: Competitors or Casual
Acquaintances?

By

James H. Selgeby, Wayne R. MacCallum, and Michael H. Hoff

U.S. Department of the Interior
National Biological Survey
Washington, D.C. 20240
Contents

Abstract ................................................................. 1
Methods ................................................................. 2
Results ................................................................. 3
   Abundance of Lake Herring Larvae and Rainbow Smelt .......... 3
   Abundance and Composition of Crustacean Zooplankton ......... 4
   Food and Feeding of Lake Herring Larvae ....................... 4
   Food of Rainbow Smelt ........................................... 6
Discussion ............................................................. 7
Cited Literature ....................................................... 9
Rainbow Smelt – Larval Lake Herring Interactions: Competitors or Casual Acquaintances?

by

James H. Selgeby

U.S. National Biological Survey
Great Lakes Science Center
Lake Superior Biological Station
2800 Lake Shore Drive
Ashland, Wisconsin 54806 U.S.A.

Wayne R. MacCallum

Ontario Ministry of Natural Resources
Lake Superior Fisheries Unit
Thunder Bay, Ontario P7C 5G6 Canada

and

Michael H. Hoff

U.S. National Biological Survey
Great Lakes Science Center
Lake Superior Biological Station
2800 Lake Shore Drive
Ashland, Wisconsin 54806 U.S.A.

Abstract. We examined the hypothesis that competition for food between rainbow smelt (Osmerus mordax) and larval lake herring (Coregonus artedii) was a cause for the declines of lake herring stocks in Lake Superior. We studied the diet of larval lake herring and of larval, juvenile, and adult rainbow smelt during 1974 in Black Bay, Ontario, where both species were abundant, and in the Apostle Islands Region, Wisconsin, where rainbow smelt was abundant but lake herring was scarce. No evidence of competition for food was found between larval lake herring and rainbow smelt. Spawning and hatching times of the two species were separate enough that most larvae of the two species did not occupy the study areas simultaneously. Juvenile and adult rainbow smelt were found with lake herring larvae, but their diets differed. Therefore, we concluded that rainbow smelt did not compete with lake herring larvae for food and that competition for food between rainbow smelt and lake herring larvae was not the factor that caused lake herring population declines in Lake Superior.

Key words: Lake herring, Coregonus artedii, rainbow smelt, Osmerus mordax, competition, Lake Superior.
Historically, more biomass of lake herring (Coregonus artedii) was harvested commercially from Lake Superior than of all other fish species combined (Baldwin et al. 1979), so this species probably also constituted more biomass than all other sport or food fishes in the lake. The rainbow smelt (Osmerus mordax) is not native to Lake Superior but invaded the lake around 1930 (Lawrie 1978), although the species was not abundant enough to support a commercial fishery until 1952 (Baldwin et al. 1979). Competition for food between rainbow smelt and lake herring has been implicated as the probable cause of lake herring declines in Lake Superior during 1949–66 (Anderson and Smith 1971), and collapses of lake herring stocks in the other Great Lakes followed increases in rainbow smelt abundance (Christie 1974). The circumstantial evidence that resulted after the invasion or introduction of rainbow smelt in other waters has led researchers to conclude that competition for food could affect the recruitment of lake herring. Because newly hatched larvae eat specific foods (Siebert 1972), they are vulnerable to starvation if competition for limited food resources is severe. Competition could be important in determining year-class strengths and could eventually result in severe reduction or elimination of a species.

Gordon (1961) concluded that rainbow smelt in Saginaw Bay, Lake Huron, competed for food with young fish of all species and the adults of some, although he did not study the diet of sympatric lake herring. Creaser (1927, 1929) also suggested that the abundance and diet of rainbow smelt might make them important competitors with lake herring. Anderson and Smith (1971) stated that food similarities between early life stages of lake herring, rainbow smelt, and bloater (C. hoyi) indicated that competition for food had a strong influence on the decline of lake herring stocks. Anderson and Smith (1971) found significant negative correlations and linear trends between Lake Superior lake herring and rainbow smelt abundance and between lake herring and bloater abundance. Anderson and Smith (1971) stated that the rainbow smelt was probably a more influential competitor with lake herring than was the bloater. Bloater and lake herring co-evolved and had apparently existed together for centuries. In the 1970's and 1980's bloater populations in Lake Superior declined greatly without concomitant increases of lake herring stocks. We doubt that the bloater was a major cause of the decline in lake herring stocks. No studies have been published that have demonstrated competition for food between larval lake herring and rainbow smelt.

To evaluate Anderson and Smith's (1971) conclusion that competition for food between rainbow smelt and lake herring larvae was substantial, we examined whether competition for food was occurring between rainbow smelt and larval lake herring that could affect the survival of the larvae and the year-class strength of lake herring. The objective of our study was to document the diet of larval lake herring and of larval, juvenile, and adult rainbow smelt to determine the level of competition for food between the species. The study was conducted in the Apostle Islands region of Wisconsin and in Black Bay, Ontario, during spring 1974. We selected Black Bay as a study area because it was the only portion of Lake Superior that still supported a large fishery for lake herring (and presumably a large spawning population) in 1974 (Selgeby et al. 1978). We selected the Apostle Islands area because it had formerly supported a large population of lake herring that had declined about a decade after the increase in the commercial fishery for rainbow smelt (Baldwin et al. 1979) and because this was one of the areas studied by Anderson and Smith (1971), who concluded that competition with rainbow smelt probably caused the decline in lake herring stocks. Lake herring spawning stocks in the Apostle Islands region were small in 1974 as the result of a sharp decline during the 1950's (Baldwin et al. 1979; Selgeby 1982). Rainbow smelt stocks were relatively large in 1974, as indicated by the increasing commercial harvest in Wisconsin waters—from 454 kg in 1949 to 214,095 kg in 1974 (Baldwin et al. 1979).

**Methods**

Sampling was done at dusk and dawn at two stations in Black Bay and at six stations in the Apostle Islands region (Fig. 1). Zooplankton sampling at each station in Black Bay consisted of a surface-to-bottom-to-surface (double oblique) tow with a Clarke-Bumpus sampler (number 10 mesh net). One 10-min tow with a 1-m² net about 0.5 m below the surface was taken to collect lake herring and rainbow smelt larvae, and three or four 10-min tows were made with a 4.8-m (footrope) otter trawl on the bottom to collect yearling and older rainbow smelt. Sampling at each station in the Apostle Islands region consisted of one double-oblique tow with a Clarke-Bumpus sampler and horizontal tows near the surface and at 10-m depth intervals.
to the bottom with a 1-m² net and 4.8-m trawl. All samples of lake herring larvae and most catches of rainbow smelt were preserved in formalin, although only subsamples of rainbow smelt were used when catches were large.

Sampling began in both areas within a few days after the ice melted. Sampling was done on 6–8 May, 13–15 May, 28–30 May, 11–13 June, and 1–3 July in the Apostle Islands region and on 25–26 May, 30 May, 9 June, 12 June, 19 June, 25 June, 6 July, and 11 July in Black Bay.

Food of lake herring larvae was determined as follows: Larvae were measured microscopically to the nearest 1.0 mm and were separated into 1-mm length classes. Fifty larvae in each length class, or the total in that class if less than 50 were collected, were selected from each sampling period. Stomachs were removed, opened, and examined for food. Presence or absence of food was noted for individual larvae, but food items were combined to form composites by 1-mm length class and by sampling period. Samples of food items, and of zooplankton collected with the Clarke-Bumpus sampler, were processed by identification to species (except that copepod nauplii and copepodids were grouped) and by counting totals or subsamples. Densities (number per cubic meter) of zooplankton and of rainbow smelt and lake herring larvae were calculated based on the volume of water filtered by the appropriate collection device.

Rainbow smelt stomachs were processed after measuring (total length in millimeters) and weighing (grams) each fish. The stomach was then removed and weighed, the contents extracted, and the empty stomach weighed. Weight of the contents was calculated by subtracting the weight of the empty stomach from that of the stomach with food. The contents of each stomach were examined microscopically. Average ash-free dry weights of individual organisms in the food were determined from intact organisms after drying at 100º C for 24 h and ashing at 550º C for 1 h.

**Results**

**Abundance of Lake Herring Larvae and Rainbow Smelt**

Lake herring larvae were collected during 6 May–7 July in the Apostle Islands region (Fig. 2) but only during 25–30 May in Black Bay. The sampling period with the greatest maximum geometric mean density in the Apostle Islands region was 28–30 May. The geometric mean density (±SE) of larval lake herring was high in Black Bay during the 25–30 May sampling period (1,260 ± 240/1,000 m³) compared with the highest mean for the Apostle Islands region (10 ± 1/1000 m³).

Rainbow smelt larvae were collected in the Apostle Islands region in small numbers on 11–13 June and in larger numbers on 1–3 July. In Black Bay, rainbow smelt larvae were first taken on 9 June, and they were abundant on 6 July. Thus, in the Apostle Islands region the greatest density of rainbow smelt larvae was found 2 weeks after the peak in larval lake herring abundance. In
Black Bay, larval rainbow smelt were not found simultaneously with larval lake herring.

Juvenile (age 1) and adult (age 2 and older) rainbow smelt were present in both areas throughout the sampling period. During rainbow smelt spawning, which coincided with the period lake herring larvae were collected, rainbow smelt catch-per-unit-of-effort (CPUE) was three times as high in Black Bay as in the Apostle Islands region. After spawning, substantial rainbow smelt mortalities occurred in Black Bay, and some rainbow smelt may have left the bay because CPUE declined to about the same level as in the Apostle Islands region. Average CPUE, over the entire study period, was about 40% higher in Black Bay than in the Apostle Islands region.

**Abundance and Composition of Crustacean Zooplankton**

The crustacean zooplankton of Black Bay was more abundant and diverse than that of the Apostle Islands region (Table 1). Total crustacean density averaged 9,080/m³ in Black Bay and 2,906/m³ in the Apostle Islands region. Ten species of copepods and seven species of cladocerans were found in Black Bay, whereas only six species of copepods and three species of cladocerans were found in the Apostle Islands region. No crustacean species were found in the Apostle Islands region that were not also found in Black Bay. In both areas, changes in zooplankton populations during the sampling period were related mainly to the life histories and seasonal cycles of the component species. Abundance of immature copepods in Black Bay declined during the first few days that lake herring larvae were present, but following that decline, and during the period larvae were still very abundant, immature copepods increased about 10-fold in abundance.

**Food and Feeding of Lake Herring Larvae**

Food and feeding of lake herring larvae were similar in Black Bay and the Apostle Islands region (Table 2). We interpreted our data on the proportion of larvae with food in their stomachs as an index of feeding behavior (Fig. 3). Some larvae began feeding shortly after hatching, probably within 1 day after hatching, as previously described by John and Hasler (1956). The proportion of larvae with food in their stomachs increased rapidly from 19% for 9-mm fish to 97% for 14-mm fish, after which length the proportion with food stabilized. This plateau either indicated that some larvae never began feeding or, more likely, that the interval for gastric evacuation was less than the interval between feeding periods. These data demonstrated that lake herring larvae did not pass through a critical feeding period of a few hours or days in the two study areas during 1974 because endogenous feeding overlapped with the initiation of exogenous feeding. Even at lengths of 17 mm, a small yolk supply remained, and all lake herring larvae had begun feeding before reaching that size. Hogman (1971) found that larval lake whitefish (C. clupeaformis) in Lake Michigan also began feeding before the yolk supply was fully utilized.

The diet of lake herring larvae was dominated by immature copepods. Copepod nauplii, immature
Table 1. Average density of crustacean zooplankton in Black Bay and the Apostle Islands region of Lake Superior during May–July 1974.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Taxon</th>
<th>Black Bay 25 May–11 July (no./m³)</th>
<th>Apostle Islands region 6 May–3 July (no./m³)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sample number</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Copepoda</td>
<td>Nauplii</td>
<td>3,387.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Immature Calanoida⁷</td>
<td>1,724.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult Calanoida</td>
<td>Diaptomus sicilis</td>
<td>113.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Diaptomus ashlandi</td>
<td>26.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Diaptomus minutus</td>
<td>185.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Diaptomus oregonensis</td>
<td>228.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Limnocalanus macrurus⁸</td>
<td>34.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Senecella calanoides⁸</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Epischura lacustris⁸</td>
<td>43.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immature Cyclopoidea</td>
<td>1,629.8</td>
<td>98.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult Cyclopoidea</td>
<td>Cyclops bicuspidatus thomasi</td>
<td>986.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cyclops vernalis</td>
<td>9.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mesocyclops edax</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cladocera</td>
<td>Daphnia retrocurva</td>
<td>254.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Daphnia galeata mendotae</td>
<td>96.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bosmina longirostris</td>
<td>332.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Leptodora kindti⁹</td>
<td>9.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Diaphanosoma leuchtenbergianum</td>
<td>10.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ctenodactylus gilberti⁹</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sida crystallina</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>9,080.2</td>
<td>2,906.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

⁷Does not include immature Limnocalanus macrurus, Senecella calanoides, or Epischura lacustris.
⁸Includes all copepodid stages.

Table 2. Food of larval lake herring during 6 May–7 July 1974 in the Apostle Islands region and Black Bay, Lake Superior.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Taxon</th>
<th>Apostle Islands⁹</th>
<th>Black Bay¹⁰</th>
<th>Apostle Islands and Black Bay</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total no. of food items</td>
<td>Percent of total food items</td>
<td>Total no. of food items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Copepoda nauplii</td>
<td>1,501</td>
<td>63.0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diaptomus sp. - immature</td>
<td>401</td>
<td>16.8</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unidentified Cyclopoidea</td>
<td>221</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Copepoda - immature</td>
<td>227</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notholca sp.</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limnocalanus macrurus</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daphnia sp.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diaptomus sicilis</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyclops bicuspidatus thomasi</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acroperus harpe</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unidentified Rotifera</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Polyphemus pediculus</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosmina longirostris</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>&lt;0.1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epischura lacustris</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>&lt;0.1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2,381</td>
<td>99.8</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

⁹1,000 stomachs examined from fish collected during May 6–July 7, 1974; 728 of the stomachs contained food.
¹⁰625 stomachs examined from fish collected during May 23–30, 1974; 143 of the stomachs contained food.
Diaptomus sp., and immature cyclopoid copepods composed 89% of the Apostle Islands lake herring diet during 6 May–7 July 1974, but these same taxa composed only 60% of the food items of Black Bay lake herring larvae collected during 23–30 May 1974. However, the rotifer Nototholca sp. composed an additional 33% of the food items for Black Bay larvae. Lake herring larvae 9–13 mm long ate more copepod nauplii than copepod copepodids (Fig. 4). The copepodids (about equally divided between young Cyclops bicuspidatus thomasi and young (D. sicilis) were, however, much larger than the nauplii and formed the bulk of the food. Lake herring larvae of these lengths also ate a few rotifers. Consumption of nauplii declined among lake herring larvae longer than 13 mm, while consumption of rotifers ceased and consumption of copepodids increased (a few immature Limnocalanus macrurus were eaten by larvae longer than 13 mm). Besides copepods, lake herring larvae ≥13 mm ate a few small cladocerans such as immature Polyphemus pediculus, Daphnia galeata mendotae, and Bosmina longirostris.

Food of Rainbow Smelt

No larval rainbow smelt collected during May in the Apostle Islands region, or in early June in the Apostle Islands region or Black Bay, contained food. Larval rainbow smelt collected in late June and July contained mainly copepod nauplii.

Food of juvenile rainbow smelt was similar across size classes, as was that of adult rainbow smelt, but food of these two groups differed. Food
items were pooled for 10-mm size classes within the two age groups.

We examined 1,711 rainbow smelt stomachs from the Apostle Islands region, of which 1,146 (67.0%) contained food that constituted an average of 0.51% of body weight. Juvenile rainbow smelt ate mainly adult *D. sicilis* (81.6% by number and 74.7% by weight; Table 3). Juvenile rainbow smelt contained food that constituted an average of 0.56% of body weight. Adult rainbow smelt contained food equal to 0.35% of body weight. Adult rainbow smelt ate fewer zooplankton food items than did juvenile rainbow smelt. *Diaptomus sicilis* was the most abundant organism eaten by adult rainbow smelt (54.3% by number), but the burrowing amphipod *Pontoporeia affinis* composed 82.1% of the biomass eaten.

During the period that lake herring larvae were present in Black Bay, we examined 1,195 rainbow smelt stomachs, of which 685 (57.3%) contained food that constituted an average of 0.79% of body weight. Juvenile rainbow smelt contained food that constituted an average of 0.69% of body weight. Juvenile rainbow smelt ate mainly the copepod *D. sicilis* (91.3% by number), but lake herring larvae composed most (66.2%) of the food biomass (Table 4). Adult rainbow smelt contained food equal to 1.54% of average body weight. Adult rainbow smelt ate mainly lake herring larvae, by number (69.4%) and weight (94.4%). Of the 685 adult rainbow smelt with food in their stomachs, 204 (29.8%) contained lake herring larvae. Twenty-three percent of the juvenile rainbow smelt (136 of 604) and 84.0% (68 of 81) of the adult rainbow smelt contained lake herring larvae. From these same data, Selgeby et al. (1978) examined the hypothesis that predation by rainbow smelt on lake herring larvae during 1974 was the major factor that affected lake herring stocks in either area.

**Discussion**

Nearly all of the lake herring larvae began feeding before the yolk sac was fully absorbed. Rainbow smelt spawned at about the same time that lake herring began hatching, and rainbow smelt larvae were first collected after the peak in the abundance of lake herring was measured. The temporal separation of the larvae of the two species was complete in Black Bay and nearly complete in the Apostle Islands region. Thus, competition for food between the larval of these fishes was almost nonexistent.

Although juvenile and adult rainbow smelt occupied the same areas as lake herring larvae, they ate different invertebrate species or life stages than did lake herring larvae. The food of larval lake herring in both study areas was composed mainly of copepod nauplii and larger immature copepods. These food items were not found at all in the stomachs of juvenile and adult rainbow smelt in either study area. Because the food items that dominated the diet of larval lake herring were abundant in both study areas and did not become scarce during the period of larval feeding, and because there was nearly no overlap in diet between the two species, we conclude that competition between larval lake herring and rainbow smelt did not affect year-class strengths of lake herring in the two study areas during 1974.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th><em>Diaptomus sicilis</em></th>
<th><em>Diaptomus ashlandii</em></th>
<th><em>Cyclops b. thomasi</em></th>
<th><em>Limnothrix macrurus</em></th>
<th><em>Senecella calanoides</em></th>
<th><em>Mysis relicta</em></th>
<th><em>Pontoporeia affinis</em></th>
<th><em>Chironomid pupae</em></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Juvenile smelt</strong>a&lt;br&gt;Percent by number</td>
<td>81.6</td>
<td>13.3</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Juvenile smelt</strong>a&lt;br&gt;Percent by weight</td>
<td>74.7</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>14.2</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Adult smelt</strong>b&lt;br&gt;Percent by number</td>
<td>54.3</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>23.5</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Adult smelt</strong>b&lt;br&gt;Percent by weight</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>82.1</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a1,301 stomachs examined; 844 of the stomachs contained food.
b410 stomachs examined; 302 of the stomachs contained food.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Lake herring larvae</th>
<th>Diaptomus sicilis</th>
<th>Diaptomus ashlandi</th>
<th>Cyclops b. thomasi</th>
<th>Limno- calanus macrurus</th>
<th>Mysis relicta</th>
<th>Pontoporeia affinis</th>
<th>Chironomid pupae</th>
<th>Ephemeroptera nymphs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Juvenile smelt</strong>a</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>91.3</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent by no.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent by weight</td>
<td>66.2</td>
<td>26.5</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Adult smelt</strong>b</td>
<td>69.4</td>
<td>21.0</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent by no.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent by weight</td>
<td>94.4</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>&lt;0.1</td>
<td>&lt;0.1</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a 1,058 stomachs examined; 604 of the stomachs contained food.

b 137 stomachs examined; 81 of the stomachs contained food.
In this analysis, we found that larval lake herring and rainbow smelt are almost completely separated temporally, and lake herring larvae consumed organisms that were abundant and were smaller than those fed upon by juvenile and adult rainbow smelt. Therefore, if competition exists for limited food resources between age-0 lake herring and rainbow smelt, that competition must occur after the larval stage of lake herring. Crowder (1980) speculated that rainbow smelt interacted strongly with lake herring in Lake Michigan, and he felt that predation by rainbow smelt on young lake herring may have been a more important mechanism than competition. If a negative ecological relationship indeed exists between lake herring and rainbow smelt, the cause of the relationship has been difficult to measure, cannot be predicted, or may be variable among waters (Evans and Loftus 1987). Therefore, further research is needed to determine whether the negative population trends between the two species in Lake Superior are the result of biotic or abiotic ecological relationships. We recommend that a study be initiated that will describe the level of competition for food between age-0 lake herring (postlarval stage) and rainbow smelt. The proposed study would further the knowledge of the ecological interactions between these important Lake Superior fishes.

Cited Literature


A list of current Biological Reports follows.


NOTE: The mention of trade names does not constitute endorsement or recommendation for use by the Federal Government.
U.S. Department of the Interior
National Biological Survey

As the Nation's principal conservation agency, the Department of the Interior has responsibility for most of our nationally owned public lands and natural resources. This responsibility includes fostering the sound use of our lands and water resources; protecting our fish, wildlife, and biological diversity; preserving the environmental and cultural values of our national parks and historical places; and providing for the enjoyment of life through outdoor recreation. The Department assesses our energy and mineral resources and works to ensure that their development is in the best interests of all our people by encouraging stewardship and citizen participation in their care. The Department also has a major responsibility for American Indian reservation communities and for people who live in island territories under U.S. administration.