REPORT NO. 1428

HARMONIC POLYHEDRA

by

John H. Glese
Česlovas Masaitis

March 1969

This document has been approved for public release and sale: its distribution is unlimited.

U.S. ARMY ABERDEEN RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT CENTER
BALLISTIC RESEARCH LABORATORIES
ABERDEEN PROVING GROUND, MARYLAND
Destroy this report when it is no longer needed. Do not return it to the originator.

The findings in this report are not to be construed as an official Department of the Army position, unless so designated by other authorized documents.
HARMONIC POLYHEDRA

John H. Giese
Česlovas Masaitis

Applied Mathematics Division

This document has been approved for public release and sale; its distribution is unlimited.

RDT&E Project No. 1T061102B14A

ABERDEEN PROVING GROUND, MARYLAND
ABSTRACT

A polyhedron of genus \( p \) is harmonic if the number of its faces (vertices) is the harmonic mean of its numbers of its edges and vertices (faces). The determination of all permissible combinations of numbers of vertices, edges, and faces is reduced to solution of Pell's equation. Realizations of all such polyhedra with \( p = 1 \) are described, as well as for all negative \( p \) with large enough numbers of edges.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. DETERMINATION OF HARMONIC TRIPLES</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. THE AVERAGE NUMBER OF EDGES AT A VERTEX</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. REALIZATIONS OF HARMONIC POLYHEDRA FOR ( p = 1 )</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. REALIZATIONS OF HARMONIC POLYHEDRA FOR ( p &lt; 0 )</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFERENCE</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DISTRIBUTION LIST</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
"The usefulness of considering lines, angles and figures is the greatest, because it is impossible to understand natural philosophy without these." -- Robert Grosseteste, De Lineis, Angulis et Figuris.

I. INTRODUCTION

Let V, E, and F be the number of vertices, edges, and faces respectively, of a polyhedron of genus p with simply connected faces. Then the Euler equation asserts that

\[ V - E + F = 2p, \]

where p is an integer less than two. If V is the harmonic mean of E and F, i.e.

\[ \frac{1}{V} = \frac{1}{2} \left( \frac{1}{E} + \frac{1}{F} \right), \]

we shall say that the polyhedron is V-harmonic. We shall also say that any triple of positive integers (V, E, F) that satisfies (1) and (2) is V-harmonic. Similarly, if.

\[ \frac{1}{F} = \frac{1}{2} \left( \frac{1}{E} + \frac{1}{V} \right), \]

we shall say that the polyhedron is F-harmonic, and that any triple of positive integers (V, E, F) that satisfies (1) and (3) is F-harmonic.

The cube, with p=1, V=8, E=12, F=6 is V-harmonic, and its dual, the regular octahedron, with p=1, V=6, E=12, F=8 is F-harmonic. We shall show that there are no toroidal (p=0) harmonic polyhedra. For other values of p the determination of harmonic triples reduces to the construction of solutions of a Pell's equation. According to well known algorithms for the construction of the complete set of solutions of Pell's
equation, for each $p \neq 0$ there are infinitely many $V$- and $F$-harmonic triples. For $p = 1$ we give simple constructions for examples of harmonic polyhedra corresponding to every harmonic triple with $V \equiv 4$. For each $p \leq -1$ we show that a natural modification of the constructions used for $p = 1$ will produce examples of all harmonic polyhedra of genus $p$ for large enough values of $E$.

II. DETERMINATION OF HARMONIC TRIPLES

Let $V_V$ and $F_V$ be solutions of (1) and (2) for $V$ and $F$ as functions of $E$ and $p$. Similarly, let $V_F$ and $F_F$ be solutions of (1) and (3). Then

\begin{align}
V_V(E, p) &= F_F(E, p) = p + 2E - D(E, p), \\
F_V(E, p) &= V_F(E, p) = p - E + D(E, p),
\end{align}

where $D$ satisfies a Pell's equation

\begin{align}
D^2(E, p) &= 2E^2 + p^2.
\end{align}

Note that by (6) $D$ and $p$ always have the same parity. Then by (4) to (6) $E$, $V$, and $F$ must be even.

For $p = 0$, equation (6) has only the trivial, irrelevant solution $D = E = 0$. Hence there are no toroidal harmonic polyhedra. For other values of $p$, the solutions of our Pell's equation are described at length in [1]. The discussion can be summarized as follows.

First, for $p = \pm 1$, all pairs of positive integer solutions $(D, E)$ of (6) are generated by the sequence
By forming the product of (7) and

\[ D_n + E_n \sqrt{2} = (3+2\sqrt{2})^n \]

we can immediately verify that \( D_n^2 - 2E_n^2 = 1 \). That (7) yields all desired solutions for \( p = \pm 1 \) will follow from our later discussion.

For \( p = 1 \) the first five elements of the sequence and the corresponding values of \( V \) and \( F \) have been listed in Table I. The entry for \( n = 1 \) is irrelevant for our purpose, since \( V \equiv 4 \) for all polyhedra.

Table I. First Five Harmonic Triples (\( p = 1 \)).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>( n )</th>
<th>( D_n )</th>
<th>( V = F_F )</th>
<th>( E_n )</th>
<th>( F_V = V_F )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>577</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>408</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>3363</td>
<td>1394</td>
<td>2378</td>
<td>986</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The entry for \( n = 2 \) includes the data for the cube and regular octahedron. Since the number of faces \( F_V \) or \( F_F \) is an increasing function of \( n \), it is apparent from the entry for \( n = 3 \) that none of the other regular polyhedra is harmonic. It is also clear from Table I. that none of the stellated regular polyhedra is harmonic.
From (4) and (5) we deduce that

\[ V_V(E, -1) = F_F(E, -1) = V_V(E, 1) - 2 = F_F(E, 1) - 2 \]

\[ V_F(E, -1) = F_V(E, -1) = V_F(E, 1) - 2 = F_V(E, 1) - 2 \]

which can be used to adapt Table 1 for \( p = -1 \).

Now, for any integer \( p \neq 0 \) let \( (D^*, E^*) \) be any pair of positive integers that satisfy (6). At least one such pair, e.g. \( D^* = 3|p|, E^* = 2|p| \), exists. With \( (D^*, E^*) \) we can associate the sequence

\[ D_n + E_n\sqrt{2} = (D^* + E^*\sqrt{2})(3 + 2/\sqrt{2})^n. \]

If we form the product of (8) and

\[ D_n - E_n\sqrt{2} = (D^* - E^*\sqrt{2})(3 - 2/\sqrt{2})^n \]

we immediately obtain \( D_n^2 - 2E_n^2 = p^2 \). If we refer (6) to rectangular coordinates with horizontal \( D \)- and vertical \( E \)-axis, a point starting at \( (D^*, E^*) \) in the first quadrant and moving upward along the right-hand branch of the hyperbola (6) will pass through the successive points \( (D_n, E_n) \) for increasing \( n \geq 0 \). Now we shall show that if the point moves downward along the same branch it will pass through the successive points \( (D_n, E_n) \) for decreasing \( n \leq 0 \). From (8) we find

\[ D_{n-1} + E_{n-1}\sqrt{2} = (D_n + E_n\sqrt{2})(3 - 2/\sqrt{2}) \]

for all integers, \( n \). If

\[ D_n > 0, \]
then

\[(11) \quad D_n = (2E_n^2 + p^2)^{0.5} \]

\[D_{n-1} = 3D_n - 4E_n = 3(2E_n^2 + p^2)^{0.5} - 4E_n \]

\[(12) \quad E_{n-1} = 3E_n - 2D_n = 3E_n - 2\sqrt{2E_n^2 + p^2}. \]

From (12) we find that regardless of the sign of \(E_n\)

\[(13) \quad D_{n-1} > 3/2 |E_n| - 4E_n \geq 0. \]

Hence, if \((D_n, E_n)\) is on the right branch of (6), so is \((D_{n-1}, E_{n-1})\), and by induction, all points \((D_{n-j}, E_{n-j})\). Next

\[(14) \quad E_{n-1} = 0 \]

if and only if

\[(15) \quad E_n \equiv 2|p| . \]

As a corollary, if

\[(16) \quad 0 \leq E_n < 2|p| , \]

then

\[(17) \quad E_j < 0 , \quad j \leq n-1 . \]

If (15) is satisfied, then by (12) and (14)

\[(18) \quad 0 \leq E_{n-1} < (3 - 2\sqrt{2}) E_n < 0.2 E_n . \]

Thus, as long as \(E_{n-j} > 0\) we have
(19) \[ 0 < E_{n-j} \leq (0.2)^j E_n. \]

Hence for some uniquely determined \( J \geq 0 \)

(20) \[ 0 < E_{n-j} \leq 2 |p| \]

and

(21) \[ E_{n-j} \leq 0, \quad j \geq J + 1. \]

By (12) and (21)

(22) \[ |E_{n-j-1}| > \left(3 + 2\sqrt{2}\right) |E_{n-j}|. \]

Hence \((D_n, E_n)\) moves downward on the right hand branch of (6) as \( n \) decreases.

In the light of what has just been proved, the complete set of solutions of (6) in the first quadrant of the DE-plane can be determined as follows. Select from the set of integers \( 0 < E \leq 2 |p| \) the subset \( \sum \) for which \( 2E^2 + p^2 \) is a perfect square. With each \( E^* \) of \( \sum \) associate the corresponding \( D^* = (2E^2 + p^2)^{0.5} \) and then use the pair \((D^*, E^*)\) to form the sequence (8) for \( n \geq 0 \).

For \( p = \pm 1 \), the subset \( \sum \) consists of the single value \( E = 2 \).

For any \( p \neq 0 \), \( D^* = 3 |p|, \ E^* = 2 |p| \) satisfies (6), so \( \sum \) is always non vacuous. The following example shows that for certain choices of \( p \) the set \( \sum \) may have two or more elements. If we rewrite (6) in the form

(23) \[ D^2 - p^2 = 2E^2 \]

then the choice

(24) \[ E = 2^r n \]

12
where \( N \) is odd, allows various possibilities for the factors \( D \pm |p| \) that yield

\[
D = 2^{s-1}N^2 + 2^{2r-s},
\]

\((25)\)

\[
|p| = 2^{s-1}N^2 - 2^{2r-s}, \quad 1 \leq s \leq 2r.
\]

We can guarantee \( p < -1 \) and \( E < -2p \) by taking

\[
N \geq 2^{r-s}(1 + \sqrt{3}).
\]

Another set of choices for \( D \pm |p| \) yields

\[
D = \left(2^{s-1} + 2^{2r-s}\right)N,
\]

\((27)\)

\[
|p| = \left(2^{s-1} - 2^{2r-s}\right)N. \quad r < s \leq 2r.
\]

III. THE AVERAGE NUMBER OF EDGES AT A VERTEX

Strong indications of the structure of harmonic polyhedra can be determined from bounds on the average number of edges at a vertex, \( A(E) \), defined by

\[
A(E) = \frac{V(E)}{2E} = 2E.
\]

For \( V \)-harmonic polyhedra we must have

\[
\frac{1}{A_V(E)} = \frac{V_V(E)}{2E} = 1 + p\frac{(2E^2 + p^2)^{0.5}}{2E}
\]

by (4). Then

\[
\frac{d}{dE}\left(\frac{1}{A_V}\right) = -p \left[\left(2E^2 + p^2\right)^{0.5} - p\right]/2E^2 \left(2E^2 + p^2\right)^{0.5}
\]
implies that $A_V(E)$ is an increasing (decreasing) function of $E$ for $p = 1(p < 0)$. Furthermore

$$\lim_{E \to \infty} A_V(E) = 2 + \sqrt{2}.$$  

According to Table I, $E \geq 12$ for $p = 1$. But then $A_V(12) = 13$. Thus

$$3 \leq A_V(E) < 2 + \sqrt{2} < 3.42, \quad p = 1.$$  

For $p < 0$ we have

$$A_V(-12p) = 4.$$  

Thus

$$3.4 < 2 + \sqrt{2} < A_V(E) \leq 4, \quad E \leq -12p, \quad p < 0.$$  

For F-harmonic polyhedra we have

$$\frac{1}{A_F(E)} = \frac{V_F}{2E} = \left[ \left( 2E^2 + p^2 \right)^{0.5} + p - E \right] / 2E$$  

by (5). Then

$$\frac{d}{dE} \left( \frac{1}{A_F} \right) = -p \left[ \left( 2E^2 + p^2 \right)^{0.5} + p \right] / 2E^2 \left( 2E^2 + p^2 \right)^{0.5}.$$  

14
implies that $A_F(E)$ is an increasing (decreasing) function for $p = 1(p < 0)$. Furthermore

$$\lim_{E \to \infty} A_F(E) = 2(1 + \sqrt{2}).$$

According to Table I, $E \geq 12$ for $p = 1$. But then $A_F(12) = 4$.

Thus

$$(32) \quad 4 \leq A_F(E) \leq 2(1 + \sqrt{2}) < 4.84, \quad p = 1.$$

For $p < 0$ we have

$$A_F(-12p) = 6, \quad A_F(-70p) = 5.$$

Thus

$$(33) \quad 4.8 < 2(1 + \sqrt{2}) < A_F(E) \leq 5, \quad E \geq -70p, \quad p < 0.$$

IV. REALIZATIONS OF HARMONIC POLYHEDRA FOR $p = 1$.

The inequalities (29) for $V$-harmonic polyhedra suggest that we begin our search for examples by constructing a polyhedron with the appropriate numbers of vertices and three edges at each vertex. A prism, $P(n, 0)$, with two congruent regular $n$-gons as horizontal bases and $n$ congruent squares as vertical faces has the desired property. Now let us modify $P(n, 0)$ by drawing one diagonal in each
of \( r \) successive square faces. This suggests that by slightly displacing \( r \) successive vertices of the upper base to new positions in its plane we can replace \( r \) square faces of \( P(n, 0) \) by \( 2r \) triangular faces with \( r \) additional edges. In this way we can construct a set of polyhedra, \( P(n, r) \), for \( 3 \leq n \) and \( 0 \leq r \leq n \) for which

\[
V = 2n, \quad E = 3n + r, \quad F = n + r + 2.
\]

(34)

Note that \( 3 \leq 2E/V = 3 + r/n \leq 4 \). For the values (34) let

\[
f(n, r) = 0.5(1/E + 1/F) - 1/V.
\]

Then in particular,

\[
f(n, 0) = (n-4)/6n(n+2).
\]

According to Table I, \( V = 2n \geq 8 \). Hence

\[
f(n, 0) \geq 0, \quad n \geq 4.
\]

On the other hand

\[
f(n, n) = -(n+3)/8n(n+1) < 0.
\]

Furthermore, for fixed \( n \), \( f(n, r) \) is a strictly decreasing function of \( r \).

Thus, if we choose for \( V = 2n_o \) one of the possible values that occurs in a \( V \)-harmonic triple for \( p=1 \), then the equation

\[
f(n_o, r_o) = 0
\]

has a unique integer solution, \( r_o \), such that \( 0 \leq r_o \leq n_o \). Hence \( P(n_o, r_o) \) is \( V \)-harmonic.
Note that \( P(4, 0) \) is a cube.

Since the simplest \( F \)-harmonic polyhedron is a double pyramid, let us seek other examples by generalizing this observation. First suppose \( V = 2n + 2 \) for an \( F \)-harmonic triple. Then let \( q_0 \) be the vertex of a pyramid which has as its base a regular \( 2n \)-gon with vertices \( q_1, q_2, \ldots, q_{2n} \). For simplicity let all triangular faces of the pyramid be congruent isosceles triangles. Now construct a second pyramid with vertex \( q_{2n+1} \) and with the \( r \)-sided polygon \( q_1q_2q_3 \ldots q_rq_1 \) as a base. For convenience let \( q_0 \) and \( q_{2n+1} \) be on opposite sides of the common plane of the bases of both pyramids. If \( r = 2n \), let \( Q(n, 2n) \) be the union of our two pyramids. If \( 3 \leq r < 2n \) adjust the choice of \( q_{2n+1} \) so that the plane \( q_{2n+1}q_1 \) will intersect each of the segments \( q_0q_j \) at an interior point \( q_j' \), for \( r+1 \leq j \leq 2n \). Then \( q_0q_1' \ldots q_rq_{r+1}' \ldots q_{2n}q_{2n+1} \) are the vertices of a polyhedron \( Q(n, r) \) for \( n \geq 2 \) and \( 3 \leq r < 2n \). For \( r \leq 2n \), \( Q(n, r) \) has

\[
V = 2n+2, \quad E = 4n+r, \quad F = 2n+r.
\]

Note that \( q_0q_rq_{r+1} \ldots q_{2n}q_0 \) is one of the faces of \( Q(n, r) \). Also note that

\[
\frac{4n+3}{n+1} \leq \frac{2E}{V} = \frac{8n+2r}{2n+2} \leq \frac{6n}{n+1},
\]

which for \( n \geq 5 \) covers the range required by the inequalities (32).

For the values (36) let

\[
g(n, r) = \frac{1}{2} \left( \frac{1}{V} + \frac{1}{E} \right) - \frac{1}{F}.
\]

For fixed \( n \) and \( r \geq 3 \), \( g(n, r) \) is an increasing function of \( r \), since
\[ \frac{\partial g}{\partial r} > 0. \] Now

\[ g(n, 3) = \frac{(3-n^2)}{4(n+1)(2n+3)(4n+3)} < 0 \]

for \( n \geq 2 \), and

\[ g(n, 2n) = \frac{(n-2)}{12n(n+1)} \leq 0 \]

if \( n \geq 2 \). Hence, if we choose

\[ V = 2n_0 + 2 = V_F \]

for any \( F \)-harmonic triple \( (p = 1) \), then the equation

\[ g(n_0, r_0) = 0 \]

will have a unique integer solution, \( r_0 \), such that \( 3 < r_0 \leq 2n_0 \).

Hence \( Q(n_0, r_0) \) will be \( F \)-harmonic.

Note that \( Q(2, 4) \) is a regular octahedron.

V. REALIZATIONS OF HARMONIC POLYHEDRA FOR \( p < 0 \).

The constructions of topologically spherical harmonic polyhedra described in Section 4 can be modified as follows to produce spheres with \( 1-p \) handles. For a \( V \)-harmonic triple, let \( V = 2n \). Let us begin by constructing a prism \( P(N, 0) \), of the type described in Section 4, with

\[ N = n - 4(1-p) \].

Now let \( d_u \) be an arbitrary diagonal of the upper base of \( P(N, 0) \) that connects two non-consecutive vertices, and let \( d_1 \) be the orthogonal projection of \( d_u \) onto the lower base. Now cut 1-p congruent non-intersecting prismatic holes, with square cross-sections and vertical, rectangular walls in \( P(N, 0) \). If the square cross-section is small
enough, we can place each of these shafts so that a diagonal of its upper (lower) square boundary lies on $d_u(d_l)$. If we delete these diagonal segments, then $2 - p$ segments of $d_u(d_l)$ remain. Now in each of $r$ of our $n$ vertical faces draw a diagonal. In this way we have produced a net with

$$V = 2n, \ E = 3n + 2(2-p) + r, \ F = n + 4 + r.$$  

If we hinge the upper and lower bases of $P(N, 0)$ along $d_u$ and $d_l$ slightly close the hinges, and slightly displace suitable vertices, we shall produce a polyhedron $P(n, p, r)$ for which (39) holds. Note that

$$2E/V = 3 + \left[ r + 2(2-p) \right]/n$$

so for $0 \leq r \leq n$

$$3 + 2(2-p)/n \leq 2E/V \leq 4 + 2(2-p)/n.$$  

The interval (40) will include the interval (31) if

$$n > 2(\sqrt{2} + 1)(2-p) > 13.5 - 6.7p.$$  

For the values (39) let

$$f(n, p, r) = 1/2(1/E + 1/F) - 1/V.$$  

Then

$$f(n, p, 0) = \left[ n^2 - 8n - 8(2-p) \right]/2n(n+4)\left[ 3n + 2(2-p) \right].$$

For $p < 0$ and $n = 2(\sqrt{2} + 1)(2-p)$

$$f(n, p, 0) > 0$$

because its numerator has the value $-4(3+2\sqrt{2})p(2-p) > 0$. 

19
For $n \geq 8$, $f(n, p, 0)$ is an increasing function of $n$. Hence (41) implies
\[ f(n, p, 0) > 0, \quad p \leq -1. \]

On the other hand,
\[ f(n, p, n) = -\left[ \frac{n^2 + (8-p)n + 4(2-p)}{4n(n+2)(2n+2-p)} \right] < 0. \]

Furthermore, $f(n, p, r)$ is a decreasing function of $r$ for $0 \leq r \leq n$. Thus, if we choose for $V = 2n_0$ one of the possible values that occurs in a $V$-harmonic triple for some specified $p_0 < 0$, and if $n_0$ and $p_0$ satisfy (41), then the equation
\[ f(n_0, p_0, r) = 0 \]
has a unique integer solution $r = r_0$ such that $0 \leq r_0 \leq n_0$. Hence $P(n_0, p_0, r_0)$ is $V$-harmonic.

For an $F$-harmonic triple with $p \leq -1$ let $V = 2n+2$. Let us begin by constructing a polyhedron of the type $Q(N, r)$ described in Section 4 for
\[ N = n - 4(1-p). \]

If $r \geq 4$, $Q(N, r)$ has six triangular faces $q_o q_j q_{j+1}$ and $q_{2n+1} q_j q_{j+1}$ for $1 \leq j \leq 3$, which we shall first modify as follows. Let $q_2^*, q_3^*, q_2^+$, and $q_3^+$ be interior points of the segments $q_o q_2$, $q_o q_3$, $q_{2n+1} q_2$, and $q_{2n+1} q_3$ chosen so that $q_2^* q_3^*$ and $q_2^* q_3^+$ are parallel to $q_2 q_3$. Now displace $q_2$ slightly outward along the line $q_1 q_2$ to a new location $q_2'$, and displace $q_3$ outward along $q_4 q_3$ to $q_3'$. Since $q_1, q_2, q_3, q_4$ are coplanar, $q_2'$ and $q_3'$ will also be in the same plane. Let us choose $q_3'$
so that $q_2'q_3'$ is parallel to the original segment $q_2q_3$. By these changes we have determined a new polyhedron $Q^*(N,r)$ which differs from the original polyhedron $Q(N,r)$ to the extent that two vertices have been moved and four vertices have been added, with the following consequences for the set of six triangular faces mentioned above. The four "outer" triangles have been replaced by plane quadrilaterals, e.g. $q_0q_1q_2$ by $q_0q_1q_2'q_2^*$. The two "inner" triangles have been replaced by two smaller triangles and two trapezoids, e.g. $q_0q_2q_3$ by $q_0^*q_2^*q_3^*$ and $q_2^*q_3^*q_3'q_2'$. Thus the numbers of vertices, edges, and faces have been increased by amounts

(44) $\Delta V = 4, \Delta E = 6, \Delta F = 2$.

Now cut $1-p$ congruent non-intersecting prismatic holes with square cross-sections in $Q^*(N,r)$. If the square cross-section is small enough we can cause a pair of opposite long parallel edges of each hole to intersect both $q_2^*q_3^*$ and $q_2^+q_3^+$. In this way we break each of these segments into $2-p$ segments and "scallop" one edge of each of $q_0^*q_2^*q_3^*, q_2^*q_2^*q_3^*, q_{2n+1}^+q_2^+q_3^+, q_2^+q_2^+q_3'$. We have also added $4(1-p)$ faces to produce a polyhedron $Q(n,p,r)$ for which by (36), (43) and (44)

(45) $V = 2n + 6, E = 4n + 2p + r + 4, F = 2n + 4p + r - 2$

for $4 \leq r \leq 2n$, where the value of $E$ is most conveniently confirmed by use of (1). Note that

$2E/V = (4n+r+2p)/(n+3)$,
so that for \( 4 \leq r \leq 2n \)

\[(46) \quad (4n+4+2p)/(n+3) \leq 2E/V \leq (6n+2p)/(n+3). \]

For \( p < 0 \) the lower bound in (46) is always less than 4. The upper bound will be at least 5 for

\[(47) \quad n \geq 15 - 2p. \]

Hence, when (47) holds, the interval (46) contains the interval (33).

For the values (45) let

\[(48) \quad g(n, p, r) = \frac{1}{V+1/E} - 1/F. \]

Note that (47) implies

\[\partial g(n, p, r)/\partial r > 0 \quad \text{for} \quad r \geq 0, \]

i.e. \( g \) is an increasing function of \( r \) for the combinations of \( n, p, \) and \( r \) that interest us.

Now

\[ g(n, p, 4) = \left[ -n^2 + (5p-17)n + 2p^2 + 10p - 10 \right]/4(n+3)(n+2p+2)(2n+p+4). \]

For \( n > 0 \) the numerator is a decreasing function of \( n \). For

\[ n \geq -2p \]

the numerator is no greater than

\[ -12p^2 + 44p - 10 < -12 - 44 - 10 = -66. \]

Since for \( n \geq -2p \) the denominator is positive, then

\[ g(n, p, 4) < 0. \]
On the other hand

\[ g(n, p, 2n) = \left[ \frac{2n^2 + 8(p-2)n + 2p^2 + 3p - 17}{4(n+3)(2n+2p-1)(3n+p+2)} \right]. \]

For \( n \geq 8 - 4p \) the numerator is an increasing function of \( n \), and the denominator is positive. For

(49) \[ n = 10 - 5p \]

the numerator has the value

\[ 23 - 37p + 12p^2 > 0, \]

and then

\[ g(n, p, 2n) > 0. \]

Hence if for some \( p = p_0 \) we consider any \( F \)-harmonic triple \( V = 2n_0 + 2 \) with large enough \( n_0 \), the equation

\[ g(n_0, p_0, r_0) = 0 \]

will have a unique integer solution \( r_0 \) such that \( 4 \leq r_0 < 2n_0 \). Hence \( Q(n_0, p_0, r_0) \) is \( F \)-harmonic.
REFERENCE

DISTRIBUTION LIST

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of Copies</th>
<th>Organization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Commander</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Defense Documentation Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTN: TIPCR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cameron Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alexandria, Virginia 22314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Commanding General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>U.S. Army Materiel Command</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTN: AMCRD-TE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Washington, D.C. 20315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Commanding General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>U.S. Army Materiel Command</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTN: AMCRD-TP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Washington, D.C. 20315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Commanding General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>U.S. Army Missile Command</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTN: AMSMI-AML</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Redstone Arsenal, Alabama 35809</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Commanding Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>U.S. Army Mobility Equipment Research and Development Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTN: Tech Docu Ctr, Bldg 315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fort Belvoir, Virginia 22060</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Commanding General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>U.S. Army Munitions Command</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTN: AMSMU-A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dover, New Jersey 07801</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Commander</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>U.S. Naval Air Systems Command</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTN: AIR-604</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Washington, D.C. 20360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Commander</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>U.S. Naval Ordnance Systems Command</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTN: ORD-9132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Washington, D.C. 20360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Commander</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>U.S. Naval Weapons Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTN: Code 753, Tech Lib</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>China Lake, California 93555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Commander</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>U.S. Naval Ord Lab</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTN: 730 Lib</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Silver Spring, Maryland 20910</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Chief of Staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTN: CSAVCS-W-TIS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Department of the Army</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Washington, D.C. 20310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Commanding Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>U.S. Army Research Office (Durham)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTN: Lib</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Box CM, Duke Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Durham, North Carolina 27706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>U.S. Army Mathematical Research Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Wisconsin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTN: Dr. J. Barkley Rosser</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Madison, Wisconsin 53706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Computing Science Research Dept</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bell Telephone Laboratories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTN: Dr. Richard W. Hamming</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Murray Hill, New Jersey 07971</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>IBM, T.J. Watson Research Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTN: Dr. Herman Goldstine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P.O. Box 218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yorktown Heights, N.Y. 10598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Dept. of Statistics and Computer Sciences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Delaware</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTN: Prof. David Lamb</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Newark, Delaware 19711</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

25
DISTRIBUTION LIST

No. of Copies Organization

1 Dept. of Statistics and Computer Sciences
   University of Delaware
   ATTN: Prof. Russell Remage
   Newark, Delaware 19711

1 Moore School of Electrical Engineering
   University of Pennsylvania
   ATTN: Prof. J. W. Carr III
   Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19104

1 Computer Science Dept.
   University of Wisconsin
   ATTN: Prof. Donald Greenspan
   Madison, Wisconsin 53706

Aberdeen Proving Ground

   Ch, Tech Lib
   Air Force Ln Ofc
   Marine Corps Ln Ofc
   Navy Ln Ofc
   CDC Ln Ofc