

THIS REPORT HAS BEEN DELIMITED  
AND CLEARED FOR PUBLIC RELEASE  
UNDER DOD DIRECTIVE 5200.20 AND  
NO RESTRICTIONS ARE IMPOSED UPON  
ITS USE AND DISCLOSURE.

DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT A

APPROVED FOR PUBLIC RELEASE;  
DISTRIBUTION UNLIMITED.

# Armed Services Technical Information Agency

Because of our limited supply, you are requested to return this copy WHEN IT HAS SERVED YOUR PURPOSE so that it may be made available to other requesters. Your cooperation will be appreciated.

**AD**

**41671**

NOTICE: WHEN GOVERNMENT OR OTHER DRAWINGS, SPECIFICATIONS OR OTHER DATA ARE USED FOR ANY PURPOSE OTHER THAN IN CONNECTION WITH A DEFINITELY RELATED GOVERNMENT PROCUREMENT OPERATION, THE U. S. GOVERNMENT THEREBY INCURS NO RESPONSIBILITY, NOR ANY OBLIGATION WHATSOEVER; AND THE FACT THAT THE GOVERNMENT MAY HAVE FORMULATED, FURNISHED, OR IN ANY WAY SUPPLIED THE SAID DRAWINGS, SPECIFICATIONS, OR OTHER DATA IS NOT TO BE REGARDED AS IMPLICATION OR OTHERWISE AS IN ANY MANNER LICENSING THE HOLDER OR ANY OTHER PERSON OR CORPORATION, OR CONVEYING ANY RIGHTS OR PERMISSION TO MANUFACTURE, USE OR SELL ANY PATENTED INVENTION THAT MAY IN ANY WAY BE RELATED THERETO.

Reproduced by  
**DOCUMENT SERVICE CENTER**  
KNOTT BUILDING, DAYTON, 2, OHIO

**UNCLASSIFIED**

AD No. 41671

STIA FILE COPY

**BRL**

TECHNICAL NOTE No. 900

**On Jones' Criterion  
For  
Thin Wings Of Minimum Drag**

**R. SEDNEY**

DEPARTMENT OF THE ARMY PROJECT No. 503-03-001  
ORDNANCE RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT PROJECT No. TB3-0108

**BALLISTIC RESEARCH LABORATORIES**



**ABERDEEN PROVING GROUND, MARYLAND**

b. "Initial distribution has been made of this report in accordance with the distribution list contained herein. Additional distribution without recourse to the Ordnance Office may be made to United States military organizations, and to such of their contractors as they certify to be cleared to receive this report and to need it in the furtherance of a military contract."

BALLISTIC RESEARCH LABORATORIES

TECHNICAL NOTE NO. 900

MAY 1954

ON JONES' CRITERION FOR THIN WINGS OF MINIMUM DRAG

R. Sedney

Department of the Army Project No. 503-03-001  
Ordnance Research and Development Project No. TB3-C108

ABERDEEN PROVING GROUND, MARYLAND

## ON JONES' CRITERION FOR THIN WINGS OF MINIMUM DRAG

In reference 1 Jones has derived necessary conditions for minimum drag shapes of thin wings subject to conditions of given lift, given maximum drag or given volume. In deriving these conditions, the concept of the "combined flow field" was used. This consists of superimposing the flow fields of the forward and reversed motions. In this note, it is shown how these conditions may be derived using the standard methods of calculus of variations and the general reverse flow theorem.<sup>2</sup> The method will be illustrated for the case of given lift. In addition it is shown that the necessary condition actually yields a minimum for the drag. Linearized theory is assumed throughout.

Let  $p$  and  $\alpha$  denote the local lift and angle of attack distributions in forward flow. These are defined on the projection of the wing surface on a mean plane. This area is denoted by  $S$  and all integrations are over this area. As in reference 3, two types of reverse flow are considered. In the first, the lift in reverse flow  $\bar{p} = p$ , and  $\bar{\alpha}$  is determined from linearized theory. In the second, the angle of attack in reverse flow  $\tilde{\alpha} = -\alpha$ , and  $\tilde{p}$  is determined from linearized theory. The reverse flow theorem states that

$$\int p \bar{\alpha} dS = \int \bar{p} \alpha dS \quad (1)$$

and similarly for the second type. Since  $p$  and  $\alpha$  are related linearly,  $p + \epsilon q$  must correspond to  $\alpha + \epsilon \beta$  where  $\beta$  is the angle of attack distribution corresponding to the lift  $q$ . Defining the variation of  $p$ ,

$$\delta p = \epsilon q$$

then the variation of  $\alpha$  is

$$\delta \alpha = \epsilon \beta$$

The reverse flow theorem can, of course, be applied to  $\delta p$  and  $\delta \alpha$ .

Consider now the variational problem of minimizing the drag,  $D$ , subject to condition of a given lift  $L$ . Since

$$D = \int p \alpha dS \quad (2)$$

$$L = \int p dS \quad (3)$$

the quantity  $D + \lambda L$ , where  $\lambda$  is an undetermined constant multiplier, should be minimized according to the rules of the calculus of variations. Then

$$\delta (D + \lambda L) = \int (p \delta \alpha + \alpha \delta p + \lambda \delta p) dS \quad (4)$$

Since  $\bar{p} = p$ , the first term of the integrand can be written

$$\begin{aligned} \int p \delta \alpha dS &= \int \bar{p} \delta \alpha dS \\ &= \int \bar{\alpha} \delta p dS \end{aligned}$$

Thus (4) can be written

$$\delta (D + \lambda L) = \int (\bar{\alpha} + \alpha + \lambda) \delta p dS$$

Since the variation of  $D + \lambda L$  must be zero for arbitrary  $\delta p$ , the necessary condition for minimum drag with given lift is

$$\alpha + \bar{\alpha} = -\lambda = \text{Constant}$$

which is Jones' criterion. Multiplying the last equation by  $p$  and integrating determines  $\lambda$ , so that

$$\alpha + \bar{\alpha} = \frac{2D}{L} \quad (5)$$

The criterion can be expressed in a different form involving the second type of reverse flow. Let the flat plate of unit angle of attack be denoted by  $\alpha_f$ , i.e.  $\alpha_f = 1$ . The lift can be written

$$\begin{aligned} L &= \int p dS = \int \alpha_f p dS \\ &= - \int \tilde{\alpha}_f p dS \\ &= - \int \tilde{p}_f \alpha dS \end{aligned}$$

Taking the first variation as in (4) yields

$$\delta (D + \lambda L) = \int (p - \tilde{p} - \lambda \tilde{p}_f) \delta \alpha dS$$

and since  $\delta \alpha$  is arbitrary

$$p - \tilde{p} = \lambda \tilde{p}_f$$

where now

$$\lambda = -\frac{2D}{L}$$

The question of what type of functions  $p$  and  $c$  are admissible in the variational process needs to be discussed. It is known that the reverse flow theorem, eq. (1), does not hold if the lift has a leading edge singularity in forward flow, since the wing in reverse flow does not satisfy the Kutta condition at the trailing edge. Therefore admissible functions

$p$  must be such that they do not have leading edge singularities. However there are indications that Jones' criterion is valid even for functions  $p$  which have these singularities<sup>3</sup>.

Using the concept of orthogonal loadings<sup>3,4</sup> it can be shown that Jones' criterion is also sufficient, that is, it actually yields a minimum. Let  $a_1$  and  $a_2$  be two angle of attack distributions and  $p_1$  and  $p_2$  the corresponding lifts<sup>2</sup>. Define

$$(a_1, a_2) = \frac{1}{2} \int (a_1 p_2 + a_2 p_1) dS \quad (6)$$

i.e.,  $(a_1, a_2)$  is one-half the mutual interference drag of the two distributions. Then  $a_1$  is orthogonal to  $a_2$  if  $(a_1, a_2) = 0$ . Since

$$\begin{aligned} (a_1, a_1) &= \int p_1 a_1 dS \\ &= D_1 \geq 0 \end{aligned}$$

it is easy to show that Schwarz's inequality holds

$$(a_1, a_2)^2 \leq (a_1, a_1) (a_2, a_2) \quad (7)$$

Now let  $a_0$  be any  $a$  such that

$$L_0 = \int p_0 dS = 0$$

Then multiplying (5) by  $p_0$ , integrating, and applying (1) yields

$$(a, a_0) = 0$$

so that any  $a$  with zero total lift is orthogonal to the optimal  $a$ , i.e., the  $a$  which satisfies (5). The converse is also true. If  $a'$  is any  $a$  such that

$$\int p' dS = \int p dS = L$$

then  $a - a' = a_0$  since

$$\int (p - p') dS = 0$$

Thus

$$(a, a - a') = 0$$

or

$$(a, a') = (a, a)$$

Using (7)

$$(a, a)^2 = (a, a')^2 \leq (a, a) (a', a')$$

$$(a, a) \leq (a', a')$$

Thus it is shown that of all admissible functions with total lift  $L$ , the angle of attack distribution satisfying (5) yields the least drag.

*R. Sedney*  
R. SEDNEY

#### REFERENCES

1. Jones, R. T., "The Minimum Drag of Thin Wings in Frictionless Flow", *Journal of the Aeronautical Sciences*, Vol. 18, No. 2, page 75, February 1951.
2. Ursell, F. and Ward, G. N., "On Some General Theorems in the Linearised Theory of Compressible Flow", *Q.J.M.A.M.*, Vol. III, Part 3, page 326, September 1950.
3. Rodrigues, A. M., Lagerstrom, P. A., and Graham, E. W., "Theorems Concerning the Drag Reduction of Wings of Fixed Planforms", *Journal of the Aeronautical Sciences*, Vol. 21, No. 1, page 1, January 1954.
4. Graham, E. W., "A Drag Reduction Method for Wings of Fixed Planform", *Journal of the Aeronautical Sciences*, Vol. 19, No. 12, page 823, December 1952.

DISTRIBUTION LIST

<u>No. of Copies</u>	<u>Organization</u>	<u>No. of Copies</u>	<u>Organization</u>
3	Chief of Ordnance Department of the Army Washington 25, D. C. Attn: ORDTB - Bal Sec (1 cy) ORDTX-AR (1 cy) ORDTU (1 cy)	5	Director Armed Services Technical Information Agency Document Service Center Knott Building Dayton 2, Ohio Attn: DSC - SA
10	British - ORDGU-SE, Foreign Relations Sec. for dist.	4	ASTIA Reference Center Technical Information Div. Library of Congress Washington 25, D. C.
4	Canadian Joint Staff - ORDGU-SE, Foreign Relations Section for distribution	5	Director National Advisory Committee for Aeronautics 1512 H Street, NW Washington 25, D. C. Attn: Division of Research Information
4	Chief, Bureau of Ordnance Department of the Navy Washington 25, D. C. Attn: Re3	2	Director Ames Laboratory National Advisory Committee for Aeronautics Moffett Field, California Attn: R. T. Jones
2	Commander Naval Proving Ground Dahlgren, Virginia	3	Commanding General Redstone Arsenal Huntsville, Alabama Attn: Technical Library
2	Commander Naval Ordnance Laboratory White Oak Silver Spring, Maryland Attn: Library - Room 1-327	1	Commanding General White Sands Proving Ground Las Cruces, New Mexico Attn: ORDES-TS-TIB
1	Commander Naval Ordnance Test Station Inyokern P. O. China Lake, California Attn: Technical Library	1	Arthur D. Little, Inc. Cambridge 42, Massachusetts Attn: Dr. C. S. Keevil
1	Superintendent Naval Postgraduate School Monterey, California	2	Applied Physics Laboratory 8621 Georgia Avenue Silver Spring, Maryland Attn: Mr. G. L. Seielstad
1	Director Air University Library Maxwell Air Force Base, Alabama	4	Commander Air Research and Dev. Command P. O. Box 1395 Baltimore 3, Maryland Attn: Deputy for Development

DISTRIBUTION LIST

<u>No. of Copies</u>	<u>Organization</u>	<u>No. of Copies</u>	<u>Organization</u>
1	Boeing Airplane Company Seattle 14, Washington Attn: F. E. Ehlers	1	General Electric Company Project <del>HEMITE</del> Schenectady, New York Attn: Mr. J. C. Hoffman
1	Consolidated Vultee Aircraft Corporation Ordnance Aerophysics Laboratory Daingerfield, Texas Attn: Mr. J. E. Arnold	1	Hughes Aircraft Company Florence Avenue at Teal Street Culver City, California Attn: Dr. A. E. Puckett
1	Consolidated Vultee Aircraft Corporation Pomona Division Pomona, California Attn: Guided Missiles Library	1	M. W. Kellogg Company Foot of Danforth Avenue Jersey City 3, New Jersey Attn: Mr. R. A. Miller
2	Cornell Aeronautical Laboratory, Inc. 4455 Genesee Street Buffalo, New York Attn: Miss Elma T. Evans, Librarian	1	North American Aviation, Inc. 12214 Lakewood Boulevard Downey, California Attn: Aerophysics Laboratory
1	California Institute of Technology Guggenheim Aeronautical Laboratory 1500 Normandy Drive Pasadena 4, California Attn: P. A. Lagerstrom	1	North Carolina State College P. O. Box 5548 Raleigh, North Carolina Attn: Dr. John W. Cell
1	Carnegie Institute of Technology Department of Mathematics Pittsburgh 13, Pennsylvania Attn: G. H. Handelman	1	Princeton University James Forrestal Research Center Princeton, New Jersey
1	Douglas Aircraft Company, Inc. 3000 Ocean Park Boulevard Santa Monica, California Attn: Mr. H. Luckin	2	University of Maryland Institute for Fluid Dynamics and Applied Mathematics College Park, Maryland Attn: S. I. Pai J. B. Diaz
1	Firestone Tire and Rubber Company Defense Research Division Akron 17, Ohio Attn: Mr. P. J. Ginge	1	University of Southern Calif. Engineering Center Los Angeles 7, California Attn: Mr. H. R. Saffell, Director
1	Firestone Tire and Rubber Company Defense Research Division Akron 17, Ohio Attn: Mr. P. J. Ginge	1	United Aircraft Corporation Research Department East Hartford 8, Connecticut Attn: Mr. R. C. Sale

DISTRIBUTION LIST

<u>No. of Copies</u>	<u>Organization</u>
1	University of Illinois Aeronautical Institute Urbana, Illinois Attn: Professor G. H. Fletcher
1	Wright Aeronautical Division Curtiss Wright Corporation Wood Ridge, New Jersey Attn: Sales Department (Government)
1	Professor George F. Carrier Division of Applied Science Harvard University Cambridge 38, Massachusetts
1	Professor Francis H. Clauser Chairman, Department of Aeronautics Johns Hopkins University Baltimore 18, Maryland
1	Dr. L. H. Thomas Watson Scientific Computing Laboratory 612 West 116th Street New York 27, New York

# Armed Services Technical Information Agency

Because of our limited supply, you are requested to return this copy WHEN IT HAS SERVED YOUR PURPOSE so that it may be made available to other requesters. Your cooperation will be appreciated.

# AD

# 41671

NOTICE: WHEN GOVERNMENT OR OTHER DRAWINGS, SPECIFICATIONS OR OTHER DATA ARE USED FOR ANY PURPOSE OTHER THAN IN CONNECTION WITH A DEFINITELY RELATED GOVERNMENT PROCUREMENT OPERATION, THE U. S. GOVERNMENT THEREBY INCURS NO RESPONSIBILITY, NOR ANY OBLIGATION WHATSOEVER; AND THE FACT THAT THE GOVERNMENT MAY HAVE FORMULATED, FURNISHED, OR IN ANY WAY SUPPLIED THE SAID DRAWINGS, SPECIFICATIONS, OR OTHER DATA IS NOT TO BE REGARDED BY IMPLICATION OR OTHERWISE AS IN ANY MANNER LICENSING THE HOLDER OR ANY OTHER PERSON OR CORPORATION, OR CONVEYING ANY RIGHTS OR PERMISSION TO MANUFACTURE, USE OR SELL ANY PATENTED INVENTION THAT MAY IN ANY WAY BE RELATED THERETO.

Reproduced by  
**DOCUMENT SERVICE CENTER**  
KNOTT BUILDING, DAYTON, 2, OHIO

# UNCLASSIFIED