NEW LIMITATION CHANGE

TO
Approved for public release, distribution unlimited

FROM
Distribution authorized to U.S. Gov’t. agencies and their contractors; Administrative/Operational Use; APR 1953. Other requests shall be referred to Air Force Wright Air Development Center, Wright-Patterson AFB, Oh 45433.

AUTHORITY
afwal ltr, 17 apr 1980

UNCLASSIFIED
STUDIES ON THERMAL STRESSES
FOR
AIRCRAFT STRUCTURES EXPOSED TO TRANSIENT EXTERNAL HEATING

VOLUME I
EVALUATION OF THE THERMAL RESPONSE, FORCE AND MOMENT IN A PLATE

J. E. Mahlmeister
T. Ishimoto
A. Ambrosio

University of California
Department of Engineering
Los Angeles, California

April 1955

WRIGHT AIR DEVELOPMENT CENTER
STUDIES ON THERMAL STRESSES
FOR
AIRCRAFT STRUCTURES EXPOSED TO TRANSIENT EXTERNAL HEATING

VOLUME I
EVALUATION OF THE THERMAL RESPONSE, FORCE AND MOMENT IN A PLATE

J. E. Mahlmeister
T. Ishimoto
A. Ambrosio

University of California
Department of Engineering
Los Angeles, California

April 1955

Aircraft Laboratory
Contract No. AF 33(616)-293
Project No. 1350

Wright Air Development Center
Air Research and Development Command
United States Air Force
Wright-Patterson Air Force Base, Ohio
FOREWORD

This report was prepared by J. E. Mahlmeister, T. Ishimoto, and A. Ambrosio of the Department of Engineering, University of California, Los Angeles, under Contract No. AF 33(616)-293. The contract was initiated under Project No. 1350, "Effects of Atomic Weapons on Aircraft Systems," and was administered by the Aircraft Laboratory, Directorate of Laboratories, Wright Air Development Center, with Lt. Joseph W. Saylor, Jr. acting as Project Engineer.

Alphonso Ambrosio directed and was technically responsible for the research described in this report and Walter C. Hurty acted as the representative of the Chairman of the Department, L.M.K. Boelter.

The authors wish to acknowledge the assistance of J. Schwartz, J. Snow, J. Barnes, and I. Grossman in the preparation of the graphs for this report.
ABSTRACT

This report is one of a series of analytical studies of aircraft structures exposed to transient heating. The present study reports on the response characteristics of the front surface temperature and the front-back temperature difference across a finite plate as well as the "thermal force" and "thermal moment" which exists as a result of the heating. The results are given in graphical form for use in future studies.

PUBLICATION REVIEW

This report has been reviewed and is approved.

FOR THE COMMANDER:

DANIEL D. McKEE
Colonel, USAF
Chief, Aircraft Laboratory
Directorate of Laboratories
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONTENTS</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEAT TRANSFER SYSTEM</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE THERMAL FORCE AND MOMENT</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DISCUSSION OF RESULTS</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFERENCES</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Coordinate System for Uniformly Irradiated Finite Plate</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Transient Heating Function</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Schematic Temperature-Time Response for a Finite Plate</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Coordinate System for Heated Plate Equations</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Dimensionless Thermal Moment</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Dimensionless Thermal Force</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-1 to A-2</td>
<td>Front Surface Temperatures</td>
<td>13, 14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-3 to A-6</td>
<td>Front-Back Temperature Differences</td>
<td>15 - 18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-7 to A-8</td>
<td>Thermal Forces</td>
<td>19, 20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-9 to A-12</td>
<td>Thermal Moments</td>
<td>21 - 24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### NOMENCLATURE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Symbol</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Units</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$a$</td>
<td>Thermal diffusivity ($k/\rho C_p$)</td>
<td>ft$^2$/hr</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>Plate thickness</td>
<td>ft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$Bi$</td>
<td>Biot modulus</td>
<td>dimensionless</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$C_p$</td>
<td>Heat capacity</td>
<td>Btu/lb$^\circ$F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$E$</td>
<td>Modulus of elasticity</td>
<td>lb/in$^2$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$h_c$</td>
<td>Unit thermal conductance</td>
<td>Btu/hr ft$^2$$^\circ$F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$I$</td>
<td>Integral ($\int_0^\infty dt$)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$k$</td>
<td>Thermal conductivity</td>
<td>Btu/hr ft$^2$$^\circ$F/ft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$M_x$</td>
<td>Thermal moment</td>
<td>lb in/in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$N_x$</td>
<td>Thermal force</td>
<td>lb/in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$q$</td>
<td>Rate of heat flow per unit area into plate</td>
<td>Btu/hr ft$^2$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$Q$</td>
<td>Total heat absorbed by plate</td>
<td>Btu/ft$^2$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$T$</td>
<td>Temperature</td>
<td>$^\circ$F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$t$</td>
<td>Time</td>
<td>sec or hr</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$Z$</td>
<td>Cartesian coordinate ($Z'$ refers to distance from back surface)</td>
<td>ft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\alpha$</td>
<td>Coefficient of linear thermal expansion</td>
<td>$^\circ$F$^{-1}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\beta$</td>
<td>Heat transfer parameter ($b/\sqrt{\pi \eta}$)</td>
<td>dimensionless</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\Delta$</td>
<td>Difference</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\eta$</td>
<td>Reference time (time for the input function to maximize)</td>
<td>sec or hr</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\nu$</td>
<td>Poisson's ratio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\rho$</td>
<td>Weight density</td>
<td>lb/ft$^3$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Subscripts**
- $f$ = Thermal
- $m$ = maximum
- $ref$ = reference
- $a$ = ambient

**Superscript**
- + = dimensionless
INTRODUCTION

Previous studies\textsuperscript{1-5} concerning the effects of heating aircraft structures have indicated that excessive temperatures and stresses can occur. The combination of temperatures and stresses can greatly increase aerodynamic drag due to large deflections and cause permanent deformations in the skins of wings and control surfaces.

Studies\textsuperscript{3, 5} of the heated plate equations originally developed by A. Nadai\textsuperscript{4} have shown the necessity of evaluating the so-called "Thermal Force" and "Thermal Moment" resulting from restrained thermal expansions and temperature distributions, respectively. These quantities are the essential factors which combine the heat transfer and thermal stress investigations. The heat transfer investigation\textsuperscript{2} resulted in an analytical determination of the thermal response of a finite plate exposed to transient heating.

A numerical evaluation of the thermal force and moment is presented in this study using the results of the uniformly irradiated finite plate of reference 2. In addition, the front surface temperature rise and the front to back surface temperature difference are reported in terms of dimensionless parameters. It is visualized that these results will be utilized in future thermal stress evaluation of aircraft structures.

\textsuperscript{*}Numbers in superscripts indicate references in the bibliography at the end of the report.
HEAT TRANSFER SYSTEM

The idealized heat transfer system of reference 2 is shown in Figure 1. It consists of a uniformly irradiated plate with a constant thermal conductance \( h_c \) on the lower side and an insulated boundary on the other. The transient heating function \( q(t) \) is shown in Figure 2. In order to present the results in dimensionless form, the following definitions were employed:

\[
Z' = \frac{z'}{b},
\]

\[
t^* = \frac{t}{\eta},
\]

\[
T^* = \frac{T - T_\infty}{\Delta T_{ref}},
\]

\[
\Delta T_{ref} = \frac{Q}{\rho C_p b},
\]

\[
I = \int_0^{t^*} \frac{q}{q_m} dt^*,
\]

\[
Q = \int_0^\infty q dt,
\]

\[
\beta_s = \tau \beta^2 = \frac{h_c b}{k},
\]

\[
\tau = \frac{h_c \eta}{\rho C_p b},
\]

and

\[
\beta = \frac{b}{\sqrt{a \eta}},
\]
In terms of the dimensionless quantities defined above, the heat conduction equation is written as:

$$\frac{\partial^2 T^*}{\partial z'^2} = \beta^2 \frac{\partial T^*}{\partial t^*} \tag{10}$$

with the following initial and boundary conditions:

when:  \( t^* = 0 \), \( T^* = 0 \);

at:  \( z' = 0 \), \( \frac{\partial T^*}{\partial z'} = 0 \); \tag{11}

and at:  \( z' = 1 \), \( \frac{1}{\beta^2 \frac{\partial T^*}{\partial z'}} = \frac{q^*(t^*)}{l} - \tau T^* \).

The solution to equations (10) and (11) is:\(^2\)

$$T^*(z', t^*) = \int_0^{z^*} \frac{q^*(\lambda)}{I} \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} 2 \left[ \cos \frac{\lambda z'}{l} \cos \frac{\lambda}{y} \cos \frac{\lambda}{y} \right] \exp \left[ -\frac{y^2}{\lambda^2} (t^* - \lambda) \right] d\lambda \tag{12}$$

where

$$\tan \frac{\lambda}{y} = \frac{B\lambda}{y}$$

This solution was evaluated for the front surface temperature rise and the temperature difference across the plate utilizing the heating function shown schematically in Figure 2. The front surface temperature is expressed as:

$$T^*(1, t^*) = \int_0^{z^*} \frac{q^*(\lambda)}{I} \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} 2 \left[ \exp \left[ -\frac{y^2}{\lambda^2} (t^* - \lambda) \right] \right] d\lambda \tag{13}$$
The temperature difference across the plate (front surface temperature minus back surface temperature) is:

\[ T^*(t^*,t^*) - T^*(0,t^*) = \int_0^{t^*} \left[ \frac{1}{f^*} \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \left( \frac{1 - \frac{1}{\cos \frac{\lambda}{f^*}}}{1 + B_i(1 + B_i)} \right) \exp \left( -\frac{\rho^2}{\beta^2} (t^* - \lambda) \right) \right] d\lambda \quad (14) \]

Each temperature response evaluation was made for given values of the heat transfer parameters, \( B_i \) and \( \beta \), as shown schematically in Figure 3. These curves are presented in the appendix for a range of \( B_i \) and \( \beta \).

**FIGURE 3 SCHEMATIC TEMPERATURE-TIME RESPONSE FOR A FINITE PLATE**
THE THERMAL FORCE AND MOMENT

The Thermal Force and Moment were developed as logical connecting parameters between the isotropic heated plate equations and the heat conduction solutions. These have been defined as:

\[ N_T^* = \frac{1}{1 - \nu} \int E a (T - T_\infty) dZ \]  
\[ M_T^* = \frac{1}{1 - \nu} \int E a (T - T_\infty) Z dZ \]

When the mechanical properties of the material can be considered constant across the plate thickness, the neutral axis occurs at the plate center. This coordinate system is shown in Figure 4.

![Figure 4 Coordinate System for Heated Plate Equations](image)

In terms of this coordinate system with the origin at the plate center, equations (15) and (16) are normalized to:

\[ N_T^* = \frac{(1 - \nu) N_T}{E a \Delta T_{ref}} b \int_{-\frac{b}{2}}^{\frac{b}{2}} T^* dZ \]  
\[ M_T^* = \frac{(1 - \nu) M_T}{E a \Delta T_{ref}} b^2 \int_{-\frac{b}{2}}^{\frac{b}{2}} T^* Z dZ \]
The dimensionless thermal moment, $M_T^+$, and thermal force, $N_T^+$, are functions of the heat transfer parameters $Bi$ and $\beta$. Typical plots of these functions are shown schematically in Figures 5 and 6. These curves are presented in the appendix for the range of heat transfer parameters considered.

**Figure 5** Dimensionless thermal moment

**Figure 6** Dimensionless thermal force
DISCUSSION OF RESULTS

Comparison of thermal force and moment curves with temperature curves show that $M_+^*$ and $N_+^*$ are similar to $T^*$ and $\Delta T^*$, respectively. The maximum value of $N_+^* = 1.0$ corresponds to the case of no convective cooling. This is the limiting case where all the input energy remains in the structure. The peak values of $N_+^*$ occurs approximately in the range of $t^* = 1.0$ - $6.0$ and for the case of no cooling occurs at the end of the input. The dimensionless thermal moment was found to peak at short times ($t^* = 1.0$ - $2.0$) with a maximum value of approximately $0.27$ for the range of heat transfer parameters ($Bi$, $\beta$) considered. The sequence of events, for a plate exposed to transient heating is as follows: (1) The plate is subjected to a maximum moment with a relatively small thermal force; (2) then a large thermal force occurs with a small moment; and (3) the thermal force and moments then decay as elapsed time increases.

In order to illustrate the utility of these curves for the determination of the response characteristics an illustrative problem will be given. The following quantities must be assumed or determined from other analyses:

Properties

\[
\begin{align*}
\eta &= 3.00 \text{ sec} = 8.33 \times 10^{-4} \text{ hr} \\
\rho &= 173 \text{ lb/ft}^3 \\
\beta &= 44 \text{ Btu/ft}^2 \\
k &= 66.7 \text{ Btu/ft hr } \circ\text{F} \\
\rho c_p &= 0.23 \text{ Btu/lb } \circ\text{F} \\
\alpha &= \frac{k}{\rho c_p} = 1.67 \text{ ft}^2/\text{ hr} \\
h &= 3/16 \text{ in.} = 0.0156 \text{ ft.} \\
k\alpha &= 130 \text{ psi/ } \circ\text{F} \\
\nu &= 0.33 \\
\end{align*}
\]

From equation (9)

\[
\beta = \frac{b}{\sqrt{\alpha \eta}} = \frac{0.0156}{\sqrt{1.67 \times 8.33 \times 10^{-4}}} = 0.42 \approx 0.4;
\]

WADC-TR-55-192 Vol 1 7
From equation (7)

\[ Bi \ = \ \tau \beta^* = \frac{h_c b}{k} = \frac{42 \times 0.0156}{66.7} = 0.01; \]

and from equation (2)

\[ t = \eta t^* = 3.00 \ t^*. \]

Equation (4) gives the reference temperature

\[ \Delta T_{ref} = \frac{Q}{\rho C_p b} = \frac{44}{173 \times 0.23 \times 0.0156} = 70.8 \ ^\circ \text{F} \text{ (above ambient)} \]

The actual thermal force and moment can be calculated from equations (17) and (18) as:

\[ N_f = \frac{Ea}{1 - \nu} \Delta T_{ref} b^\ast \ N_f^\ast = \frac{Ea Q}{(1 - \nu) \rho \ C_p} \ N_f^\ast \]

\[ N_f = \frac{130 \times 70.8 \times 0.187}{(1 - 0.33)} \ N_f^\ast = 2460 \ N_f^\ast \]

and

\[ M_f = \frac{Ea}{1 - \nu} \Delta T_{ref} b^\ast \ M_f^\ast = \frac{Ea Q b}{(1 - \nu) \rho \ C_p} \ M_f^\ast \]

\[ N_f = \frac{130 \times 70.8 \ (3/16) \times b}{(1 - 0.33)} \ M_f^\ast = 460 \ M_f^\ast \]

Reference to Figures A-1, A-4, A-7, and A-10 in the appendix indicates that maximum values of the dimensionless quantities and their
associated dimensionless times are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quantity</th>
<th>Maximum Dimensionless Value</th>
<th>Dimensionless Time((t^*))</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Front Surface Temperature</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>54.5 °F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Figure A-1)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Front-Back Temperature Difference</td>
<td>0.035</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>2.5 °F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Figure A-4)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thermal Force</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>5.0 - 6.0</td>
<td>1844 lb/in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Figure A-7)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thermal Moment</td>
<td>0.0031</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>1.43 lb in/in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Figure A-10)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Inspection of the above table shows that for the particular example, the thermal force is the predominating factor, the moment being quite small.
CONCLUSIONS

In summary, the results indicate the following:

1. The uniformly irradiated plate is subjected to a combination of thermal moment and force at each instant due to the transient temperature distribution.

2. The maximum thermal moment precedes the maximum thermal force with both quantities decaying as time progresses.

3. The maximum possible values of $M_x^*$ and $M_y^*$ are 1.0 and 0.27 respectively for the range of variables under consideration.
REFERENCES


APPENDIX

The appendix contains a series of graphs for the front surface temperature, $T_f$, the front-back temperature difference, $\Delta T$, thermal force, $N$, and thermal moment, $M$, as a function of time $t$. The range of parameters for which the numerical results are applicable are as follows:

$$Bi = 0.001 - 1.0$$
$$\beta = 0.01 - 20$$

The Index for the Specific Graphs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Front Surface Temperature</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A-1</td>
<td>$Bi = 0.001$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-1</td>
<td>$Bi = 0.01$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-2</td>
<td>$Bi = 0.1$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-2</td>
<td>$Bi = 1.0$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Front-Back Temperature Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A-3</td>
<td>$Bi = 0.001$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-4</td>
<td>$Bi = 0.01$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-5</td>
<td>$Bi = 0.1$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-6</td>
<td>$Bi = 1.0$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Thermal Force</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A-7</td>
<td>$Bi = 0.001$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-7</td>
<td>$Bi = 0.01$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-8</td>
<td>$Bi = 0.1$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-8</td>
<td>$Bi = 1.0$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Thermal Moment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A-9</td>
<td>$Bi = 0.001$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-10</td>
<td>$Bi = 0.01$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-11</td>
<td>$Bi = 0.1$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-12</td>
<td>$Bi = 1.0$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## DISTRIBUTION LIST

### SECTION I

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. Copies</th>
<th>Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Two        | Commander  
 Wright Air Development Center  
 Wright-Patterson AFB, Ohio  
 Attn: WCLS |
| Three      | Commander  
 Wright Air Development Center  
 Wright-Patterson AFB, Ohio  
 Attn: WCOSI-4 |
| Two        | Commander  
 Wright Air Development Center  
 Wright-Patterson AFB, Ohio  
 Attn: Maj. Andrew Boresko, WCOE S |
| Five       | Director  
 Armed Services Technical Information Agency  
 Document Service Center  
 Dayton 2, Ohio |

### SECTION II

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. Copies</th>
<th>Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| One        | Chief of Naval Operations (OP-36)  
 Navy Department  
 Washington 25, D.C. |
| One        | Commander  
 Operational Development Force  
 U.S. Naval Base  
 Norfolk 11, Va. |
| One        | Commanding Officer  
 Naval Air Test Center  
 Potomac River, Md. |
| One        | Commanding Officer  
 Air Development Squadron Five VX 5  
 U.S. Naval Air Station  
 Moffett Field, California |
| One        | Commanding Officer  
 Air Development Squadron Three VX 3  
 U.S. Naval Air Station  
 Moffett Field, California |
| One        | Commanding Officer  
 Naval Air Special Weapons Facility  
 Kirtland Air Force Base, New Mexico |
| One        | Office of Operational Research  
 Johns Hopkins University  
 Fort Leslie J. McNair  
 Attn: Brig. Gen. L. O. Flory  
 Washington 25, D.C. |
| One        | Commanding General  
 Aberdeen Proving Ground  
 Attn: Mr. A. B. Weiss  
 Maryland |
| One        | Chief of Research and Development  
 Department of the Army  
 Washington 25, D.C. |
| One        | Deputy Chief of Staff Operations, Hq. USAF  
 Attn: Assistant for Atomic Energy  
 Washington 25, D.C. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. Copies</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>No. Copies</th>
<th>Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>Deputy Chief of Staff Operations&lt;br&gt;Hq. USAF&lt;br&gt;Attn: Dr. J.C. Mouzon, Rm SD-870&lt;br&gt;Washington 25, D.C.</td>
<td>Two</td>
<td>Deputy Chief of Staff Development&lt;br&gt;Hq. USAF&lt;br&gt;Attn: Development Planning&lt;br&gt;Washington 25, D.C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>Director of Operations&lt;br&gt;Hq. USAF&lt;br&gt;Washington 25, D.C.</td>
<td>One</td>
<td>Deputy Chief of Staff Development&lt;br&gt;Hq. USAF&lt;br&gt;Attn: Director of Research &amp; Development&lt;br&gt;Strategic Air Group&lt;br&gt;Washington 25, D.C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>Director of Operations&lt;br&gt;Hq. USAF&lt;br&gt;Attn: Operations Analysis&lt;br&gt;Washington 25, D.C.</td>
<td>One</td>
<td>Deputy Chief of Staff Development&lt;br&gt;Hq. USAF&lt;br&gt;Attn: Director of Research &amp; Development&lt;br&gt;Aeronautics Division&lt;br&gt;Washington 25, D.C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>Commander&lt;br&gt;Strategic Air Command&lt;br&gt;Attn: Chief Operations Analysis&lt;br&gt;Offutt Air Force Base, Nebraska</td>
<td>One</td>
<td>Director of Intelligence&lt;br&gt;Hq. USAF&lt;br&gt;Washington 25, D.C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>Commander&lt;br&gt;Tactical Air Command&lt;br&gt;Attn: Chief, Operations Analysis Section&lt;br&gt;Langley Air Force Base, Virginia</td>
<td>One</td>
<td>Director of Intelligence&lt;br&gt;Hq. USAF&lt;br&gt;Attn: Physical Vulnerability Division&lt;br&gt;Washington 25, D.C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>Commander&lt;br&gt;Air Defense Command&lt;br&gt;Attn: A D M A R - 2&lt;br&gt;Ent Air Force Base, Colorado</td>
<td>Three</td>
<td>Commander&lt;br&gt;Air Force Special Weapons Center&lt;br&gt;Attn: A F Atomic Energy Library&lt;br&gt;Kirtland Air Force Base, New Mexico</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three</td>
<td>Commander&lt;br&gt;Air Research and Development Command&lt;br&gt;Attn: R D T D A&lt;br&gt;P. O. Box 1395&lt;br&gt;Baltimore 3, Md.</td>
<td>One</td>
<td>Executive Secretary&lt;br&gt;Weapons Systems Evaluation Group&lt;br&gt;Office of the Secretary of Defense&lt;br&gt;The Pentagon&lt;br&gt;Washington 25, D.C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>Commander&lt;br&gt;Air Research and Development Command&lt;br&gt;Attn: R D G T&lt;br&gt;Col. D'Ettore&lt;br&gt;P. O. Box 1395&lt;br&gt;Baltimore 3, Md.</td>
<td>One</td>
<td>Director of Military Application&lt;br&gt;U. S. Atomic Energy Commission&lt;br&gt;1901 Constitution Avenue, N.W.&lt;br&gt;Washington 25, D.C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>Commander&lt;br&gt;Air University Library&lt;br&gt;Maxwell Air Force Base, Ala.</td>
<td>One</td>
<td>Director of Research&lt;br&gt;U.S. Atomic Energy Commission&lt;br&gt;Washington 25, D.C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>Deputy Chief of Staff Development&lt;br&gt;Hq. USAF&lt;br&gt;Attn: Lt. General D. Putt&lt;br&gt;Washington 25, D. C.</td>
<td>One</td>
<td>Chief&lt;br&gt;Armed Forces Special Weapons Project&lt;br&gt;Attn: S W P T E - 2&lt;br&gt;Washington 25, D. C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>Deputy Chief of Staff Development&lt;br&gt;Hq. USAF&lt;br&gt;Attn: Major Beavers&lt;br&gt;Washington 25, D. C.</td>
<td>Four</td>
<td>Headquarters Field Command&lt;br&gt;Armed Forces Special Weapons Project&lt;br&gt;Technical Training Group Library&lt;br&gt;Attn: Miss E. Pauline Dunlavy, Librarian&lt;br&gt;Sandia Base, New Mexico</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>Commander&lt;br&gt;Air Force Cambridge Research Center&lt;br&gt;Attn: Robert Chapman&lt;br&gt;Geophysics Research Directorate&lt;br&gt;230 Albany Street&lt;br&gt;Cambridge 39, Mass.</td>
<td>One</td>
<td>Army Field Forces&lt;br&gt;Department of the Army&lt;br&gt;Directorate of Special Weapons Development&lt;br&gt;Fort Bliss, Texas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>Chief&lt;br&gt;Bureau of Ordnance&lt;br&gt;Department of the Navy&lt;br&gt;Attn: K E - 9&lt;br&gt;Washington 25, D.C.</td>
<td>One</td>
<td>Assistant for Operation Analysis D C S / O&lt;br&gt;Hq. USAF&lt;br&gt;Attn: John Intlekofer&lt;br&gt;A F O O A&lt;br&gt;Washington 25, D.C.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### SECTION III

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. Copies</th>
<th>Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Two        | Dr. Alvin C. Graves  
J-1 Division  
Los Alamos Scientific Laboratory  
P.O. Box 1663  
Los Alamos, New Mexico |
| One        | Director  
NACA  
Attn: Richard Rhode  
1512 H Street, N.W.  
Washington 25, D.C. |

### SECTION IV

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. Copies</th>
<th>Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Forty      | University of California  
Department of Engineering  
Engineering Research  
Attn: Prof. Walter C. Hurty  
Los Angeles 24, California |
| One        | Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Department of Aeronautical Engineering  
Aerelastic and Structures Research Laboratory  
Attn: Mr. J.C. Loria  
Cambridge 39, Mass. |
| One        | Allied Research Associates, Inc.  
Attn: Mr. Lawrence Levy, President  
43 Leon Street  
Boston 15, Mass. |
| One        | Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Attn: Prof. H.C. Hottel  
Cambridge 39, Mass. |
| Two        | Rand Corporation (Thru: W O S I)  
Attn: Dr. E. H. Plesset  
1700 Main Street  
Santa Monica, California |
| One        | Vitro Corporation of America  
Attn: Dr. C. T. Molloy  
P. O. Box 146  
Verona, New Jersey |
| One        | Bell Aircraft Corporation  
Attn: Chief Engineer  
Niagara Falls, New York |
| Two        | Boeing Airplane Company  
Attn: E. Wells  
Chief Engineer  
200 W. Michigan Avenue  
Seattle 14, Washington |
| One        | Chance Vought Aircraft, Inc.  
Attn: Chief Engineer  
Dallas, Texas |
| One        | Consolidated Vultee Aircraft Corp.  
Attn: R. H. Widner, Chief Engineer  
Fort Worth Division  
Fort Worth, Texas |

One         | Consolidated Vultee Aircraft Corporation  
Attn: Chief Engineer  
San Diego Division  
San Diego 12, California |

One         | Douglas Aircraft Company, Inc.  
Attn: Charles Strong  
300 Ocean Park Blvd.  
Santa Monica, California |

One         | Douglas Aircraft Company, Inc.  
Attn: J. C. Beckwiler  
Chief Engineer  
3855 Lakewood Blvd.  
Long Beach, California |

One         | Grumman Aircraft Engineering Company  
Attn: Chief Engineer  
Bethpage  
Long Island, New York |

One         | Lockheed Aircraft Corporation  
Factory "A"  
Attn: Jerome C. McBrearty  
P. O. Box 71  
Burbank, California |

One         | Glenn L. Martin Company  
Attn: Chief Engineer  
Baltimore 3, Md. |

One         | McDonnell Aircraft Corporation  
Attn: Chief Engineer  
P. O. Box 516  
Municipal Airport  
St. Louis, Missouri |

One         | North American Aviation, Inc.  
Attn: R. L. Schleicher  
Municipal Airport  
Los Angeles, California |

One         | Northrop Aircraft, Inc.  
Attn: Miss W. J. Sommer  
Librarian for Mr. Mangurin  
Chief Engineer  
Northrop Field  
Hawthorne, California |

One         | Republic Aviation Corporation  
Attn: Chief Engineer, Farmingdale  
Long Island, New York |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. Copies</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>No. Copies</th>
<th>Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>Cook Research Laboratories Division of Cook Electric Company 8100 Monticello Avenue Skokie, Ill.</td>
<td>One</td>
<td>Boeing Airplane Co. Wichita Division Attn: Messrs. B. Hodges and K. K. Holtby Wichita, Kansas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>Johns Hopkins University Operations Research Office 6410 Connecticut Avenue Chevy Chase, Md.</td>
<td>One</td>
<td>California Institute of Technology Guggenheim Aeronautical Laboratory Attn: Prof. E. E. Sechler Pasadena, California</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>University of Dayton Division of Research Attn: Dr. K.C. Schraut Dayton 3, Ohio</td>
<td>One</td>
<td>Columbia University Department of Civil Engineering Attn: Dr. Bruno A. Boley New York 27, New York</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>